Page 1

MARJORY STONEMAN DOUGLAS HIGH SCHOOL

PUBLIC SAFETY COMMISSION

MSD COMMISSION MEETING

VOLUME I

Amended

DATE: Tuesday, September 28, 2021

TIME: 8:31 a.m. - 5:45 p.m.

LOCATION: BB&T Center, Chairman's Club

1 Panther Parkway

Sunrise, FL 33323

REPORTED BY:

Johnny Caldera, Court Reporter
Notary Public, State of Florida
Laws Reporting, Inc.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

| Amended September | | | 8, 2021 Pages 25 |
|-------------------|--|----|--|
| | Page 2 | 1 | Page 3 |
| 2 | INDEX TO APPEARANCES | 2 | ALSO PRESENT: |
| l | COMMISSION MEMBERS: | 3 | Shevaun Harris, Secretary, Department of Children and Families |
| 3 4 | Sherriff Bob Gualtieri, Chair | 4 | John Suess, Pinellas County Sheriff's Office |
| 5 | Kevin Lystad, Vice Chair | 5 | Annie White, FDLE |
| 6 | Jim Martin, Esq., General Counsel | 6 | Heather Pence, FDLE |
| 7 | Pat Stewart, Commissioner | 7 | Tom Foy, FDLE |
| 8 | Grady Judd, Commissioner | 8 | Mike Phillips, FDLE |
| 9 | Douglas Dodd, Commissioner | 9 | Jennifer Miller, FDLE |
| 10 | Ryan Petty, Commissioner | 10 | Devin Lovett, FDLE |
| 11 | Marsha Powers, Commissioner | 11 | PRESENTING SPEAKERS: |
| 12 | James Harpring, Commissioner | 12 | Tim Hay, Director, DOE Office of Safe Schools |
| 13 | Chris Nelson, Commissioner | 13 | Eric Hall, Senior Chacellor, Florida DOE |
| 14 | Richard Swearingen, Commissioner | 14 | Sylvia Ifft, DOE |
| 15 | Max Schachter, Commissioner | 15 | Sally Lawrence, Sarasota County 911 Coordinator |
| 16 | Melissa Larkin-Skinner, Commissioner | 16 | Jeff Kelly - Public Speaker |
| 17 | Mike Carroll, Commissioner | 17 | Keith Touchberry, Chief, Fellsmere Police |
| 18 | ALSO PRESENT: | 18 | Department and Indian River State College |
| 19 | Christina Linton, FDLE | 19 | Chris Cicio, Major, Director of Law Enforcement, |
| 20 | Simone Marstiller Secretary, Agency for Health Care | 20 | St. Lucie County Sheriff's Office Adjunct Faculty, |
| 21 | Administration | 21 | Indian River State College |
| 22 | Jacob Oliva, Chancellor, Dept. of Education | 21 | |
| 23 | | 23 | John Teske, Director of Security for SDIRC, |
| 24 | Josefina Tamayo, Acting Secretary, Department of Juvenille Justice | 24 | Emergency Operations Center ESF 1 LTC, USAR, MP |
| 25 | Juvenille Justice | 25 | Dr. Kelly Amatucci, Ed. D., Indian River State |
| 45 | | 25 | Colege, Dean of the School of Education |
| ١. | Page 4 | | Page 5 |
| 1 | PROCEEDINGS | 1 | departments. |
| 2 | SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right. Good morning, | 2 | The next category which is the controversial |
| 3 | everybody. We'll go ahead and call the meeting | 3 | category or has been the controversial category, is |
| 4 | back back in order. One of the things I want to | 4 | Guardians. Now we know that Guardians are employees |
| 5 | just follow up on quickly from yesterday. Remember | 5 | of school boards who are trained by the sheriffs. |
| 6 | in the Powerpoint slide yesterday, we talked about | 6 | And when the Guardian law became effective it was |

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

in the Powerpoint slide yesterday, we talked about one of the requirements is that data be reported to the Commissioner of Education on the safe-school officers and discipline, discharge of firearms, et cetera. I just want to share with you what the data showed for the 2021 and '19 and '20 school years because I think it's important to see the results of what was done.

Remember, when we're talking about safe-school officers it's -- we're talking about, one, we're talking about cops. So safe-school officers under that definition are police officers and deputy sheriffs employed by police departments. We're talking about, again these definitions I didn't create them the legislature did and they get confusing. They call them school safety officers but in the Statute what they really are is police officers employed by school board police departments like Pinellas, Palm Beach, Jacksonville, Miami , they have their own police

And when the Guardian law became effective it was proposed to put these guardians in schools who are not cops . There was a lot of concern, a lot of worry about whether it was going to be effective or whether it was going to be dangerous. In some cases whether they getting the right training; whether they were going to have to discharge firearms, these Guardians who were going to be acting inappropriately and doing all these bad things and it wasn't gonna be a good program.

And then that was expanded into a fourth category where you could have contractual security guards, as long as those security guards who are D and G licensed under the State, which means that they are security guards, but they have authority to carry firearms. -- they went through the quardian training. So you've got under that whole umbrella of, safe, school officers, you got a whole bunch of people. You've got cops working for sheriff and police departments. You've got cops

Page working for school boards, you've got traditional Guardians, and you've got security guards who are trained as guardians.

So for the 2021 school year, there were 4301 safe-school officers. So that's all those people that fit the categories that I just talked about. And during that entire school year, there were, of those 4301, there were 34 disciplines or terminations, and only one discharged firearm outside of training where it was an accidental discharge.

In the 2019-'20 school year, there were 4299 safe-school officers, all in that category including the Guardians. Eighteen discipline incidents and again one discharge of a firearm outside of training with an accidental discharge. And I think what the data shows is the training is the right trianing. So, the training requirements that the legislature put in place. And remember, we've talked about this extensively, and we've talked about in the community extensively is that the firearms training that the Guardians are required to go through exceeds the firearms training that a police recruit is required to go through in the police academy. and the training

Page 8

discussion about communications here in Broward and Mr. Schachter go ahead.

MR. SCHACHTER: I just want to say something now. You know, it's — in February it's going to be four years since Alex and sixteen others were murdered, and today we're going to hear from a lot of law enforcement officials and the school board about some of the failures that still were not fixed. I wanted to thank the elected officials who are here today, we've got Broward County school board member Lori Alhadef; we've got the Parkland mayor, Rich Walker, and some of the City commissioners, Jordan Isrow and Bob Mayersohn are here. We also have Coral Springs City Commissioner Joy Carter here, and also County commissioner, Mickey Udine.

I think it's important, the reason I asked all the elected officials to be here is because after all of these years we still have things that are not fixed that were -- that had happened on February 14th, particularly these communication issues. It is very, very upsetting that we still have some of the problems that contributed to lives lost that are not fixed. This is a life safety issue and this is very important. I don't want to

Page done by the sheriffs in that regard has been effective and the proof is in the numbers.

So, I think it's important for everybody to be assured that what was done was the right thing, and what it's showing in time is that's it's been effective. The required training is the right training and how it's being done overall is good and it's working. And it's been that force multiplier where you can have either the Guardian being that good person with a gun on campus, it saves money it saves personnel.

Remember, we said we can't hire enough cops to staff every school. And then those other schools where you've got the Guardians supplementing the SROs that becomes that force multiplier so as opposed to having just one SRO, you can have two or three or four school personnel who are safe-school officers who are the Guardians, who are armed, and they those provide extra layers of protection and that back up for the SRO's.

So the numbers show that it's working and we'll continue to monitor every year that this data is reported, so -- anybody have any questions on that?

So, we're going to weed in this morning to

Page 9

continue to do this, I don't want to be here, but we will continue to do this to make sure all this is fixed, but -- you know, thank you for all of your efforts, Sheriff. I hope today we can, you know, work towards fixing all of this.

We don't have a memorial here in Parkland for the 17 victims or Coral Springs. The only place I can go on and visit my little boy is in the cemetery, and I would like a commitment from every elected official and every official that stands before us today to fix these failures that were not fixed up to this point. We need everything fixed by the four-year anniversary and I hope that I can get that commitment from all the individuals that testify here today. Thank you, Sheriff.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. So to lead into the first presentation today which is by Chief Rosa from Sunrise Police Department, who is Chair of one of the committees within ORCAT. I just wanted to recap for everybody because it's been two years, it's been a while and just make sure — it may help to facilitate the discussion here this morning. So remember these — all these communication issues there separate issues. So, we're talking about radio communications, and we're talking about

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the house.

Page

dispatch and the CAD. They're different. So on the radio communications side, we know that in the structure here in Broward County is -is that the country-wide communication which is run by the county under ORCAT, which is the office of regional communication technology. And ORCAT is primarily responsible for the technology side of the house, for the technology components. So that is the radio system that is the CAD. That is all the hardware, it's the centers themselves. The

personnel in those communication centers are the

responsibility of the Broward county sheriff, the

call takers, the dispatchers ,the personnel side of

There's three regional communication centers; one north, one central, and one south. There are two cities that do not participate in regional communications, the city of Coral Springs and the city of Plantation. So as we talked about yesterday, and you all are familiar with by now, these things called PSAP, public safety answering points or put it in common terminology 9-1-1 centers. So, what most people think , which is not the case, is that it is easy you pick up the phone

Page 11 is answered by somebody that can immediately dispatch the help you need out of that center.

Well, remember that's not the way it works here, and in other places in Florida this -- this problem, if you will. It's not alone to Broward County. The problem that we saw and was faced here on February, 14th, 2018, and you heard those devastating phone calls from those kids within Marjory Stoneman Douglas High school on their cellphones When they called 911 and they wanted help the police provider for the city of Parkland is the Broward County Sheriff's Office.

The Broward County Sheriff's Office has three regional communication centers; north, central, and south. But when you call 911 from anywhere in the city of Parkland from a cellphone it doesn't go to one of the sheriff's dispatch centers. It goes to the city of Coral Springs Dispatch Center. Now, remember, the reason for that is that a decision was made because you've got to choose.

You have to choose where those 911 calls from cell phones are routed. And the decision was made years ago because the Fire -- the city of Parkland has no emergency services provision itself. It contracts. So it contracts with -- it contracts

Page 12

with BSO for police. It contracts with Coral Springs for fire EMS. The absolute majority, $\ensuremath{\mathrm{I}}$ think, numbers are at 95 percent of the 911 calls that come in, like, via cell phone are Fire-EMS calls , primarily EMS calls.

and call 911. It goes to a place where the phone

So the decision was made that any cell phone 911 call in the city of Parkland is going to go to Coral Springs because the majority of them required EMS dispatch. So, if you've got that person who's having a heart attack at 3 o'clock in the morning they're going to get the fastest response. Well, if | 11 you've got a person who's shooting up a school at 2:30 in the afternoon and somebody's called 911, it's going to go to Coral Springs and then Coral Springs has to transfer it over to BSO. So, you're going to have that delay because the people in the communication center that were receiving the call at that time had no communication with the cops in

If you pick up the phone from a landline in Parkland -- a landline department and you call 911 it goes to BSO, and if it's an EMS call and you happen to wake up at 3:00 in the morning then call 911 from your bedside phone, because you're having a heart attack, it goes to BSO and they transfer

Page 13 you over to Coral Springs and then they dispatch EMS. That hasn't changed. So in three-and-a-half years, that system hasn't changed.

And recall -- and I talked to Sheriff Tony about this, he knows, he's going to address it, he'll give you his reasons. One of the things that Sheriff Tony said in 201 was -- was that he was going to change it where the deputies in the city of Parkland were dispatched by Coral Springs and not by regional communications. That never came to fruition. He's got his reasons and he'll explain

So today, there is a small difference, and it is a better difference, is -- that is -- remember, they -- they didn't have -- because nobody learned it. For interoperability, they used a patch. There's a number of different ways to have interoperability where Somebody on one radio channel can talk to somebody on another system etc. Remember, we talked about interoperability and what they were using here was -- there's different paths to that. They were using the patch. Well, remember, nobody installed the channels so that they couldn't patch what they didn't have remember all that? Well, that's been fixed.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page

And so today what happens is that when a 911 call comes into Coral Springs from somebody in a cellphone from Parkland and it would be a situation like this even though the call still has to get transferred out over regional communications, Coral Springs can get up on the Parkland channel and help a Parkland deputy, so they're moving in the right direction, so that is a positive step, but the call routing hasn't changed. So -- just so -- and there is and they're going to get into Chief Rose is here , he'll talk about it a little bit. Chief Parry is here. He's going to get into it.

And then, the county administrator is going to be here and she knows that she's got to address it. Is -- is that Chief Parry has proposed a solution. It's not the hundred percent fix , but it's the next step, and that is an interface of - and they'll explain it more, from the CAD so that when that call comes from Parkland and it goes into Coral Springs, Coral Springs - because right now the CAD's aren't connected either and so if Coral Springs call taker in an interface will be able to send the call digitally over to the regional communication center for Broward Sheriff's Office, and wouldn't have to transfer callers so they could

Page 15 keep the person on the line. They could take the information, they can put it into CAD and it could be digital dispatched.

That's not 100 percent but it's better than where it is today. There's a problem and I don't know - and this is what we need to get fleshed out here today - there's a problem with being able to test this interface. So just - I'm setting the stage here trying to just make sure we're on the same lane and to try to ease these conversations because these are the issues and they'll - they'll address those. So that's the -- on that side. On the radio side, is that we know from the airport shooting in '17 that the system here, the radio system -- radio system totally different than the CAD system and the dispatch system. Radio systems differ.

They didn't have P25 and those of you that are not familiar with P25, it's -- P is for project, Project 25. It's a digital system. It is stateof-the-art technology that allows for interoperability. It's what all the law enforcement radio systems in the country have gone to or are going to. And that it was identified that the Broward system's lack capacity with the airport

Page 17

Page 16

shootings. The lack that -- the system lacked the capacity with the Stoneman Douglas shooting and the system failed. The system had been earmarked for replacement for years and they couldn't get it going.

They just -- it just didn't happen, and it didn't happen or hadn't happened in '18 at the time of the shooting. And it was in the works , we had a lot of discussions about it the county administrator addressed it and one of the -- one of the big hold-ups was - with it was the in - now infamous Hollywood tower situation. The system is up and running now, the new system is up and running. And it is up and running without the 16th | 14 tower in Hollywood.

So, Chief Rose is here, he's going to get into it. Chief Daniels Hollywood police chief is here if you have questions for him, he'll explain to you where it is and any system impact that it's having. So that's the landscape is we now plow this path of -- and the other thing -- the other thing is, remember, and sheriff Tony knows to address this -I've asked him to address this and remember, with ORCAT and regional communications, and remember all those employees, the call-takers and dispatchers

are BSO employees.

