Office of Inspector General

OF

OFFICIENT

FLORIDA

LANY ESTINO RCEMENT

Alcohol Testing Program Audit

Final Report

Project Number IA-1516-01

December 2016

Service 🛧 Integrity 🛧 Respect 🛧 Quality



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This audit of the Florida Department of Law Enforcement's (FDLE) Alcohol Testing Program (ATP) was initiated in accordance with the Office of Inspector General's 2015–2016 Annual Audit Plan.

The Alcohol Testing Program is responsible for regulating the operation, inspection and registration of breath test instruments as well as the individuals who operate and inspect those instruments. The program is further responsible for the regulation of blood analysts who conduct blood alcohol testing. ATP is authorized by Chapters 316, 322 and 327, Florida Statutes, as well as Chapter 11D-8, Florida Administrative Code.

The mission of ATP is, "To enhance public safety by ensuring the accuracy and scientific reliability of evidentiary blood and breath alcohol tests, facilitating enforcement of Implied Consent Laws and Administrative Rules, and promoting the qualifications and professionalism of persons responsible for blood and breath alcohol analyses in the State of Florida."¹

The objectives of this audit were to determine if ATP complied with policies and procedures pertaining to the following areas:

- breath test permit process,
- blood analyst permit process, and
- breath test permit continuing education requirements.

Our review determined that ATP was generally in compliance with statutory and procedural requirements regarding the breath test permitting process as well as continuing education requirements. For the blood analyst permit application process, we have one finding and recommendation for management's consideration.

Finding 1: The Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklists were not always completed as required by procedure.

Thirty-five blood alcohol analyst permit applications fell within the scope of this audit. Our review of those applications revealed that nine checklists were completed in accordance with procedures, and the remaining twenty-six checklists were not complete.

Recommendation: We recommend management ensure all information required on the checklist is complete and the form is signed in accordance with procedures.

¹ <u>www.fdle.state.fl.us/cms/Alcohol-Testing-Program/ATP-Home.aspx</u>



OBJECTIVES, SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

The objectives were to determine if ATP was in compliance with policies and procedures pertaining to breath test/blood analyst permit applications and continuing education requirements. The scope of this audit focused on the breath test/blood analyst permit application process for the period of July 2014 through June 2016.

In performing this review we:

- Interviewed appropriate Department staff in the ATP division.
- Obtained an overall understanding of the permit application process.
- Reviewed guidelines and policies relating to ATP.
- Reviewed selected permit applications and training records.

The following criteria were used:

- Florida Statutes: Chapters 316, 322, and 327
- Florida Administrative Code: 11D-8
- FDLE: Alcohol Testing Program Procedures Manual



FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Finding 1: The Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklists were not always completed as required by procedure.

Per Florida Statutes, ATP is responsible for establishing uniform criteria for the issuance of permits to breath test operators, agency inspectors, instructors, blood analysts, and instruments.

As part of the process to obtain a blood alcohol analyst permit, applicants complete the FDLE/ATP Form 4 and submit it to FDLE. Upon reviewing the application, proposed analytical procedures, and proficiency test results, the [ATP] Program Manager will either approve the application and issue a permit or deny the application². In order to ensure compliance with all the requirements set forth by Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 11D-8.013, ATP developed an internal checklist that encompasses all the necessary information (see attached Appendix A – Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklist).

The checklist is divided into the following sections, and within each are specific items for the reviewer to evaluate and check off:

- Applicant name and Date
- Blood Alcohol Test Method
- Application
- Qualifications for Blood Analyst Permit
- Analytical Procedures
- Issuance of Permit

As per procedures, ATP publishes all permit applications and supporting documents on their website. There were thirty-five applications that fell within the scope of this audit (July 2014 – June 2016) and all were reviewed for completeness.

Our review found that nine checklists were completed in accordance with the procedures manual; however, the remaining twenty-six were not complete. The ATP Procedures Manual requires the following items to be indicated on the Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklist document:

"...check "Issue Permit," and record the date the permit was issued, the permit number, the name of the approved method, and the name of the approved procedures. Sign and date the Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklist."³

² Policy 3.3 Blood Analyst Permit Applications

³ Policy 3.3 Blood Analyst Permit Applications, #5 under Approval of Application



The incomplete checklists were missing one or more of the required items. The table below summarizes how many of the twenty-six checklists were missing each of the required items.

Reviewer's Signature and Date	"Issue Permit" or "Deny Permit" Checked	Date Permit Issued	Permit Number	Approved Method and Procedures
10	8	24	13	0

Regardless of the information missing from the checklists, all thirty-five applicants did receive a permit. For the ten checklists that were missing a reviewer's signature, we verified the applicant received the approval notification from FDLE and that the permit was signed by the authorized ATP Program Manager. The incomplete checklists appear to be an oversight.