There was a survey that was done by Fitch in 2016 and then we updated that survey in 2019. Do you-all recall that? And about - remember in 2019, about 70 percent of the staff in BSO regional communications said that regional communications was unprepared to handle a mass casualty or a active assailant event, and there was all kinds of issues in that survey and Sheriff Tony is going to address that improvements they made and the changes and say where they are today to handle it.

So that's the framework I'll ask Chief Rosa to come up and begin his presentation and begin the discussion on the communications topic with Chief Rosa then Chief Parry, and County Administrator Henry, and Sheriff Tony. So, Chief Rosa, welcome.

CHIEF ROSA: Good morning. Thank you. So my name is Anthony Rosa. I'm the Chief of police for the City of Sunrise and I'm also the current president of the Broward County Chiefs of Police Association. I'm actually the past chair but a current member of the Broward County Operational Review Team related to communications and I anticipate that I'll assume the chair position again when my term as president in the association

Page is over.

This is a quick overview, it's something I discussed the last time I was here with the but the Operational Review Team in Broward County. It's convinced -- it's made up of three members of the Broward County Chiefs of Police Association, three members of the Fire Chiefs Association of Broward County, and one representative that is appointed by the City Managers Association of Broward County and -- and that's the -- the decision-making body for the operational issues and communications. You know, because I've previously presented here I

won't go through some of my other communications,

experience. or leadership experience. That's

already been done.

So really today what I was hoping to do is I wanted to update you on the status of communications in Broward County from the perspective of the Broward County Chiefs of Police Association. And -- and please recognize, although I'm speaking on behalf of the association, there -- there may be individual chiefs that differ on different topics related to the overall communications thing and I think you'll hear from -- from them later. But -- but I'll talk about the

Page 19 perspective of the association as a whole or from a consensus standpoint.

The last time I presented to the -- this commission I indicated there was positive progress towards the county engaging the operational aspects of the communication system and that they were starting to take some of our concerns into account and really that -- that -- between then and now, I've seen more progress in this area. So, since that meeting, there's been a lot of work between the police chiefs, the fire chiefs, and -- and this is something that wasn't really addressed at the last meeting, or at least by me or the municipal mana --- managers within Broward County, as well as the sheriff. It's like anything, I think if you want to get something done, you have to be persistent and there -- there needs to be some leadership involved and -- and you really have to drive things home to get it done. And that's what we did.

We were persis -- persistent and eventually, all the police chiefs, the fire chiefs, and the municipal managers were able to get on the same page with the message and indicate to the County what we wanted as a group -- those three entities.

Page 20

And as a result of that, our municipalities have executed an amended agreement with Broward County for the participation and consolidating the communication system that became effective on January of 2021. And it's where the -- among many things, it's one of the things of -- from the chief's perspective is that it recognizes the operational review team as decision-makers in the communication process. This agreement also formally establishes governance boards or board groups related to different topics within communications. And -- and those work-groups all have appointees by the -- either Police Association or the Fire Association, and these work-groups are administered by the County. And it's -- it's really where the groundwork -- ground-level type of work gets done for communications.

Although the ORT has been in existence for several years under many different make-ups, you know, because this agreement formalizes it, I think, you know, we've seen some progress because of that. That's been one of our asks in the past of Broward County. So I believe that one of the most important things that is accomplished by this agreement is -- is the agreement establishes an

engagement process where we can deal with any concerns or any changes to the system or any issues police chiefs, fire chiefs, or the municipalities have and that this engagement process identifies the steps to be taken recognized by the county for -- for dispute resolution or anything else that, you know, we may need to get done, for example, if we want to implement a piece of technology and it's coming from the chiefs as opposed to coming from Broward County.

With that said, I want to kind of highlight an issue of -- it's a recent example, and it's actually the first time this process has been engaged. I recently had a meeting with the -- a municipality regarding a piece of technology, and - and the sheriff alluded to it. It's a potential solution between one of the non-participating agencies in the county to have inter-operable CAD and a concept of the technology from the municipality explaining it to me really appears to be sound, and it kind of solves what -- what -- what I see and what has been a long-term problem and an unresolved problem in Broward County, with CADs talking to each other. And what I mean is -- is the Broward County consolidated system run by

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 22

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

the county government doesn't talk directly to the 2 CADs of the non-participating agencies, and that 3 being Plantation and Coral Springs. 4 So, I had this meeting with the eight -- the 5 municipalities and there's -- there was clear 6 frustration with Broward County. It absolutely 7 appears that roadblocks will be put in -- put up 8 and just making an overall difficult situation to 9 getting -- getting the project not -- not just 10 implemented but even to get it off the ground, 11 start testing, and things like that. So after this 12 meeting, I called the ORCAT director, Tracy 13 Jackson, and -- and -- and, you know, I talked to 14 him -- to him through my thoughts as the president 15 of the association on this. You know, he relayed 16 some concerns he had with tech -- with technology 17 and -- and I think that -- we'll talk about that in 17 18 a little bit but after speaking to him, it was 19 clear to me that the project was -- there was 20 probably a little intent on -- on behalf of the 21 county to -- to see the project move forward 22 without almost an insurmountable set of standards 23 that this municipality had to -- had to meet to get 24 moving forward with that. 25 So, what I did in -- in, you know, recognizing Page 24 1 this is just the first step in getting things

Page 23 that this -- this engagement process, I think the association took this up as an issue as it appears that it could solve all our problems -- not all our problems, but solve one of the problems. And I called for a special meeting of the operational review team and we invited most of these nonparticipating agencies; Broward County, some of the technology experts, and the Sheriff's Office and we had this meeting. We really talked about the issues and worked through some of the issues. And the result of the meeting -- and -- and I could just -- there was a lot of friction, there's still a lot of distrust, but the result of the meeting was at least we had a plan to start testing some of the technology. And -- and, you know, it's not necessarily what the municipality was looking for right out of the bat, but I see that as a positive from the overall perspective of ORT, being able to get something moving forward using this process that we entered into the agreements with -- with Broward County.

Bringing that -- the situation up as a project really was at a standstill and I think ORT was able to exert some leadership and facilitate where we are now with this. Although now I acknowledge that

forward, and -- and from my understanding, the testing hasn't even begun yet. You know, there definitely needs to be a lot of work done still to -- to move forward with this. I expect that everyone involved would -- would act in a cooperative and professional manner. But I've been doing this long enough to know that sometimes that's -- that that can be difficult when you get county, municipalities, police, and fire chiefs involved, and then sometimes it doesn't happen.

There continues to be challenges from our perspective. I think the trust between the municipalities, the County, and the Sheriff's Office still absolutely needs some work. And I --I'll give you an example of a change where that trust was. So I'll talk about my specific relationship with ORCAT director, Tracy Jackson. It's always been professional, you know, and -- and I think that's -- that even goes without saying. But, you know, it's evolved to the point where now I can call him and I consider him to at least assist us with problem-solving. And -- and, you know, to be clear, in my last presentation before I sat before this commission, I would not have told

Page 25 you that before. So -- so from my perspective, there is some slight improvement, but it's based on relationship-building with individuals. There's still clear distrust between all the parties that I've mentioned before.

You know, I -- I think that the -- the other aspect of this is the Broward County Sheriff, Sheriff Tony, you know, I -- I -- I consider him also a partner in problem-solving with this and I do want to acknowledge the sheriffs, I believe put all the right people in place in leadership positions within the communication system, you know, to make things happen. He has the right staff there now and that would be the opinion of the association. So, I think that the relationship-building across the communication spectrum, it's not something that's going to happen overnight. There's been distrust for so long for so many reasons even outside of the communication spectrum that, you know, the only thing in how we're going to get there is just strong leadership and positive examples with things that are actually working to make an improvement in the area. It's my commitment to the commission here that ORT will continue to be an advocate for the -- for close

Page 27 Page work -- working relationships between all the way to go. 1 2 stakeholders and try to bridge the gap where it 2 CHIEF ROSA: Still a long way to go. You know, 3 3 using your words, baby steps is a great way to look 4 I -- what I came here really and I hope to 4 at it. In my opinion, it's taken too long to get 5 convey was a message of -- of improving system, you 5 to this point, it should've happened years ago. 6 know, with some of the processes improving, 6 But -- but with that said, I can't not acknowledge 7 7 specifically this agreement. And now, that we've the fact that we are -- get moving forward a little had our first issue to this agree -- you know, and 8 9 I -- I believe it is working or beginning to work, 9 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right. And just want 10 but due to the -- the complexity and the 10 for everybody and I know you - you - you just 11 significant moving parts in Broward's communication 11 mentioned it and there's a - term municipality but 12 system, it's definitely going to require a lot of 12 I'll Segway in because a municipality that Chief 13 13 effort to -- to keep any forward momentum. You Rosa is talking about is Coral Springs and Chief 14 know, not everything is perfect, there is 14 Parry is up next , it is what I talked about as far 15 definitely challenges and there's a lot of work to 15 as -- the issue and trying to get this thing do. You know, it's like, I'm speaking right here 16 16 tested and Chief Parry will talk more about that s 17 optimistically but cautiously because of, you know, 17 any questions. Any questions? Anybody got comments 18 things that are -- can be -- they move. And -- and 18 or questions for Chief Rosa? Mr. Schacter, go 19 19 ahead. really with that I want to present myself to the 20 commission for any questions that you may have. 20 MR. SCHACHTER: Thank you, Chief. 21 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So, what I'm hearing is, 21 So, Chief, how long has the new government's 22 it's the baby steps. And at least now you get your 22 body or this -- this committee that you talked 23 phone calls returned where before, you probably 23 about, the ORT, how long have they been in 24 didn't even get your phone calls returned. And at 24 existence? 25 25 least there's some dialogue, but it's still a long CHIEF ROSA: So, ORT has been in existence for Page 29 Page 28 1 almost since communications consolidated and -- you 1 CHIEF ROSA: So, it's definitely -- I mean, I -2 know, certainly not in the form it is today. It's 2 - you know, I spoke of the distrust amongst all the 3 been various working groups or communication 3 parties and -- and the police chiefs are not the --4 experts. But today's formal structure was immune to that. You know, we have some distrust in 4 5 established as a result of this agreement in 5 Broward County and, you know, I -- I don't think 6 January of 2021. Now, even though it was 6 it's -- it's a combination of factors that this 7 formalized in January 2021, it had been in 7 didn't get put in place. But I think instead of 8 existence since in this manner with three police 8 saying that we should have done, we should have 9 chiefs, three fire chiefs, at some point we added 9 done, I think it's important to recognize that --10 in a city manager as a liaison to the county 10 that the ORT did do, and -- and I firmly believe 11 administrator. 11 it's because of our engagement of -- and I - you 12 If you remember, I believe I represented last 12 know I presented the city managers got involved in 13 time that the county administrator won't -- didn't this, but really ORT and some of the members of ORT 13 14 recognize the police or fire chiefs. She would or the -- the Police Chiefs Association leadership. 14 15 15 We started contacting elected officials and we -only recognize her peers as the -- the -- the city 16 managers. So -- so this agreement kind of shows 16 it got the ball rolling and I think it created an 17 that the city managers are delegating some of this 17 environment that set it up to where it is today 18 decision-making ability to the police and fire 18 which is -- is what our ask was at the time. 19 chiefs, and that is recognized by Broward County 19 MR. SCHACHTER: So, the Broward chiefs of 20 right now. 20 police position is that, and correct me if I'm 21 21 MR. SCHACHTER: Because I -- I was at one of wrong, that the solution that Coral Springs chief 22 these-- one of the ORT meetings, and I thought it 22 of police is gonna talk about this hub and that is 23 a viable solution and that's what we should move was, you know. Prior to that, why -- why do you 23 24 24 think that this meeting took so long to happen? forward with?

25

Why didn't it happen over the last three years?

25

CHIEF ROSA: So, based on what I know of the

25

Page Page 31 hub, the concept of it is very sound. It could off, that's where it is, right? That's the --1 2 definitely solve the problem of bridging the gap 2 basically the situation and again Chief Parry will 3 between the consolidated systems CAD and the 3 talk more about it 4 CHIEF ROSA: Yeah, I think the details that municipalities that don't participate, which is 4 5 Coral Springs and Plantation. I understand the two 5 Chief Parry and the county administrator would 6 have not been tested yet, so I don't want to say it 6 definitely be able to talk a little bit more to. 7 7 is. I believe based on the concept it could be, Right now, where we're looking at testing is --8 8 it's actually Coral Springs and Plantation. 9 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: The concept -- the concept 9 They're not touching the -- the consolidated 10 10 systems. The agreement that we reached was they works. I know it works, we use it. I -- I know 11 the concept works. Is this particular hub going to 11 would test and then the results of that -- and the 12 work in this environment with this technology, 12 County indicated they would be involved in some of 13 13 that. But the results of that test would be how we that's the question. And then, of course, you 14 shouldn't test something in a live environment. 14 move forward or not. But I -- I do think it's 15 You could crash the live environment. The question 15 appropriate that Chief Parry or the county 16 is how do you get it tested? 16 administrator address that further.. 17 And this is where the, I guess, friction --17 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: There -- there was 18 frustration and this is what we need to hear from 18 discussion, I think you talked about this the last 19 19 the county administrator about. About why and Chief time from the Police Chief's Association , not you 20 Parry will talk more about it and don't know 20 personally is there's been discussions about, you 21 exactly how long it's been going on. They can't get 21 know, transitioning this way from the county to the 22 the county to test it well it's the chicken or the 22 Sheriff's Office and the police chiefs taken the 23 egg you can't put it in a live environment until 23 official position or in support or not of that 24 you test it. If you can test it, you can put it in 24 happening because it there was talk about it before 25 25 and I know that there was some reluctance on all a live environment. So it's kind of this stand-Page 32 Page 33 1 the parties part because it was before the most 1 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Anybody else have any 2 comments or questions for Chief Rosa? Chief, recent election. And now that election has passed 2 3 and there was some discussion about that, has that 3 thanks for being here. Appreciate it. 4 been talked about?. Which seems like it may solve 4 CHIEF ROSA: Thank you. 5 some of this is there-where is that?? 5 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Next, we'll hear from Chief 6 CHIEF ROSA: So, a couple of things. I'll --6 Clyde Parry from the Coral Springs Police 7 I'll go back a little bit. So, we -- that -- that Department. Welcome, Chief, thanks for being here. 7 8 is the position of the Broward County Chief's 8 CHIEF PARRY: Good morning. Okay. So, you 9 Police Association. We took that position prior to 9 know, Sheriff, you did a great job of laying the 10 the last meeting of the -- of this commission and I groundwork as to what and where we're at today. 10 11 did present that one of the things that we've not 11 You talked earlier about the possibility of Coral 12 been active in continuing to advocate for it 12 Springs PSAP or dispatchers dispatching for the 13 because this agreement brings us to a point where -13 Broward County Sheriff's Office that work in Parkland. That was a solution that we came to. We 14 - you know, one of our biggest concerns is -- is 14 15 15 did meet with, at -- at the time it was the under law enforcement and fire had no say in aspects of 16 the system that really we should have been the 16 sheriff, Sean Jankowski (phonetic). We had that decision makers. So now that by agreement we do 17 17 agreement, we were working towards a solution. 18 18 have some ability to make a decision, we -- we That solution required us to -- to look at a 19 still believe and I think anyone here, any law 19 way to run both our dispatch system, our client, 20 enforcement leader, business leader recognizes you 20 and BSO's dispatch client on a single laptop that 21 cannot have two bosses. So, I still believe that 21 was utilized in the field by Broward county 22 one entity running this is the best in my -- in my 22 deputies and patrol --. So, you know, we -- we put 23 opinion, and what the association consensus is, 23 both on and -- and that was the first test we had

24

25

it's a public safety agency and in Broward County

it would be in the Sheriff's Office.

to see if that would work and that passed. And

then, the next thing we needed to do was see if we

CAD

Page 35

Page 34

sent a call, would it generate a call number in Broward County's RMS system.

It appears as though that worked also. We wanted to make sure that the different systems, the different clients could be updated simultane -- you know, differently -- at different times because, you know, we would push out updates. The county would push out updates. We wanted to make sure that those updates didn't crash the other system. That was working. As we were getting there we -- we began to talk about some of the operational problems that you've had, and probably, one -- it's probably the simplest to understand.

If one of my dispatchers were dispatching for BSO and BSO went to a suspicious person call and they were there and it turned out to be a burglary and they requested a canine. Now they're requesting that on our center. So which Canine units go? Is it Coral Springs Canine that goes or do we now have to transfer the call to get a BSO Canine enroute?

So, operationally there were some problems and as we were working those out, we heard about another solution and, you know, the solution, you know, that Sheriff you talked about it, and Chief Rosa talked about is -- is the hub solution. The hub solution is a solution that we got wind of while we were trying to implement this and when we looked at it, you know, we thought, this may be the right solution for us. Basically what it does is it bridges two disparate CADs. You know, we use the Central Square CAD, the county uses PremierOne CAD. What this will do, we plug in the cads and

allow us to transfer data from our CAD to their

So, in essence, if you have a big dispatch center most of the time the call takers aren't with the people that are dispatching the call anyway. So, they received the call, they type the stuff in, they hit send, it goes to the dispatcher, the dispatcher then dispatches the call. What this hub solution does is it basically would allow the call to come into the -- if it came into our center, it came into the county center. It did -- the call taker would type the notes in and send it to the PSAP, the dispatch center responsible for dispatching that CAD. It's as close to interoperability as we're ever going to get. That -- that would seem like a good solution.

Now the problem is, we don't know if it will

Page 36

work, you know we've heard about it, so in August of 2019, police from Coral Springs Police Department, Plantation Broward County ORCAT traveled to the regional -- or traveled to Fairfax in Virginia to witness the emerging digital concept EDC that is the creator of the hub. We wanted to check their inter-agency computer aided dispatch hub in operation. They've been using it up in the capital region for years. You know, what we wanted to determine is could dispatch -- could this hub solution dispatch between disparate CAD's. It can. We wanted to test and see if the CAD system we can request something from another PSAP that wasn't ours, you know, through the hub. We did and it can. We wanted to see if it could be used for closest unit response. It can. We wanted to see if it had a reasonable data chain exchange time.

Now, they use the word latency a lot of time here. And that was one of the things that we wanted to -- to see when we got up there, the latency between the two disparate CADs was ten-plus seconds. That's longer than any of us want. Ten seconds, you know, maybe 11, maybe 12, but -- but it's longer than -- than any of us want. But we later learned that that was by design. We also,

you know -- I mean, that -- that gave us hope that maybe it could be cut down. What -- ideally what we'd like is -- is fast as possible. One second, two second, three second, you know as fast as possible.

So, the group visited two different piece apps while we were there. One was in Warren County. They used the same CAD system as -- as ORCAT does. They used the PremierOne. The other one they -- they -- they visited was in Fairfax, county. The PSAP's used in the hub solution, service a similar population and call audience as Broward County. So, it was -- a very good apples-to-apples comparison. Employees from both PSAP's had nothing but positive comments regarding the implementation of the hub and the follow-up that they received from EDC.

CHIEF PARRY: Our employees left Capitol region feeling that the EDC hub solution was a viable option to eliminate call transfers and to initiate closest human response. While we were up there, the -- the president of the EDC, Chris Weisman told us that they were making a next generation of the hub, and the next generation may solve the latency problem if one existed, we don't even know if -- if

Page 38 it does because it hasn't been tested. You know, that next generation is the NG CAD-X and it's up and operational today as we speak.

It should be noted that EDC is the pref -- the preferred partner with Motorola for hub solutions. You know, so if Motor -- Motorola is, you know, preferring somebody it's hub. It's -- that's their vendor to solve these issues and they've done it in different parts of the country. In February '20, Coral Springs Commission, and -- and I really got to say it's, you know, our department, our city -our city commission has been dedicated to solving this issue since that war began. They authorized a three -- \$333,000 purchase of the hub. They also authorized a \$110,000 pertinent gear expenditure for the licensing and maintenance of the hub. You know, if we did this based on a conversation, a promise that -- that my city manager, Frank Babinec, and the county administrator, that we would work together to implement this situation to this system, to solve these -- these issues.

On February of 2000 -- or 2021, Coral Springs stood up the new version of the hub where it's performed, you know, extensive internal testing to make sure that it was viable with our -- our CAD.

Page 39
Our Cad is Central Square, you know, and it passed
all those tests in March of 21. Once -- once all
of our testing was completed Coral Springs formally
requested Broward County to join us in testing this
new up system by connecting our test CAD
environment to their test CAD environment.

During a meeting between our employees and ORCAT on March 29th, we received substantial pushback from ORCAT. We left the meeting with a list of 12 items that they requested further information on. I got to be honest with you, I felt that this was a feudal home work assignment. That's my feeling. Just my feeling. Despite that, we worked to get those answers to the 12 questions that they requested. June 14th we again met with ORCAT to discuss the next steps to imp -- to implement the hub solution. We were again met with substantial push-back.

ORCAT laid out several reasons for their unwillingness to test the hub solution. ORCAT stated that it doesn't have a separate testing environment. They told us that they have a secondary training environment. Now, if they don't have a test environment that -- that's -- that's fine. I don't know how they update, you know,

Page 40

other programs to make sure it doesn't crash the system. I guess they do it in the training environment. When we asked could we plug into the training environment, we were told, well, you know, they are training dispatchers all the time and we can't do it because they're you know training, you know many dispatchers.

I talked with Colonel Morena (phonetic) and he confirmed that, you know. They do. They're training dispatchers all the time and -- and I know that they're doing a job and they got deadlines they want to meet and I respect that. But he told me that they don't train during midnight and they don't train on the weekends. So, if they're not training around midnight and weekends I will be happy to test that CAD system and the hub solution at those times.

ORCAT also said that the application program interface hadn't been built yet and they were correct with that. It hasn't been built yet for that particular version of the hub. But it is because the national capital region is upgrading to that. That's in the works. It's being built, and they said that they didn't want their CAD system to be used for developmental processes. I -- I get

that, you know. I get that. I understand. You know, look, read the paper any day. Ransomware, people getting hacked. I get their security concerns, but I think we need to work together to get around those concerns, and as I said, the API is being built right now and it should be up and running.

ORCAT stated that it didn't believe it would meet our needs because it wasn't deployed in a law enforcement environment. So, when we went up to the Capital region, the hub that they have up there, and it's been operating for years, is only working for the fire departments, EMS. So that is true, but if you remember what a hub does, it exchanges data from disparate CAD's. It doesn't know if it's fire data or police data. So I don't know why that's a concern of theirs, you know. I do get that they said that it is true, but I feel that it's worth testing. I stand here, I can't tell you with 100 percent certainty that this hub will solve the solution. I think it will. I know there are a lot of smart people in my city that researched it and--and they looked at it and they feel confident about it.

I think that it is definitely something we

Page 43

Page 42 should test, we're trying to solve this. They also had a concern that the hub would not transfer the -- the data in three seconds to -- to get with their automatic vehicle locator requirements. I get the ADL requirements. You know, if you have a fire truck that's traveling 60 miles - I hate to sound like a math question, but if you had a fire truck that's traveling 60 miles an hour and, you know, it doesn't update it in three seconds, it takes ten or 11 seconds, that fire truck is not going to be in the same area when it's seven seconds later, you know. But it's not going to be that far. I don't know if that's a reason and we don't know if it's going to have that kind of latency.

We will know that if we plug it in and test it. All of these concerns can be answered if we just get into a situation where we plug in the hub and test it. ORCAT has not given us that go-ahead yet. Instead of that, they gave us -- and -- and Chief Rosa talked about having an agreement. I don't think we had an agreement. What we had were two options that ORCAT gave us.

The first one was the test our hub with the city of Plantation. The city of Plantation uses the Hexagon CAD. It's different than the

PremierOne CAD. So, if we plug it in with the Hexagon CAD with the city of Plantation I can see ORCAT saying, well, that's a different CAD system. How do we know it's going to work here? That's the kind of push-back that we've been getting. So, you know, we tried to narrow it down. We said, okay, let me see if I'm understanding this. You're telling us that if we plug into the city of Plantation and we are successful you will 100 percent agree to plug in he CAD in their system. I could not get a Yes out of them.I could not get a Yes out of them.I could not get a

They also offered the solution of having Motorola set up a PremierOne test environment CAD. PremierOne is their CAD. It's their vendor. My vendor for CAD is Central Squares. Yes, I'm a client of Motorola for radios and we have a relationship with that wing of Motorola, but I don't have a relationship with the CAD vendors. We don't use their CAD.

If we were working together, if we were willing partners working together to solve a shared problem, wouldn't we work together? Wouldn't it make more sense? That -- that ORCAT says, let me talk to our vendor and see if we can set this up.

Page 44

Now, maybe they have and maybe there's a reason that -- that they want us to do it. My understanding is that their CAD has been up and operational since 2017, yet they haven't accepted respons -- or accepted it yet and it hasn't been paid for fully. So it's been up and operational since 2017 yet they still owe Motorola money.

I don't know if Motorola is willing to set up this test environment for them. There's always a cost involved in that. Additionally, when we talked to Motorola about this -- because I'm trying to solve this, so we went ahead and called Motorola and we said, Look, is this possible? They told us that if we do that, they're setting a test CAD and running ours connecting to theirs. Their main -- their main center is up in -- in Chicago. Motorola told us that the latency wouldn't be an apples-to-apples comparison because it would go through many routers to get to Chicago and many routers to get back to us.

It obviously, would take longer . So, you know, when we did that test, it would probably be 7, 8, 9, 10,13 seconds. I'm not sure. But it's not as apples-to-apples comparison as plugging directly into the other CAD. So, you know, when I

Page 45 look at this, I think they've given us two -- two solutions to try, which I -- I think are just obstacles. If we get over them, where are we at? I don't have a commitment from them. Well, I'm frustrated. Chief Rosa was far more polite than I was. In four months -- in a little over four months, we will have the fourth anniversary since the massacre at Marjory Stoneman Douglas. We're not interoperable yet.

This is a solution. I don't know if it would work. I can't stand here and tell you that it's going to work, but I can tell you that it's the closest thing we came to and sure deserves a try. I'm not always going to be the chief of police for Coral Springs. At some point, my time is going to come and go and I'm going to retire. It's my hope that when I retire, that -- that this will be a solution, it will be fixed. But if it isn't, you'll be able to put on my retirement plaque that I did everything in my power to fix these problems.

My hope -- and my sincere hope is as frustrated as I am with the counties, frustrated as I am with ORCAT, my sincere hope is that when they retire, they don't write on their retirement plaque that they did everything not to fix this solution. I

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page think it's a viable solution. I think it's something that we should explore. And I -- I certainly hope that the County comes around and says, okay, like, let's test this and see if it works. With that, I will take any follow-up questions.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So -- so before we get any questions on that can we just address a couple of additional things is that one, and Sheriff Tony is going to talk about this with Margate and Coconut Creek because the reason that Margate and Coconut Creek have said that they are going to withdraw from regional communications and join into Coral Springs was their dissatisfaction over service, and 14 response, fixes, technology and a variety of things. And I asked him to address that -- but from your end of it. From your end - because you're on the receiving side of this -- can you just tell everybody what your understanding is of the situation with Margate and Coconut Creek and are they still planning to withdraw and join into your dispatch. Which again, as that ties into this issue because they withdraw from regional communications then they would get on your CAD. And this problem with call transfer , this whole

Page 47 problem, it becomes bigger because you've got two additional cities that are now on yours and are withdrawing from regional communications so if this doesn't get fixed then you've got two cities, that join on your system, the problem becomes worse. So could you just tell us where that is?

CHIEF PARRY: Yeah, you know, so we have a current contract with the city of Coconut Creek. We are going to go live dispatching for them in October of next year. We are in the process of doing all the technological work on the ground there. We are also in the process of hiring and training dispatchers that will work their city.

Margate has dropped out. Margate -- I've had many conversations with Chief Shaw. You know, it was their strong desire to join our ORCAT system and our dispatch center. They -- what happened when Coconut Creek broke up, they -- they had a shared fire service. So, their shared fire service, they cooperate. We had the Margate-Coconut Creek fire department. When -- when Coconut Creek made this move, Coconut Creek said, We're going to stand up our own fire department. That caused Margate to have to influx money into their fire department to get it ready to operate

Page 48

alone.

The money that they had put aside in their budget to join our CAD system because, you know, remember, we all pay county tax dollars. You know, so we're already paying for the regional system. Our citizens are also funding our dispatch center. Now, Coconut Creek is going to have their citizens funding the dispatch center. Margate wanted to do that. We had an agreement with them to do that, but the breakup of the fire services forced them to divert that money from dispatch and put it into their fire department. So right now they're going to stay with the County system.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So, if nothing changes in Coconut Creek as is stands now you have a contract with them , they withdraw from county regional communications October 1, 2022 They get on your CAD on the Central Square CAD, they get off their PremierOne and they're on your system program is that - it widens this problem, doesn't it? I mean with - because if you're in Coconut Creek which up to other cities - with everything all the calls in Coconut Creek as opposed to going to regional communications will go to the Coral Springs communications and it's just going to widen this

problem without a fix.