The checklists are intended to ensure all aspects of a task are consistently performed and fully completed. When items are not checked off on a list, it could increase the risk of oversight where an application could be inadvertently approved without having all required information. Since ATP documents are published online and available for public viewing, due diligence should be taken to ensure all information is complete.

Following a meeting with ATP regarding the incomplete checklists, they were provided with the list of checklists that were missing a reviewer's signature. Those checklists were subsequently signed and uploaded to the website by ATP.

Recommendation: We recommend management ensure all information required on the checklist is complete and the form is signed in accordance with procedures.

DISTRIBUTION, STATEMENT OF ACCORDANCE, AND PROJECT TEAM

Distribution

Rick Swearingen, Commissioner Dean Register, Director, Criminal Justice Professionalism Vickie Koenig, Chief of Policy and Special Programs, Criminal Justice Professionalism Brett Kirkland, Senior Management Analyst Supervisor, Criminal Justice Professionalism

Statement of Accordance

This audit was conducted pursuant to Section 20.055, Florida Statutes, and in accordance with Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards as published by the United States Government Accountability Office. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

Copies of this audit report will be made available for public inspection.

Project Team

Engagement conducted by: Linh Trang, Senior Management Analyst II

Under the supervision of: Susan Cureton, Director of Auditing

Approved by:

Lourdes Howell-Thomas, Inspector General

12/21/11

Date



Appendix A

Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklist

Applicant:	C	ate of Application:
<u>11D-8.011,</u>	F.A.C. – BLOOD ALCOHOL TEST METHOD Gas Chromategraphy	
Name and Name/Addr Agency for), F.A.C. – APPLICATION ddress of Applicant: License ess Employer/Lab Facility where analyses performed: which blood analyses are to be performed: halytical Procedures:	e/College Transcript:
Approval of Satisfactory At least one Meet one of 1. Clini Tecl 2. Lice	 F.A.C. – QUALIFICATIONS FOR BLOOD ANALYS Analytical Procedure(s): Determination/Five Proficiency Samples using Proposi agency/blood alcohol analyses performed. following (check one): cal Laboratory License in Clinical Chemistry (as, check nologist:	ed Analytical Procedure:
(a) Appro (a) Descri (b) Stand Com (c) Con (c) Calil (d) Calil (d) Calil New Str Co Exis Co (e) Anal (a) Anal (f) Disc), F.A.C ANALYTICAL PROCEDURES red method used: blion of method: quipment Used radards Used radards Used controls Used ratory Prepared/Certified (Manufacturer/Lot #/Expira ratory Prepared/Vertified by GC (Date/Person Prep/Mete entration Range over which Procedure Calibrated: ration Curve Linear over the above stated Range: ration Curve Standards and Controls: Calibration Curve (At least three standards and two condard ≤ 0.05 Standard ng Calibration Curve (At least three standards and two condard ≤ 0.05 or less Control 0.20 or greater resis of alcohol-free control (blank): resis of alcohol-free control (blank): resis of whole blood or serum control (May be used for cominate between methanol, ethanol, acctone, isopropality or internal standard technique:	ation Documented)
 Issue Pe Appr Appr), F.A.C. – ISSUANCE OF PERMIT mit: Date Permit Issued: oved Method: oved Procedure:	
⊡ Deny Pe Rea: □ I	mit: on for Denial: n De tent to Deny Sent: n De	nial Letter Sent:
Signature o	Reviewer, Alcohol Testing Program Member	Date of Review March 2016

Management Response



Florida Department of Law Enforcement

Richard L. Swearingen Commissioner

MEMORANDUM

DATE: December 16, 2016 TO: Lourdes Howell-Thomas, Inspector General Office of Inspector General Vickie Koenig, Chief of Policy and Special Programs FROM: Criminal Justice Professionalism SUBJECT: Alcohol Testing Program IA-1516-01

Criminal Justice Professionalism

Tallahassee, Florida 32302-1489

Post Office Box 1489

(850) 410-8600 www.fdle.state.fl.us

The Office of Criminal Justice Professionalism has reviewed the Alcohol Testing Program Audit Report and offers the following written response:

Finding 1 - The Blood Alcohol Analyst Permit Checklists were not always completed as required by procedure.

Recommendation 1 - We recommend management ensure all information required on the checklist is complete and the form is signed in accordance with procedures.

Management Response: Agree. The Alcohol Testing Program has already reviewed and corrected the permit checklists identified. The permit checklists are for internal use only and all permits are in compliance with 11D-8, F.A.C. Additionally, safeguards have been implemented to prevent this from happening in the future.

Corrective Action Implementation Date: December 16, 2016

Rick Scott, Governor Pam Bondi, Attorney General Jeff Atwater, Chief Financial Officer Adam Putnam, Commissioner of Agriculture