CHIEF PARRY: It -- it will and, you know, when -- when this was first -- I have a fantastic relationship with my neighboring cities. You know, myself, which -- and, you know, Chief Shaw get together. We talk about regional crime issues. If you look at it on a map it's a perfect square of Northwest Broward County. It makes sense. In this, I've even talked with ORCAT about this. We couldn't, in essence, keep our own system, be in control of -- of the things that we want to control in the dispatch center, but the hub solution would in essence make us the fourth PSAP in the county regional system. It makes sense.

Page 49

And, you know, I'm not looking -- I'm not a nation builder. I'm not looking to grab land. I'm not looking to do this. Quite frankly, it is a tremendous amount of work. It -- there's a tremendous amount of effort that goes into this and -- and setting up the dispatch center, I know that -- that, you know, many -- many of my people are working -- they are revving the red line. We are getting close to finally getting this up. It's not an easy task. I wished it all worked better.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So, that's the only - like

Page 50 you to address and then we'll take questions from the commissioners which is a small band-aid on a gaping wound which is now you do have in your communications centers interoperability on the radio with these deputies in Parkland so that when that 9-1-1 call comes from a cell-phone - the incident is occurring in Parkland it comes into your communications center, you still have to transfer the call over to regional communications . That's where they're going to enter the CAD information and actually going to dispatch but you all do have the ability now to get up on that BSO channel and at least alert the deputies of the significant event. Is - is all that accurate? Is that working? And how often does that happen? Can you talk a little bit about that?.

CHIEF PARRY: You know, they -- they don't get a lot of law enforcement calls but we -- we do get a lot of medical calls and that's why as you said at the beginning of the hearing today, it was designed that way. So, you know, yes, it is working. We come up -- if -- if we are dispatching EMS or fire to a call, we come up on their channel and we let the deputies know, hey, we're dispatching to this location for this incident.

Page 51
That is all working. We also have their -- a copy
of their CAD running in our room so that if a
significant event goes into law, we can see that
it's there.

You know, one of the things that we wanted to change right away is if a significant event occurs normally, you know the way mutual aid works it's supposed to be invited into the jurisdiction. You know, in an emergency situation like this, it's —it all hangs on deck. If that goes there, we're going to go right—of—way and they're able to see it. So, you know, we have put these band—aids in place and they have worked well. The sheriff's office in Parkland has been very good with us. We had a great relationship with Chief Mulligan up there that retired and he left and there is now a new chief and I anticipate that everything's going to remain smooth.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Questions from Chairman Judd.

MR. JUDD: I heard the administrator testified last year that she had worked for the County for 20 years, and for 20 years they've tried to fix system and they hadn't been able to. Well, I -- back to private enterprise. You know if private enterprise

Page 52

-- there were two businesses, and one was on the other side of the street. The other would ramp up their game and take them over and they would cease to exist. I fail to understand why the police chiefs and or the sheriff don't huddle and say look we're going to start with the system and we're going to do this the right way.

And we're going to start it with Coral Springs, we're going to go to Coconut Creek to go to whatever the other cities are and incrementally we're going to play private - or public -- Private Enterprise, and we're just going to gobble you up. At which time they'll cease -- cease to be relevant. It is obvious to me that they've taken a bureaucratic government approach to this , hey it's our way or the highway, and that's just not true anymore. And I will highly suggest that when you have county administrator say look I've been trying to fix this for 20 years and can't fix it that's -- that's a -- on everyone who touches that ORCAT system for the County. And after 20 years of -- of patience, that's about 19 years more than I would have had.

So, I $\operatorname{\mathsf{I}}$ I highly suggest that incrementally you get with the chiefs and/or the Sheriff, and go

Page 53 -- we're just going to put them out of business. We're going to create a system that can be added to as other agencies draw so that the customers, the citizens, get a return on their investment. We -- they get the appropriate professional response, and quit fooling with them. I mean, I've sat here and listened to it for four years, and I'm over it already. I run a regional system. The county is not 2 million, but it's you know 3 quarters of a million.

And we all hold hands and sing Kumbaya and make things work. And it works every day, 24/7. It can work. But the leadership's got to want it to work and leadership's got to recognize that in every police department, every fire department, and the sheriff's office, are their costumers. And if they don't enjoy their costumers, gobble them up. .

CHIEF PARRY: Look, I agree. I hope we get to that place. I -- I hope that we get to a place where we're all working together. These are shared problems. These are shared problems that need to be worked on together constructively and willingly. You know, saying, Yeah, bring us a solution. No, I don't like that solution, bring us another. No, I don't like that solution, bring us another. No, I

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 54 don't like that solution. It isn't -- isn't a good 2 partnership. I hope we get there. 3 As frustrated as I am, I am telling you that I 4 am willing to work with anybody to fix this 5 solution. It's the single biggest focus that I 6 have. It is quite frankly, taking all the time 7 that I've been the Chief of Coral Springs. This has been my biggest number one top priority, is 9 fixing not just the communication problem, but --10 but the other problems that were evident on that 11 day. 12 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Anybody else? Mr. Dodd? 13 MR. DODD: Could you just review with the 14 Commission the Coconut Creek issue with them 15 deciding to go into your communication system. I 16 know they are not here to speak on that. So I am 17 just curious as to is it tax , is it dollar 18 savings, is it better service. What's the reason? 19 CHIEF PARRY: It's -- it's clearly not saving 20 them money because we're charging them money for 21 the services. We have to hire a team of employees 22 so, you know, it's a cost to them. My 23 understanding is that they weren't happy with the 24 level of service that they were getting, so they 25 sought to come over to our dispatch center. 1 know if it's --2 3 4 5 CHIEF PARRY: Kathy Liriano, is our dispatch 6

Page 55 Obviously, when that first occurred, and I can -this has been my statement on this: I don't want to get so big that I'm not providing the same service that I can to the citizens of Coral Springs. And that terrifies me.

You know, and before we even agreed to this I said, If I can't provide the same level of service I'm not interested in doing it. And in meeting with our folks and in meeting with, you know, our dispatch center and the officers and, you know, the other stakeholders, we feel that we will have a good grasp on it and we'll be able to do it.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: No, I mean, remember, and you can ask Sheriff Tony about that and he'' share some information with you that he's got on that and his take on it and Chief Parry just said it's not because right now the cities that are members of regional communications are not paying anything It's all being paid by the county. So, when Coconut Creek withdraws from regional communications it's going to cost them - million, 2 million , what's the contract with Coral Springs gonna be? What's it for?.

CHIEF PARRY: You know what, I apologize. I should've brought that number with me. I don't

Page 56

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: It's all right. But put it this way. It's not cheap, -- undoubtedly it's going

supervisor. She'll be able to answer that

MS. LIRIANO: So the contract that we made with the City of Coconut Creek, we made a commitment for a ten-year contract with an annual cost. In there, it originated about 1.5 million and it goes up depending on the percentage.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Yeah 1.5 million so I was pretty close 1-2. So ,because it's going to cause them so. You know they've got the reasons maybe in a future meeting we'll see if the chiefs from Coconut Creek are willing to come in and talked about it I don't know but - it's a pretty significant step incur the costs when it's ana additional cost and I don't know but I guess it is because of the size of Coconut Creek that it' not gonna result in any reduction within the regional communications center because it's probably not enough to reduce their call volume. Where they're going to cut positions or do anything so it's gonna

Page 57 really be an additional cost and but there is something I encourage you to ask Sheriff Tony about he's got some views on it and what they've don't to address the concerns from Coconut Creek and Margate that we're expressed previously. So to round that circle I think we should hear from him as well. Anybody got anything else for Kathy or Chief Parry? Mr. Schachter, go ahead.

MR. SCHACHTER: Yeah, thank you, Chief, for coming today and explaining this whole issue. It's very, very upsetting that this isn't fixed and I know you share that same opinion. If you can test the hub with the county system, how long do you think it will take you to do that?

CHIEF PARRY: The testing --MR. SCHACHTER: If it works.

CHIEF PARRY: -- the testing portion, it -- it shouldn't take long at all. It all depends on how many calls you want to run through it. If we run 200 calls through it and we need to run 2000 calls through it, I assume if 200 worked then 2000 will. So I don't believe that will take very long. As far as implementing it, you know, it will depend on, you know, how quickly, how much cooperation, you know, how much time -- look, the IT unit -- and

```
Page 58
                                                                                                                Page 59
         this isn't a knock on anybody. The IT units, you
                                                                       well?
                                                               1
 2
         know, they are overworked. They have a lot on
                                                               2
                                                                           CHIEF PARRY: Are you saying have us dispatch
 3
         their plate, and especially from our side. We're
                                                               3
                                                                       for the -- for the sheriff's office or --
 4
         setting up a dispatch, you know, program -- program
                                                               4
                                                                           MR. SCHACHTER: No, no. Obviously, if you
 5
         for Coconut Creek. So, you know -- you know,
                                                               5
                                                                       can't get this to work, then something needs to
 6
         depending upon what kind of time you can free up
                                                               6
                                                                       change and Parkland should not have, you know,
 7
                                                               7
         and stuff, you know, we would move as fast as we
                                                                       their fire with one-- with one city and their law
 8
                                                               8
                                                                       enforcement with another. Is one option or, you
 9
             MR. SCHACHTER: You know, you're saying this
                                                               9
                                                                       know, if you can't get this hub to work, you guys
10
         can be tested over a weekend and it would be fully
                                                              10
                                                                       can't figure this out, then Parkland should switch
11
         tested or are we are talking a lot -- months?
                                                              11
                                                                       their law enforcement to Coral Springs.
12
             CHIEF PARRY: I believe so. Look, if you plug
                                                              12
                                                                           CHIEF PARRY: I -- I -- could tell you that I
13
                                                              13
         something in and it corrupts the testing
                                                                       think this is where the -- the mistrust that Chief
14
         environment, you simply roll back to a time before
                                                             14
                                                                       Rosa speaks about comes in. I don't want to take
15
         it corrupted. So you'd go, you know, if you're
                                                              15
                                                                       over Parkland, you know. It -- years ago, Coral
16
         going to start the test at 9:00 and then plugged it
                                                             16
                                                                       Springs -- when I first got to Coral Springs, you
17
         in and corrupted it and you'd go back to 8:59, you
                                                             17
                                                                       know, the rumor was that we were going to
18
         know, so -- you know, I think that it is something
                                                              18
                                                                       incorporate Parkland. You know mostly farmlands
19
                                                              19
         that could be done over a weekend.
                                                                       That's not where I want to go here. I think people
20
             MR. SCHACHTER: So plan B, if this, you test it
                                                             20
                                                                       think that. I will tell you after -- after working
21
         and it doesn't work or you can't come to an
                                                              21
                                                                       as hard as we are to set up a dispatch center, I
22
         agreement with the County to test it, I think the
                                                              22
                                                                       couldn't imagine starting a police department or
23
         people of Parkland deserve better. Would you be
                                                              23
                                                                       expanding the police department doing that.
24
         willing to, you know, have Parkland, you know, have
                                                              24
                                                                           Having said that, if those decisions were made
25
                                                              25
         all their law enforcement with Coral Springs as
                                                                       between the city manager of Coral Springs and the
                                                  Page 60
                                                                                                                Page 61
 1
         city manager of Parkland and that's the direction
                                                               1
                                                                       is Broward are there so many hands in the pot? Why
 2
                                                                       isn't Sheriff Tony in charge of the bigger call
         they want to go to, if I'm the chief I'm going to
                                                               2
 3
         do the best I can to provide that service. We have
                                                               3
                                                                       center?
 4
         an excellent working relationship with -- with BSO.
                                                                           CHIEF PARRY: He's in charge of the living
                                                               4
 5
         I -- I think, you know, obviously the first step
                                                               5
                                                                       breathing employees. ORCAT is in charge of
 6
         would be to see if we can solve this -- this
                                                               6
                                                                       anything that is mechanical, the computer systems,
 7
                                                               7
                                                                       you know, that -- that -- why that divides
         dispatch, you know, solution. That -- that would
 8
         be the best step in my opinion. But if it doesn't
                                                               8
                                                                       there, I don't know. It wasn't always like that,
 9
         work, then obviously we'd have to look at other
                                                               9
                                                                       but it is now, and --
10
         solutions.
                                                              10
                                                                           MR. CARROLL: Do you find it effective?
                                                                           CHIEF PARRY: It -- it -- it -- no it's not.
11
             MR. SCHACHTER: Thank you.
                                                              11
12
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Commissioner Carroll.
                                                              12
                                                                           MR. JUDD: Commissioner Carroll, you're spot
13
             MR. CARROLL: Thanks, Chief, and I do want to
                                                              13
                                                                       on. In, the regional center that I run, the county
14
         thank you for your sense of urgency. I hear it in
                                                              14
                                                                       owns the equipment. In fact they buy it.. I own
15
                                                              15
         everything you say and I do appreciate that. In
                                                                       all the software, I own all the employees, I make -
16
         your Jurisdiction who runs you know call center is
                                                             16
                                                                       - I call all the shots with the group of police
                                                                       chiefs and fire chiefs. They all sit down
17
         it - are you ultimately in charge of it?
                                                             17
             CHIEF PARRY: Ultimately, I am in charge. You
18
                                                              18
                                                                       collectively, and they make decisions. Quite
19
         know, Kathy is -- is -- the director of
                                                              19
                                                                       frankly I go along with what they make but when
         communications. Obviously, she is far more
20
                                                              20
                                                                       they make a decision that's in the best interest of
21
         knowledgeable about communications than I ever, you
                                                              21
                                                                       them that's exactly what we do. If they say we need
22
         know, hope to be. This incident it -- has forced
                                                              22
                                                                       a new piece of equipment, we need a new software,
23
                                                              23
         me to learn a lot and I'm telling you that I
                                                                       or we need an update, we're not getting it two
24
         probably know 10 percent of what she knows.
                                                              24
                                                                       years from now, three years from now. We're
```

MR. CARROLL: I guess my question would be, why

25

getting it as soon as the provider after we go

Skinner, go ahead.

Page 63

Page 62 through the due diligence can get on board and do it. But then the problem here, I think, it is that the sheriff or a group of police chiefs or fire chiefs don't get to call the shots, is what I hear from the Chief. But -- and I'm not trying to brag on our system, I'm just saying there's one person totally responsible for it and that's me. And I get what I need cause I've got a fantastic county commission, and the county - who funds me - and a county manager and I go this is what we need and this is what we get and there's not a question as to the operational side of it at all. And it can run like that. But I've heard the administrator stand up here and say in 20 years we've not been able to fix it well what makes us think they're going to fix it in the next 20 years?. SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Well, what we're going to hear from next in a sec -- in a second we're going

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Well, what we're going to hear from next in a sec -- in a second we're going to hear from county administrator Bertha Henry, so ask these questions of the county administrator, and she's coming up next. So, it all -- what you've heard before -- and this is my characterization nobody else's -- and answered it's the golden rule. The one in the gold is the one making the rules and it's not the operators

it's the one with the gold. The money. So, it's - you know follow the money is what it is. But ask Ms. Henry. She'll address these things, you know she will, she's candid about it, but you know to close the circle on this after this we're going to hear from her as soon as we finish with Chief Parry. What other questions for Chief Parry anybody got anything else? Yes, Commissioner Larkin-

MS. LARKIN-SKINNER: I don't have a question, it's more of an observation. As I sit here and listen to this it's very frustrating. What I realize is that ultimately, the police chiefs and - and, you know, people can say they're not cooperative or they want this and they want that, whatever. The reality is the police chiefs are beholden to their city commission and the residents in their city, not to everybody else in county of Broward. Whereas the county government of Broward, is beholden to all citizens, all people in Broward County.

And it seems to me that onus to figure this out and make it work, though it has failed for 20 years is on Broward County. And I just wanted to mention that because that to me gives it a different

Page 64

context than this, you know, hearing from everybody and everybody has their frustrations, but I do believe it is absolutely the county government's job to figure this out.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right. Not hearing any other questions, or seeing any other questions -- Chief Parry, thank you very much for being here. I appreciate it.

CHIEF PARRY: Thank you.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So next we'll hear from - I see that she's here, County Administrator Bertha Henry. Ms. Henry, thanks for being here with us today. I know she's going to address this issue as well as the hower - Hollywood tower issues, and a variety of other things so we appreciate your time. Thank you.

MS. HENRY: So I'll just -- it here?
CHIEF PARRY: Yes.

MS. HENRY: Okay. Sorry about that.

Well, good morning, everyone, and thank you for having us. Some days it does seem like de ja vu and I'm going to take an opportunity to talk about the positive things that have happened and I'm sure I've got a lot of time to talk about, you know, what's not working. But I want to talk about

what's working. The last time I was before this board, we talked about the regional system, the radio system. What was going on with the radio system?

This body made a series of recommendations that I think that, at this point, we should be patting ourselves on the back because quite frankly, they were good recommendations when they were implemented. Let me start with the request to take the school board off of the old radio system, while the new system was being built. And what we said to you at that time, was we need to build a local government radio system so that the school board has a place to go. They need radio coverage and so our team backed up, we pulled out all the stops and we pulled them off of the old radio system to create capacity for the new system -- I mean, for the -- to -- in -- in -- in anticipation that the new system will be up and running.

We did that while we were building the new system. The second, we talked about the new system. The new system -- we struggled, and when I say we struggled, I want to say that we struggled as a community. We came up with a system that we thought would work, a 16-tower configuration. We

worked with our partner Motorolla for the highest standards that they could provide at that time. We didn't spare a nickel. And we began to build out the system but we ran into a problem when it got to -- to that 16th tower site and it was a -- an -- an issue that we had to work through.

We recognized that in order for us to not continue to lose ground we need to go ahead and build the system up to 15 towers and that's what we did. Subsequently, thankfully, the City of Hollywood came on board. They are now on the regional system. We now have an agreement to build the 16th tower site. Was it a -- a -- did it take time? Yes, it took time. Was it solely the county's responsibility? I think not.

So, I want to talk about -- again, I want to give my team kudos for the work that they did. You have a pandemic going on, you have a lot of things going on but they were singularly focused on getting this system up sparing not one nickel. So, kudos to them. So now we talk about a -- a partnership that you've heard quite a bit about. You heard Chief Rosa say he is cautiously optimistic about where things are going, where the police and fire chiefs have a seat at the table.

He indicated that it was a part of the municipality's desire to give them a greater voice at the system.

We have said from the very beginning -- I don't know why this continues to get gnarled into things that were not true -- we've said from the very beginning we have a contractual relationship with municipalities, not a contractual relationship with the Police and Fire Chiefs Association. We are happy to use the Fire Chiefs -- the Police and Fire Chiefs Association to make those decisions on behalf of the municipalities, but the municipalities have to agree to that. And guess what, they did. We went to them, everybody talked it through and they did. That's a contractual relationship. I didn't have a contractual relationship with police and fire chiefs.

But now, both municipalities and counties agreed that that's what everybody's comfortable with and we're fine with that. When we talk about this situation with the City of Coral Springs, it is -- pains me a little bit because, you know, we -- we pick up -- you know, we put a point -- a pin in a point in time and we don't look at what has transpired. So first and foremost, we were asked

Page 68

to be a partner at the table to make sure we can assure two major votes: Closest human response and avoid these call transfers.

So initially, everybody got together and we said, well there is a solution, we can work with the sheriff's office, with Parkland and Coral Springs, the county said, great, we ran out. We are currently spending 17 -- \$17,000 a mon -- a year on a circuit that we didn't wait until it was proven, we went out and we did it and guess what? It's not being used. Not because we didn't want to use it but the partners decided that that probably wasn't the best. Could I cut it off? Yeah. Did I? No. Because we anticipate at some point that this system will work the way that everyone wants it to work.

So, we were asked, Hey, there is a solution out there, huh. Let's go check it out. So our team went to, you heard, to Loudon County and Fairfax and -- and -- and what we were told we would see when we went there, we didn't. So, we have a call center that addresses police and fire. The system that we looked at was fire only. We talked about this issue of latency, our stats said it was between 15 and 22 seconds which no one in this room

Page 69 would find acceptable. So we said, Eh, that's not going to work. Subsequently, the city, to their credit, because they -- and I will -- I will not say one negative thing about Chief Parry here today because he is looking out for his community and I believe that his heart is in the right place.

I have spent a -- a -- a number of times in conversations with the city manager of Coral Springs and I believe we're on the right page and all we're asking at this point is that we try to make both sides happy here. You heard the chief said, Well, the county said it doesn't have a test environment. What the county said is we don't have a test environment solely. It is a test-and-train environment. I've heard the Chief said, Okay, maybe we can test this system at midnight or we can test this system during off hours. That very well may be true and we said, okay, here are -- here's a set of specifications that we would like to have to make sure that this is going to work and that it's not going to put the system that handles 1.2 million calls a year at risk.

I heard the Chief say that their solution -their partner is Motorola. And we said, great, let's have -- let's see if Motorola can work with

Page 71

Page 70 us to come up with a test environment. We'll download all of the data on -- you know, if we going to -- let's just to do that. Motorola indicated to me a few minutes ago that, Well, some of the requirements we may not be able to meet. I said, okay. What are those requirements? I don't know at this point.

But I didn't stop there. What I asked of the city manager, and he has done that, can you have our Chief Security Officer for Broward County Government, not just the communications. Because if your chief is uncomfortable with my chief, and there seems to be a little bit of back-and-forth on that, let's just elevate this stuff. You bring your chief IT security officer and -- and -- and our chief ICT -- IT security officer so those two entities could talk -- because they can speak each other's language, right? There are things that we were very much concerned about.

And -- and I would also say that today I'm really not prepared to start to talk about this mechanics and the specifics of our system, but if you wanted to have somebody to independently sit and talk to with us about that so that we don't have on the public record for everybody to see what

-- what the arc -- our architecture is all about, I'm willing to do that too. It's my understanding that those two security chiefs, well, they agreed to meet. And so for those two -- and I assure you I've given them no -- there's not -- all we want is find a way to make this work. That's his mantra, not anything else.

So it's my understanding they're meeting sometime this week. And I'm hopeful that when they come out of that meeting everybody will understand each other's system -- I mean, concerns. I don't have a desire not to be supportive of Coral Springs. And I think someone said here, the county has a responsibility to all of Broward County's residents, and I don't disagree with that. So I am very comfortable making sure that when those two get in a room and they understand what each other's concerns about they could get a resolution to that.

As it relates to Coconut Creek, first and foremost, I want to thank them publicly. Coconut Creek houses our North PSAP for the regional system. They have agreed to allow us to stay there until we're able to relocate. Our agreement at this point says that the regional system is housed by people that are participants. And so we have --

Page

we have a building that's being renovated that will be shared with another county agency. As soon as that renovation is completed, we'll be moving in again. We're -- we're just marching up. I thank them for that. They didn't have to do that but they did. But that's, again, everybody is trying to work together.

When we started this conversation it was, well, why aren't we -- you know, why aren't -- why isn't there pressure to get Coral Springs or Coconut Creek or whatever to remain in the system. It's really not our responsibility in the sense that each city has home rule, and they know what's important to them. So whatever is important to them, they get to make those decisions. We're there when they -- when they want us, we're there when they need us. I just don't want anybody to understand, every Broward County resident, even Coconut Creek, even Plantation, even Coral Springs, they will use this regional system as their backup. So it is -- providing a benefit to the entire community, and we stand ready where there needs to be more.

Chief Gualtier, you said to me the very first time we met, you know, what your goals -- what your $\ensuremath{\mbox{\sc your}}$

Page 73 goals were. And I said to you that I don't have dissimilar goals. I really don't. This is a huge system. I don't -- I don't choose or desire or in any way, shape, or form, the -- the policy decisions -- the policy decisions that govern how this organization should work. We have a structure to allow that to handle. We didn't have that before. Even though we had it, it wasn't being used. It became unground, you know, whispering in everybody's ear, We didn't have a formalized structure. We now have that. And we're -- we are working in concert to do that. And I think that to -- to say that the county hasn't been willing to be a good partner in that, I will be -- I will defend the county. We have been.

You know, I hope when you have your conversations with the Sheriff, you'll find out that their quote, friction that occurred between our two organizations. They' have dissipated.

They're not there. And the reason that friction is no longer there, in my opinion -- you'd have to ask him -- is because the communication is there now.

If -- communication takes two. We have -- both parties need to be willing to communicate. And I -- and I understand Chief, that in -- in a -- in a

Page different county, in a different environment, certain things happen, and, you know, if -- if that works for your county then that's great. I'm hoping that we get beyond some of the things that I've been hearing that really troubles me because I don't believe that they are warranted. I've never closed my door to anyone that's asked, no one has come to ask. And I think that we're just going to continue to try and build the best system. Our motto is 100 percent up-time. That's our motto.

We don't ever want this system to go down for any circumstances. The system it is up. It is running. It's been tested. I didn't hear anyone talk about we had another tragedy. We all know it's just -- was just -- you know, it's just that they lined up, and we were able to respond. The system responded as it was contemplated to do, and this was the situation with the FBI agents where several of them -- or two were -- were killed and others harmed, and the system worked.

We reached out ,did anybody who have a problem because we wanted to make sure some of the same things were happening. A lot of people called in. It worked. Unbeknownst to many of you, we played a role in the Surfside situation. When that building

collapsed, we sent many teams. Many of Broward County first responders went to assist that community until it could be managed. Well, our radio system actually worked flawlessly down there, up to everyone's amazement. So I -- I want to make sure that my team gets the -- the credit and the kudos. They're not being belligerent for the sake of being belligerent. A Hundred percent of the time, that's our goal. And if there's a way to do this with Coral Springs in a way that keeps -- that makes the system better -- when I say the system, I mean the collective system -- we're prepared to do that.

Page

Page 77

And you asked if -- if we could just touch on a few things that came out of the Police Foundation's Report. You know, one of the -- one of the major recommendations that came out of that report was that we really start to work towards having a unified command structure in our -- in our county. And there have been significant efforts to do that. One of the first questions that I asked you: Chief, do you a fleet map? And you looked at me like I lost my head, if you recall. Well, we didn't have a fleet map. We had these disparate -- we had -- we combined a group of PSAP's together to create a

Page 76

regional system and -- and a structure to make sure we all communicated seamlessly on the radio system was evolving and it hadn't happened yet.

Well, guess what? We have a fleet map now, for both police and fire. . We were asked to -- to do more stimulation so that it's -- it's clear that this community has exercised itself so that when something happens we are able to respond quickly. Well, you know, my team hasn't -- has participated in several active killer scenarios with the sheriff. We did a seaside scenario just recently out at Port Everglades. We've been doing it with the -- the airport. So those things are happening.

the -- the airport. So those things are happening.

There were recommendations that came from your group as well. And so, all those things are -- are happening. We had what I would call a very positive public-private partnership. You know, many of our young people and after the -- the -- the tragedy, they were struggling with mental health. And so, we -- we partnered with -- with the trauma coalition. But more importantly, Eagle's Haven, the community sort of, came together and -- and, sort of, took, you know, took control over that. That was a very positive thing, and all of that works because, you know, we tried to come

together as a community.

So COVID has challenged us just like it's challenged many of you, and we're all working through that. But I want to close by stating that it is not in the county's best interest to be standing here talking about why we won't test in a — a system that at this point where we have some reservations, but we have been willing to participate. We have been. We have done it and shown that we're willing to do it. There's just a few things that we're asking and — and because there is just a little bit of tension because, you know, Mr. Rivas (phonetic) has the responsibility for 100 percent up-time. And he's not looking to the — the system as we're currently configured doesn't exist anywhere else in the country.

So we would be a beta site for that. So we need to make sure that what we're doing, whether in the test environment or long-term, isn't going to create problems in the future. And I would hope that we let these IT professionals deal with that issue, and hopefully the next time we're back in front of you, we will have found a solution. Those are my comments.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. Thank You. And when -

Page 79 Page - do you have a date? MS. HENRY: That's correct. 1 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: But still - still in 2 MS. HENRY: I beg your pardon? 2 3 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Do you have a date when the 3 discussions Don't have a date for when it's going 4 to go up yet. There's still -- still things to be shovel is going in the ground on the Hollywood 4 5 tower? Do we have a date when they're actually 5 worked out? 6 going to begin to put that tower up?. 6 MS. HENRY: So I want to say to you that 7 7 MS. HENRY: So we are in final negotiations because at least the city and the county is in 8 with Motorola as we speak. The good news is the --8 agreement, there are things that will have to be 9 the tower itself, we have it. The shelter that 9 put in place in order for it all to come together. 10 houses all of the equipment, we have it. We don't 10 So we've not stopped those things. So there are 11 have to go out and buy that, we have it. We know 11 activities that are occurring behind-the-scene, but 12 the location. We have to do some more studies and 12 the actual construction when it says Go can happen 13 13 things like that. When we put the final numbers quickly because we have the permit. We'll have all 14 together in terms of what we think the value of 14 the things that we need so that the -- the -- the 15 this is going to cost, it's flying out the door 15 tower can be erected quickly. SHERIFF GUALTIERI: And so, please help me 16 because everything's pretty much in place to get it 16 17 done. 17 understand this because I think (coughs) -- excuse 18 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Well, I guess the answer to 18 me. You know Chief Parry's point was that when 19 my question is, it's still a ways off from shovel 19 you're looking at data, it doesn't matter whether 20 going into the ground and getting this thing up but 20 it's fire data or police data, EMS data, data is 21 it is - just for everybody it is the the West Lake 21 data in the transfer of data in the CAD system. My 22 parks site. It's not the --22 understanding is that would be correct. You made a 23 MS. HENRY: That's correct. 23 point of distinguishing in the DC area. That that 24 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. It is the West Lake 24 was a fire-only hub and data transfer as opposed to 25 25 police and fire. So I'm missing that because it wa parks site. Page 80 Page 81 1 a comment you made as to one of the concerns that 1 interfacing facing here: Are those calls that come 2 you had so how - because I'm missing that - how is 2 into the Coral Springs Communication Center? 3 that relevant? 3 MS. HENRY: But, it should go back and forth 4 MS. HENRY: So, you know, it is relevant 4 right? 5 because all that data is still coming into the 5 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Or are those calls -- are 6 system. It's coming through that hub. So it's not 6 those calls into the regional communication Center? 7 That need to go to the others. So we're not talking that this hub is only, going to just take, you 7 8 know, it's for fire calls, but you probably have 8 in mass. You said the system -- your system has 9 less fire calls than you have police calls. But 9 1.2 Million calls a year. We're only talking the 10 when you got everything coming through police and system -- the systems on each side that recieve 10 11 fire, you want to make sure that it's robust enough | 11 calls that really are Parkland related or you could 12 that it doesn't create the kind of latency that we 12 have some issues down in Plantation with the other 13 13 one but we're really talking a relatively small saw in -- in our visit. Now, whether that was 14 something that the community wanted to have, we 14 number. But I hope that they have success with the 15 don't know. But I think that the issue -- I think 15 chief IT people being able to resolve this. Now 16 the issue here is, and I'm going to get -- get out 16 along those lines is that are you receptive -- are 17 of my way because that's not my -- my expertise. 17 you open to this - because it has to be tested. 18 But I would say that when you have two IT security 18 You can't test in a live environment, everybody 19 chiefs for both governments engaging to make sure 19 acknowledges that, you say you don't have a test environment. You have a test-and-training 20 that each other's comfortable with what, you know, 20 21 21 what's necessary, they'll find a solution to this. environment. The training environment has capacity 22 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Well, that's positive. 22 issues. Chief Parry outlined that, you touched on 23 it. Are you open to the suggestion of -- of testing Certainly, you know, that's positive. But again, 23 24

24

you know, capacity and size, but this is relatively

small. Because the only thing you're talking about

25

during non-hours, midnights and weekends because

the device has to be in the training environment

```
Page 82
                                                                                                                 Page 83
         when it's not being used? Are you open to that?
                                                                       all talking about the CAD. And so the whole
                                                               1
 2
             MS. HENRY: As long -- well the answer is yes.
                                                               2
                                                                       purpose of this is so that these disparate CADs can
 3
         But -- the but to that is that both sides needs to
                                                               3
                                                                       talk to one another. If we have a scenario where
                                                                       it can -- where our CAD can talk to Plantation's
         make sure that what they are charged with
 4
                                                               4
 5
         protecting is actually protected. So as long as
                                                               5
                                                                       CAD, it basically says that the underlying issues,
 6
         that happens, of course we're open to that. And
                                                               6
                                                                       if there are any, we're going to see it. And if
 7
         again, I want to-- I want to reiterate. We were a
                                                               7
                                                                       there not any, it -- it doesn't -- it does -- it
 8
         partner before this -- before we got to this point.
                                                               8
                                                                       should work under either scenario because we're
 9
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So what's your view because
                                                               9
                                                                       talking about different CADs. Is just that they
10
         he's got a valid concern? What's your view if they
                                                              10
                                                                       have one diff -- a CAD that's different than ours,
11
         were to test in Plantation and Plantation has the
                                                              11
                                                                       and Plantation, has one that's different from
12
         hexagon CAD. They're on the central square CAD.
                                                              12
                                                                       there's -- but that's really what we're trying to
13
         You're on a different CAD so if they test is that
                                                              13
                                                                       figure out, there's just something about it.
14
         - I think - I know - his concern is valid that
                                                              14
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So as a county
15
         somebody is going to come back and say well you
                                                              15
                                                                       administrator dealing with this issue and you had
16
         tested with hexagon instead of central squure you
                                                              16
                                                                       to tell Chief Parry what direction he should go in
17
         didn't test with ours and we're not going to accept
                                                              17
                                                                        . Should he pursue the test environment between
18
         that. So do you thin it's a good idea for them to
                                                              18
                                                                       Coral Springs and Plantation to test this hub or is
                                                              19
19
                                                                       it better for him to test it directly between Coral
         test with Plantation or should they stay away from
20
         that and try to work it out between you all
                                                              20
                                                                       Springs and the counties?
21
         directly in this environment that you're talking
                                                              21
                                                                           MS. HENRY: Okay. So -- so two things --
22
         about.
                                                              22
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: If you want to have Mr.
23
             MS. HENRY: So if we can have a successful
                                                              23
                                                                       Jackson answer that --
24
         transfer of data where -- because it's -- so it's
                                                              24
                                                                           MS. HENRY: No, no, no. No. No.
25
         my understanding that the CAD should -- that we're
                                                              25
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right.
                                                  Page 84
                                                                                                                 Page 85
 1
             MS. HENRY: This is -- you're asking if I will
                                                               1
                                                                       you the same or more to move it to the new
 2
                                                               2
                                                                       location?
         be supportive.
 3
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Right.
                                                               3
                                                                           MS. HENRY: It's not -- I mean, except for the
 4
             MS. HENRY: So what I'm -- so I'm going to be
                                                                       initial setup of a news area, it's not going to
                                                               4
 5
         supportive of either scenario if our IT structures
                                                               5
                                                                       cost us because the County will -- the County has
 6
         are comfortable with making sure that that - that
                                                               6
                                                                       acquired a building for its property appraiser. We
 7
                                                               7
                                                                       reserved space in one of the areas for this so it's
         we're not at risk. And as I said earlier, I
 8
         elevated this up here. So they will -- they will
                                                               8
                                                                       not going to cost us any more after the initials --
 9
         understand what each side needs and wants to make
                                                               9
                                                                       the initial setup.
10
         sure that they're protected and if it's going to
                                                              10
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: And this might be a
11
         take longer to get that on the county's side and it | 11
                                                                       question for Coconut Creek if you can't answer. Do
                                                                       you know, do you have any idea - and Sheriff Tony
12
         works with Plantation I think they should -- you
                                                              12
13
         know, whatever expedites the process, I would be --
                                                              13
                                                                       if they call we will address on it too but do you
14
                                                                       have an idea of what are the drivers -- or what is
         I would be supportive of.
                                                              14
15
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So you mentioned that right
                                                              15
                                                                       the driver or what are the drivers that's causing
         now the North regional communication site is housed
16
                                                              16
                                                                       Coconut Creek to want to spend 1.5 million dollars
17
         -- excuse me, Coconut Creek - old Coconut Creek
                                                              17
                                                                       to move off of your system and over to the Coral
18
         communications center - the Coconut Creek Police
                                                              18
                                                                       Springs system because that's a chunk of change.
19
         Department , correct?
                                                              19
                                                                           MS. HENRY: I really think that's a -- that's a
20
             MS. HENRY: Correct.
                                                              20
                                                                       question that needs to be answered by Coconut
21
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Does the County pay
                                                              21
                                                                       Creek. You know, as I said, I'd have made it a
22
         anything to Coconut Creek for housing the regional
                                                              22
                                                                       point of not trying to tell the municipality what's
23
                                                              23
                                                                       in its best interests. And that's the same for
         communications there?
24
                                                              24
             MS. HENRY: Yes.
                                                                       Coconut Creek or the same for Coral Springs. So
```

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. Is it going to cost

25

that will be a questions that should be asked of

24

25

```
Page 86
                                                                                                                 Page 87
         them.
                                                                       this issue. Everybody steps on that podium and
 1
                                                               1
 2
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Last question, I asked you
                                                               2
                                                                       says they are a willing partner. They want to fix
 3
         this before it's a little bit of a hard question
                                                               3
                                                                       this, they want to make it work. I'm quite frankly
 4
                                                                       tired of the finger pointing. This commission
         but you answered it before that you were not
                                                               4
 5
         supportive so I'm going to ask you again today --
                                                               5
                                                                       found numerous, numerous failures that led to the
 6
         you know, two years later. Is this the question
                                                               6
                                                                       Marjory Stoneman Douglas massacre.
                                                               7
 7
         came up about transferring the responsibility that
                                                                           Communications was one of those failures, and
         is now - ORCAT on the technology side. We already
                                                               8
                                                                       you own that. You-all own that. So I guess if I
 9
         know Broward Sheriff's Office is responsible for
                                                               9
                                                                       had a question, how many more people have to die
10
         the operation, the personnel, and regional
                                                              10
                                                                       before you adults get in a room and fix this?
11
         communications responsible on the technology side
                                                              11
                                                                           MS. HENRY: Zero.
12
         and all of the heart if you will, aspects of it.
                                                              12
                                                                           MR. SWEARINGEN: It doesn't appear that way.
13
                                                              13
         Is that your position today that transferring it
                                                                           MS. HENRY: Well, again, I apologize that
14
         over to BSO is it the same you don't support it, or 14
                                                                       appears that way. Again, I will once again say
15
         are you willing to consider it, or you do support
                                                              15
                                                                       that there has been an enormous amount of time and
16
         it ,where are you at?
                                                              16
                                                                       energy and money that were put in place just to
17
             MS. HENRY: I don't -- I don't support it.
                                                              17
                                                                       create a system that is commensurate with the
18
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. All right, Mr.
                                                              18
                                                                       community that we serve. And, you know, when we
19
                                                              19
         Swearinger.
                                                                       were here before and it was about the system wasn't
20
             MR. SWEARINGER: Thank you, Chair.
                                                              20
                                                                       up and running, it didn't work. Today, the system
21
             I have a statement more than a question, and I
                                                              21
                                                                       is up and running. No small feat. Two systems are
22
         -- this probably applies to most of us on this
                                                              22
                                                                       actually up and running, no small feat.
23
         commission. I'm frustrated and disappointed in the
                                                              23
                                                                           So I'm uncomfortable saying that nothing has
24
         testimony that I've heard today because I feel like
                                                              24
                                                                       happened and that it's, you know, that we're going
25
                                                              25
         the same thing we heard the last time we addressed
                                                                       to -- in the same place that we were in before. I
                                                  Page 88
                                                                                                                 Page 89
 1
         just -- I don't believe that to be the case. 100
                                                               1
                                                                       for one second that you-all haven't worked to make
 2
                                                                       it better. I don't doubt that but it's not
         percent up time is our goal, not because it's to
                                                               2
 3
         support the community. And I indicated that, you
                                                               3
                                                                       working.
 4
         know, there is no -- I have no specific -- there's
                                                                           I don't know where the technological piece ends
                                                               4
 5
         nothing that -- that I have heard from either side
                                                               5
                                                                       and human relations begin and, you know, who is
 6
         that I would say is wrong. We just have -- we're
                                                               6
                                                                       protecting what terf . And I want to harkin back to
 7
                                                               7
         trying to get to the same place where both sides
                                                                       our system and that's the only one I can talk about
 8
         are comfortable that they can deliver to their
                                                               8
                                                                       is mine. We run a regional system. If it doesn't
 9
         constituents. So I apologize if it seems not to
                                                               9
                                                                       work for the chief -- the fire chiefs and the
10
         be, but there's been a lot done.
                                                              10
                                                                       police chiefs -- if it doesn't work for the people
                                                              11
11
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Sheriff Judd.
                                                                       of the whole county, they don't have to worry about
12
             MR. JUDD: You know, if I was in your position
                                                              12
                                                                       who to deal with. The next time at the ballot box
13
         as the administrator of a county this size with all
                                                                       they can chop my head off and bring somebody else
                                                              13
14
         the many things you have to do. I would like to be
                                                                       in who'll get it done. I recognize that. I have
                                                              14
15
         able to have 100 percent of that system responsible
                                                              15
                                                                       that relationship with the County Clerk -- County
16
         to some individual other than me so that when
                                                              16
                                                                       Manager and County Commissioner.
         police chiefs, fire chiefs came together and said
                                                              17
                                                                           And they're phenomenal. We're not back here
17
18
         this is not working for us, it's not working for
                                                              18
                                                                       saying, Well, we checked this and it was safe to do
19
         the community, it's not working for the citizens,
                                                              19
                                                                       that. All of that crap goes by the sidelined
20
         that that one person has the authority to make all
                                                              20
                                                                       because I bring them together and I go, Do it. Do
21
                                                              21
         the police chiefs and fire chiefs and sheriffs
                                                                       it. And if a police chief or fire chief's not
22
         happy. It seems unfair that -- that this -- all
                                                              22
                                                                       happy, why isn't he happy? Make him happy, get a
```

23

24

25

rolls up to you but it does under the current

systems. I don't know that it's possible on the

current system, and quite frankly, I don't doubt

Yes. But as in your position I -- I understand

personally manage that one entity. When you've got

that you -- you've got so much to do that to

Page 91

Page 90 literally dozens and dozens and dozens of things that are of equal importance in another realm or another world. I don't know why you struggled with keeping control of that. I would give it to somebody that had to be directly accountable and -- and it would be up to them. Either you succeed. If you don't succeed, and you fail then they take care of you.

I'm -- I'm pushing off on the sheriff and saying, It's yours, Sheriff. And I want to look at a budget line item, and if it doesn't work. And we hear from the city managers and city commissioners then the failure is not on us it's on the Sheriff. I think that's why it works where it works. It's because there's only one person, and quite frankly, the cities can be upset with you. You can be giving your best effort but you -- or not. And I'm not suggesting that you're not but they can't do anything about it.

Until they get a critical mass removed from the county commission and put a new mass on the commission that deals with you, that deals with the person that's in charge of it. You see, it's just -- it's caught up in bureaucracy that just is not in the best interest of the people who need

emergency services in Broward County. The system needs to be streamlined, the system and the processes that the administration need to be streamlining and there needs to be laser pointed accountability. And if I were you I would want to shed that to the person that will have be directly accountable to the people and to -- not only to the taxpayers but to the victims and their families. That's how it works in my piece of the world, and it works really well because I really listen and I could make a decision because of the different structures. I can make a decision at an administrative table, that you can't make because you've got to reconcile that with commissions with -- to give you permission. All I've got to do is say, is this what the fire chief wants? Is this in the best interest of the people ? Yes. Good. And

So understand, I don't -- I understand you - you're boxed in with the system that you have for this to work. And do you, by your own admission, I think you've been remarkably professional and remarkably open with us and I'm so very impressed with that. The system as it is constructed today is not constructed to work in the best interest of

they start marching to that this moment.

Page 92

everyone because of the accountability system -the necessary accountability system under -- under
county government.

MS. HENRY: I think it's important and I hate - I hate to start to take everybody back historically, but the county owned and managed the technology system. We said, okay, we will transfer this responsibility over to the Sheriff, and I was here throughout this whole time. I was here when we managed it on our own, I was here when we transferred it to the Sheriff, and I'm -- and I'm still here when it came back. So I'm not -- you know, it's great that things worked that way, but one of the reasons it came back was because cities were unhappy. They asked us to take it back, and we did.

So I -- I don't want -- I -- you know -- I -- this is -- it's -- it's difficult for me because I've heard from a chief or two. I've heard from a lot of chiefs, police, and fire, who have said to me, this system is working so much better now. That's what they tell me. Why do they tell me something different? They haven't been shy in the past to criticize, but that's not what I hear. So right now, we're judging the system because today

Page 93 we have not solved the issue with Coral Springs.

And -- and I'm hoping that that issue, when everybody recognizes that we all have -- we take our respective responsibilities to heart, just like I will never say that he's not -- that he shouldn't take the position that he's taking -- taken. But I hope that there is an appreciation that if we are in a position where you've got 1.2 million people that need to make sure that this system is up, is -- like -- because I said, our goal is up -- it is a 100 percent up-time.

And so we're going to do whatever we can to make sure, and -- and -- and today we're not denying the opportunity for the Coral Springs hub solution to be tested. We're saying let's find a way to do that so both sides can make sure that we're all comfortable that we're not put in harm's way. So I -- I -- I would hope that we don't continue to judge the system hypothetically. That we solved a bunch of problems, then there's a new problem, and now the system is a failure. It's very disappointing to me.

MR. JUDD: I would not have done that. I have seen anyone march in here and be complimentary of it. It didn't -- I mean, we're -- we're here.

Page 94

MS. HENRY: Well, if -- if you want me to have them come, I'm happy to do that because we would -- weren't asked to do it.

MR. JUDD: The problem is that we are confronted with this. It's not our problem really to solve. But you're troubling when it doesn't seem to get better.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Well, it is -- it is and it isn't -- it is part of -- you know, when you look at the statutory requirements of this commission and make recommendations of things is certainly within the purview of this commission to address --. But in fairness, this discussion is not just about this current Coral Springs situation. You know, when you hear -- you know, Chief Rosa talk about how well things are better today because I actually get returned phone calls. And you know that they -- there was disfunction previously, and people were not communicating they were not talking - talking about the distrust. This is bigger than just the Coral Springs issue. Are some of them satisfied? Some were satisfied, yeah. There are some who were satisfied but it's also the official position you heard from the president of the police chief's association that their position is it

Page 95 should go over to the sheriffs. You know again you have diversion views you have very diverging community and that's what you're going to have you know, you provided the history again about back and forth and are there was also another -- another sheriff who -- a different sheriff who went back and forth?

MS. HENRY: Absolutely.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Right and so different environment. What you would probably say to that what you would probably say is, Okay. Well, we'll try again and we'll turn it over to this sheriff. Well, what happens when he leaves and you get another sheriff? Then we're going to play this ping pong thing and that of course is the concern but is that you know at some point in time is you know who ultimately has to make that decision? In the structure of Broward County government that a county administrator decision or is that a board county commissioner's decision?

MS. HENRY: To transfer the responsibility to another constitutional officer? That would be the Board of county Commissioners.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. Just curious. Is that in the structure I know you don't support it

Page 96

but my question is who ultimately is responsible for making that decision.

Mr. Petty. Go ahead.

MR. PETTY: I wasn't sure whether to wait until we hear from Sheriff Tony or to make a comment now. But I share the frustration Mr. Swearinger has. I think -- I do want to thank you , Ms. Henry, for being here today. I'm pleased to hear that the new radio system is up -- fifteen-sixteenths, I think. It's been two years. You mentioned that you hope the next time you're here that these issues will be solved. It was my hope that this time they would be solved. And I don't say this to scare anyone else or disparage anyone that's made a different decision that this was one of the issues. One of the reasons I've moved from Broward County. I've lost a loved one here, and I'm not going to lose another one.

And the same attitude I saw two years ago, this inability to find common ground and to find a way to solve this persists today. It's infuriating. Broward doesn't have a technology interoperability problem. It has a leadership problem, and I'm not test -- pointing a finger at you, Ms. Henry. This goes beyond just you. And, Sheriff, I don't know -

Page 97
- I don't know if this is an appropriate request or not, but I think what we may have to do is to convene as commission in closed session because there are security and sensitivity and issues, and then we decide to bring all the parties together, sit them down at a table, and work through these leadership issues until we get a resolution here because until this is fixed, the citizens in Broward County are at risk.

The first responders that risk their lives day in and day out doing their jobs are at risk. And this community is at risk of another tragedy. And I don't know how else to say it. I do this for a living. I build software. That software has to be interoperable with other software systems. This is easy to solve. From a technology perspective, it's a simple problem to solve. In fact, to use the sheriff's example, in the private sector, if I don't find a way to work with a partner I go out of business. So I -- you know, this is long past needing to be solved, Mr. Chair, and I will, you know, I would offer up the idea - I'm willing ot travel back down to Broward County and sit here at the table and listen to all the technological discussions and try to find a way to get this done.

Page 98

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 99

But I think that may be the only way to get this 1 2 done because the way that is is structured 2 3 currently in Broward county, and this is not going 3 4 to be resolved. 4 5 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Mr. Carroll. 5 6 MR. CARROLL: Just a comment because I do 6 7 7 concur with you on one point in that Broward County 8 has made progress because the way I see it when we 8 9 initially in the began this there was two major 9 10 findings. One of them was the failure of the radio 10 11 system not just during this tragedy but in the 11 12 airport incident that preceded it and I do think 12 13 based on your testimony today that the radio issue 13 14 has been greatly improved and has actually stood up 14 15 under a more recent incident. I know the county 15 16 made significant investment in that I know the 16 17 issue with the tower I'm as frustrated as everybody 17 18 else that politics got involved in that and has 18 19 19 dragged it out so long that the sixteenth tower 20 because of a jurisdictional and terf issue between 20 21 a city and a county couldn't be resolved. But I do 21 22 think the radio issue has vastly improved from what 22 23 it was, at least when this incident occurred. 23 24 The second one, though, was that the 24

communication gaps that took place between the two jurisdictions. And the reason we're here, at least I, I feel so much urgency in this is that it impacts the jurisdiction where the tragedy took place. And I guess if I was in Parkland, and was a citizen of Parkland, and had kids in schools in Parkland , I would be a little frustrated now because while I acknowledge the progress the county has made in that jurisdictions, that same issues still exists. Now. I did hear testimony that there have been band-aids put in place that's improved it a little bit but there isn't a long-term solution in place. I don't question anybody's motives because I think everybody's acting in what they think is with the right intentions. I agree with you that I absolutely won't put the system at risk because it means to be up 100 percent of the time. I agree with that totally but I do agree with Commissioner Swearingen that I don't know what it takes to get folks in a room and get through that issue cause I do think it's solvable and I don't understand why there isn't more urgency to get that piece fixed...

Now, I'm going to ask you one question cause it was all commentary. Why do you - and I know the

Page 100

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

history because you just shared the history with us , how it's gone back and forth. Do you have a strong belief other than that history on where the command and control of that system should lie. I mean do you think it's better with the county or do you think it's better under the sheriff or do you just accept that it should be with the county based on the history of it getting passed back and forth?.

communication gaps and the timing of those

MS. HENRY: So I look at where we are today and today I think it's better under the county. We have been building onto the relationship with the sheriff's office and I think that that relationship is all significantly better and we'll continue to work, edit, and make it even better. But if you're asking me today where the expertise lies to keep a system -- this -- at this level up and running where it should be, I think it's where it is -- I think it should be where it is and there could be a manager down the road or whomever would have a different opinion.

But right now we're building this system and we're trying -- you know, we got 16 towers site that need to get up and running. I just don't feel like, you know, starting to -- just going back and

Page 101 forth is productive. I want to get it up and running. I want the community to be proud. This issue with Coral Springs, I think, will be -- it will be solvable if both sides are appreciative of the issue that we both have and a so, you know, I'm optimistic. And -- and when we talk about the radio system, again, I would have to ask you guys -- it wasn't solely -- it wasn't solely the radio system that failed in that tragedy. There were a lot of things that failed in that tragedy. But the focus and the attention and from my opinion rightfully so. And so what where -- where did the county have responsibility? Yeah. So we're -we're making sure that we fix that. But there were others. I mean, that is disingenuous that people think that it was only the radio system that failed.

MR. CARROLL: And when I think if you listen to the hearing yesterday and the Sheriff went over previous --

MS. HENRY: I apologize. I didn't hear -MR. CARROLL: In that hearing yesterday the
sheriff provided testimony and a review of all of
the things that this commission has made
recommendations on and I agree with you. It is over

Page 102 -a sea of issues. But it was - if you saw it and you saw the amount of things that was already actually completed it was pretty staggering . The -- the reason that we're focused on this -- and this is -- this is one of the things that's incomplete because if this is complete it would have been in the - it could be marked off as complete. So this is not an issue of us overfocusing on this area , it's one of the major things that was identified as a gap and it's one of the only major things that's left that still hasn't been addressed. That's why it continues to be an issue. . And -- and I have one more question. Just from a technical standpoint. You - I understand that the IT expertise resides with the county . When the sheriff had it with their domain did they have that same IT expertise housed there or was that shifted back and forth or did the IT expertise --? .

MS. HENRY: So the county's chief of IT
Security was not responsible. Didn't have any real
relationship with the separate constitutional
officer. So the activities and things that
occurred -- occurred solely within the context of
the Sheriff, the constitutional officer.

Page 103

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So, we're about -- this is an important discussion. We're about 40 minutes behind. So, we need to hear from Sheriff Tony. What I'd like to do is take a ten-minute break, but it needs to be a hard ten minutes because we need to make up some time. I know we'll start again with Sheriff Tony. Ms. Henry, I thank you for your - you're retiring in a couple months. I wish you all the best in your retirement I want to thank you over the last three and a half years for being very responsive to me and to this commission.

We've talked many, many times on the phone at all hours of the day and the night sometimes regularly. You've agreed to meet and talk and head on about some tough topics and you've been straight with us, and I appreciate your willingness to engage and I wish you all the best in the future and we look forward to working with your successor. Thank you for being here with us for the last 3 and half years. We'll take 10 minutes it's 10:42 let's say let's begin again at 10:55 sharp please, thank you.

MS. HENRY: Thank you.

(Thereupon, a break was held at 10:42 a.m.; after which, the following proceedings were heard

Page 104

at 10:56 a.m.)

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: We're going to start here in just one minute. If everyone would take their seats, please. All right, so next we have Sheriff Tony. We've got two very important witnesses here today. One, Sheriff Tony and one this afternoon with the school Superintendent. To keeps us on track just for housekeeping unless any of the Commissioners have any objection to this.

I think that, based on where are now schedulewise, we probably won't be breaking for lunch. We're scheduled to break for lunch at noon. It'll probably be 12:30 the way we are going that we'll break for lunch. We are supposed to do an hour for lunch because I know a lot of people have drives back tonight, and I -- is that am thinking we'll just do 30 minutes for lunch and help get us back on schedule and then try and get us out of here on time, at 5 o'clock. Does anybody have any objection to reducing lunchtime to 30 minutes? Okay. All right. So what we'll do our best to get it back. That will be the plan, we'll just do a 30 minute break. Sheriff Tony, welcome. Thank you for being here. I appreciate it. MR. TONY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman, and thank

you to the entire commission for allowing me to come here today and speak. I've had opportunity to listen to all of my colleagues' statements before me, and I know that there's several questions that had already come up related to Sheriff's Office and perhaps in decision-making that I've made. What I'd like to do today without create a new formalized statement. It's just to give you-all an overview of where we are as an organization, the things we've been able to accomplish over the last two years and nine months under my administration.

I think you've noticed in this room today that my entire executive command staff is here. Every single ranking official with decision authority is here today, from Mark Kernels to our Fire Chief.

And I -- I say that because I want this commission to understand that we take every single element that you've recommended and put it into place as a high priority. We've lost a lot of people on our watch, and this organization had a multitude of failures. We accept that, but accepting it is one thing. Action afterwards, is what we should be measured on.

So to discuss some of the actionable things that we've done, I think it's relevant and most

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 106 certainly important to talk about the conclusion of 2 the internal affairs investigations that were 3 related to the failures of law enforcement officers 4 in this organization who took an oath to protect 5 and serve this community. To begin with, I'm going 6 to highlight some of the different elements or 7 these -- the law enforcement personnel that we have to consider in these internal affairs 9 investigations, and then the outcome in terms of 10 the disciplinary actions. 11

Of course, there was Deputy Scott Peterson, who was being investigated for two policy violations. One of which was meeting BSO standards and neglect of duty. Our Professional Standards Committee is a body comprised of both law enforcement and civilians who had the conclusion of internal affairs investigation provide a recommendation for action, meaning Sheriff, we think you should suspend him. Sheriff, we think you should give a written reprimand. Sheriff, we think you might want to terminate him. Under this case involving Deputy Peterson, the Professional Standards Committee recommendation was for termination, and I most certainly concurred, and he was terminated. In terms of Sergeant Brian Miller -- Miller,

Page 108

investigation and all three were being investigated for BSO -- of failing to meet BSO standards and neglect of duty. The first of which was Brian Goolsby, Deputy Mike Trent (phonetic), and Deputy Arthur Perry (phonetic). All three of these deputies who were investigated, were not sustained. Meaning the Professional Standards Committee did not find that there was some level of high liability or violation of policies that would warrant some form of discipline, and no disciplinary action was recommended. And I concurred with that based on the fact findings that we had.

With that being said, let me be clear. There's times when people may not violate a policy, but the expectation has changed here. My expectation for every single law enforcement officer that wear this | 17 star and this badge is that there be zero hesitancy and that they will engage, that they would track down and eliminate any threat that is produced in this school or in the territorial boundaries in this 1300 square-miles county, not negotiable.

Now, with these disciplinary actions taking place, there's always a process of arbitration and these cases have met the arbitration practice. And

Page 107 acting supervisor during that day. He was investigated for two policy of violations, one, meeting BSO standards, and the second, neglect of duty and failure to supervise effectively. Our professional standards committee found and sustained those charges and recommended an action of demotion. I most certainly disagreed with that recommendation and he was terminated.

Deputy Edward Neeson, also investigated for two policy violations, meeting BSO standards and neglect of duty, unsat -- unsatisfactory performance, as well as violation of the body-worn camera protocols. All his actions were sustained. Professional Standards Committee recommended that he receive a 30-day suspension without pay. I most certainly disagreed with that and he was terminated.

Deputy Job Stanpol (phonetic), also investigated for two policy violations. BSO standard -- of meeting BSO standards, neglect of duty. Professional Standards Committee recommended that he be suspended for 30 days without pay. Once again, I disagreed with that and he was terminated.

This brings me to three other additional deputies that were part of the internal affairs

Page 109

unfortunately an arbitrator outside that doesn't even live in this county has elected to make a statement that these employees should be reinstated. The arbitration process is flawed. The arbitrator himself failed to even look at the evidence or even hold a hearing to ensure that they were doing their job to assess and make sure that the actions that we took were consistent and that the failures of these deputies most certainly were justifiable in a sense that we need to terminate them.

I can go on for hours about this process. What I will assure to this co -- community today is that despite the arbitration process, I am still the duly-elected Sheriff of this county and no deputy will ever be reinstated into a school or any area that jeopardizes the public safety. And so if this arbitration process outwins the organization and outwins my decision, I'm still in command of this organization and will do the right thing for this community.

That leads me to transitioning over into the training aspect that I'd like to talk about. I'll -- I'll pause for a moment because there's a lot of content I want to cover. And so if there's any

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Sheriff.

Page 110

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

specific questions about the disciplinary actions that were taken or the arbitration, I'll take those questions now so that we don't have to regurgitate all the different things we're going to cover here. SHERIFF GUALTIERI: I think you're good,

MR. TONY: Thank you, sir.

So we'll continue with the training aspects that's been introduced into this organization. So the core recommendations that were listed with the MSD's commission had highlighted a multitude of different failures from our ability to track, document, and train individuals consistently in active assailant, active killer or active shooter. Those terminologies are all interchangeable. And the first thing that we did was to earmark more than \$250,000 to introduce a software platform -platform system called PowerDMS so that never again will we have the testimony of any officer standing here saying they can't recall the last time that they were trained. Every single training protocol that we introduced in this organization from active killer to what our dispatchers do is now documented and tracked on an annual basis.

Page 111 we wanted to do, which was to expand the capabilities that we had as a law enforcement organization in the skill tree of every single deputy. What do I mean? We end up taking our SWAT team and creating the tactical training unit because those are the most highly trained in skills at the highest skill-set of any law enforcement officers in our organization. It makes sense to create a specialized unit so that we can build up the skills there.

So we have a dedicated team of roughly 12 different tactical training instructors that are all SWAT-certified and have built up this deficiency, so to speak, as to whether or not people knew what the protocols would be and how they were supposed to execute their tasks. In addition to that, we went out and received all the top training that this country can offer when it comes to active shooter preparedness. I'm going to highlight some of them just really quickly.

We've attended and worked with the FBI and gone through the Advanced Law Enforcement Rapo -- Rapid Training, ALERT. We facilitated the Texas State active shooter incident management program. We've completed the Texas A&M engineering extension

Page 112

services. We've gone through the LSU and FEMA program, LASER, Law Enforcement Active Shooter Emergency Response. We also integrated and trained and certified under the Active Threat Integrated Response or ATIR, and then we've also worked internally to create our own different processes in terms of new advanced active shooter response protocols that we have within the organization. Basically a hybrid of everything that we learned

that we've maximized and put into play.

From a training standpoint, one of the things

But we didn't stop there. I personally flew up and partnered with the Department of Homeland Security, going up to the federal officer Training Center and requested that they would send their Instructor -- here to cross-certify our personnel under the Department of Homeland Security or Active Shooter Threats Instructor Program. It is the gold 17 standard here in the United States. It is by which most organizations are training. We now have inhouse instructors in that and all of our deputies have gone through this training.

Since 2019 -- upon accepting command in 2019, we've already had three individual life in-service training related to active shooter response. We'll continue that up. Our models with any active

Page 113 shooter training include group, single officer, and small team-oriented assaults as we would approach an individual facility. Now, what's important here is that we're not sitting by and waiting for anybody. Every single officer, and we'll get to this, is outfitted, trained, and have the necessary tools and skills to enter into a facility and do what they have taken an oath to do.

In addition to that, we created an Incident Response or Active Killer IRAC which is a 16-hour course that we put on all in-house all hands -- or -- all our training is all hands-on. There is no scenario-based, electronic elements when it comes to active shooter. We are focused on doing the things that are essential in the field. I would also have to highlight some of the things that we've done internally in terms of our response protocols. We created a tactical alert protocol where now we're no longer waiting for a dispatcher to determine; let me send one deputy, let me wait for the next deputy to make a call for two deputies, let me wait for another deputy to make the call for three deputies.

We send a strategic amount of five or-plus more different deputies, to any type of tactical

Page 114 situation that is going to warrant more support personnel. In addition to that, one of the things that we did was to consolidate all our special operation resources and created the department's first preparedness and response elements, It's an entire department. We brought training, we brought SWAT, we brought all our specialized units under one umbrella.

And what we did from there was to launch and create a new unit called TITAN. The idea behind TITAN is to not waste resources that are already available to us. TITAN is basically our SWAT team that is now 24/7/365 in the field, and we strategically rotate that personnel out so that they're available. Why is that advantageous and why does that warrant the discussion here in this commission?

These types of incidents that we talked about, like with MSD, these tragedies happen lighting quick. And on average, anywhere in the United States, it takes roughly a 30-minute response for when SWAT is deployed to get on-scene effectively. I have been a SWAT operator. I lived it. I know it at exactly what it looks like and feel like. 30 minutes is too long. And so we created our TITAN

Page 115 unit so that they can strategically deploy throughout this entire academy -- county on a daily basis based on intel and press that we're receiving, whether it be a school, whether it'd be our critical infrastructures such as the port or the airport, our personnel is out there waiting to engage.

And I want to talk briefly about some of that success in terms of having these men and women out here, and what does that look like. When we launched this program in June of 20 -- since we launched this program in June of 2020, we've had over 4,000 incidents, 4,000 deployments of our SWAT team or some hybrid level mitigating things such as canine tracks, backups, traffic stops, physical arrests, and you name it. We are out there, so it is proven to be effective as of today.

In addition, by having them out there, we've been able to reduce the public's harm when we are dealing with a high liability area or someone's shooting up the public. We literally already had it. We have a mentally disturbed individual running around shooting up the community, our --our TITAN team or SWAT teams tactically deployed, was able to narrow this indiv -- individual down,

Page 116

isolate him from hurting anyone. Unfortunately, he pointed the gun at us and then we fired and killed him. All right. But no person was shot, harmed or killed at the will of a deranged individual because we didn't have the necessary assets or tools readily accessible.

With that, I want to talk a little bit about the supplemental aspect, which is the equipment. Equipment is vital for us to succeed. The last time that this Commission did an analysis on what our equipment looked like, it was identified that out of an agency of roughly 1500-plus different sworn law enforcement personnel, we only have roughly 300 outdated rifles available for these men and women to go in and fight the bad guys, so to speak. We've re-allocated over \$3 million of the - the current budget at the time, and now every single deputy has been supplied with this rifle platform short barrel system.

Now, from a tactical standpoint, the systems that are in place with these rifle platforms is at the highest rate. They are the exact same ones the SWAT guys use. These are up to the levels where Navy SEALS will be happy to carry. All right. We didn't pinch any pennies for public safety. In

Page 117 addition to that, we learned from MSD about the importance of tactical combat casual gear, the ability to treat individuals who are suffering from penetrating wounds to the upper torso, gunshot wounds.

So we supplied every single law enforcement officer with a new tactical auto carrier where their IFAK, or the Individual First Aid Kit, are strategically placed on the -- on their person. Meaning, if I arrive on to the scene, I see a gunshot victim, I'm not only capable to get there safely and effectively with firearms, et cetera, but I'm able to get there effectively and treat the individual on-site when it dee -- it is deemed safe.

We've also looked at what do we need to do to sustain this type of training and everything that we've introduced to this organization. For the first time in the agency's 107-year history, we broke ground on a 104,000 square foot training facility, which will be the best in this state. And we have adjustable rooms, we have tactical shooting ranges, we have state-of-the-art classrooms all coming in.

And, Max, you mentioned that there has not been

Page 118
-- I listened to the early testimony you mentioned
-- that there had not been anywhere in this county
that had set up a memorial site to remember and
honor your loved one and all the 17. Well, we
have. Inside of our lobby is a dedicated MSD
Memorial Site that -- which will be available to
the public. We have not lost consideration of the
fact that we failed this community. And I want to
make sure every single one of our men when they
walk into training for the duration of their
career, understand that we failed once and we can't
fail again.

With the training component and the training center, we also have to look at what do we need to do to stay on course with the Guardian Program legislation and the elements that we're responsible for and that I'm responsible for as the sheriff.

And I must say we have introduced over 17 different courses since this program was launched. We end up putting roughly 270 Guardians at some point through the initial training. Here in Broward County, we have 125 active certified Guardians in the Broward County Schools and we'll continue to push this program forward so long as it is part of the responsibility of the Sheriff. What

Page 119
I'd like to do for just a moment, is to pause and speak about some areas of concern specifically I have about the Guardian program and where we're moving forward. I think this is important for this body, and it's important for our elected officials to hear in Tallahassee.

One of the things that we've encountered is, there has been an issue of funding. An issue of funding where we've had to -- on a multitude of times whether it be for equipment, for personnel, whatever it is to sustain this program, we've spent over \$300,000 out of our budget that has not been accounted for by the State. This is the State mandate and it's not fair that this program needs to be run off of the budget of a Sheriff's Office, whereas we're making concessions to keep up this program. I have my own operational things that I'd like to accomplish in this organization, and I can tell you I can -- I have a thousand different things I can spend \$300,000 on other than this program, but it is on my responsibility and so we chall

Another thing I'd like to talk about with the Guardian program about considerations, things that our administration have seen happening which is

Page 120 problematic, is the ability for private sector security companies to introduce personnel to receive Guardian training here in Broward County, and the expectation is that they would stay here in Broward County to safeguard our schools, but we're seeing that that's not happening. We're seeing that we're training people here to protect our Broward County schools and then they find themselves in Duval County or any other type of county here in the State of Florida.

I think that's an injustice to two things. One, the training mandates that we have and the responsibilities we have here in our county. And then also it's an injustice to our school system here. The priority is Broward County. I'm not dismissive of my colleagues in other counties, but I'm the sheriff for Broward County. I don't care about what's going on in a sense of supplying a private sector organization a skill set and tool that they can, later on, monetize and use to serve their organizations in other areas of the state. We need to look at how we can assess that and make some modifications there.

With that, that's a quick call-out with the training aspect and personnel. Is there any

Page 121 specific questions related to training and our equipment that we have introduced or to meet the recommendations and it might - honestly, sir even exceeds some of the recommendations that this committee had put -- put in play.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: No, definitely Sheriff. They've been very significant and I appreciate the update on all of that and -- and all that you've accomplished in the last couple of years. It's off the charts in some respects, and it is significant. Do any of the commissioners have any questions on training? Commissioner Dodd, go ahead.

MR. DODD: Thank you, Sheriff. So we heard Ms. Henry talk a little bit about radio systems. She started out talking with the capacity issues with the school district and getting them off the radio site. The throttling that took place. We know you have a new radio system in place, equipment-wise. Radio for your -- for your officers, your first responders. So I'm just curious, what is your confidence level, in case of another large-scale event, that your radio system won't crash or won't throttle? I mean, we're all past that now, or -- what's your confidence level?

MR. TONY: I think we've had a lot of success

Page 122 since the -- really, let me just say something real quick before I answer that question. The biggest complication we have here in this county is our ecosystem of leadership, okay? From myself to the county administrator to the Broward County Chiefs of Police to the school board. When this committee had introduced its recommendations, without any intent behind it, it almost created a -- a self-surviving element where every single entity wanted to do what they needed to do to safeguard and fix their problems.

But everyone's problems intersected, they all do. And so with communications, we went to the radio systems as you've heard, the P25. We made the inter-operability things work and be more functional for Coral Springs. But we're still going to have issues with certain parts of our county that had their own independent systems and that ability to integrate with the regional authorization system. It's inevitable but, to what degree? I don't think we're going to have the type of catastrophic failures that we've seen on MSD. But how do we measure them? Is it okay to have a ten percent failure? Not if it's your kid. Is it okay for five percent?

Page 124

accepting command, and has been led up - led up from Captain Regio, who's our commander in this facility. Our real-time crime center is roughly 2,700 square feet. It's got a 40-plus wall monitor screen and a 16-foot-plus monitor screen where we're able to track and monitor up to 10,000 camera systems across 266 schools. And we have seen an enormous amount of success there. And I'm going to get into the success, but I'm most certainly going to talk about the shortcomings because there are shortcomings and they need to be discussed here today and they need to be rectified.

More back-history behind this real-time crime center, it's led up through our threat management division, our threat management unit. It's comprised of the captain all the way down to the ranks of crime analysis, and we've also incorporated four behavioral licensed therapists into that team. And their responsibility is to help us with follow-up when we'd see the likes of an individual getting 20 or 30 different calls for services and exhibiting signs that they may introduce some type of harm like we've seen with the assailant on MSD.

One of the things that we also did was to open

Page 123
So, I'm going to get more into communications
but I -- I think, in general, I'm confident that
we're in a much better position, but I'm most
certainly not complacent and no one, from the
school board to the chiefs of police, they better
not be complacent. Complacency is how we got here.
Does that make sense, sir?

MR. DODD: Yes.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: I know you're going to talk more about communications. Does anybody have anything on training -- on the training that Sheriff covered. Otherwise, we'll let him go ahead and move on to the next topic. Anybody -- anything else? All right. Go ahead.

MR. TONY: Thank you Mr. Chairman. To continue on, one of the things that we wanted to make sure we -- we did was learn from the lessons and the impact of trying to use camera systems and technologies. We've seen the failures there. We -- didn't know if the assailant was on the first floor, if he was on the second floor, is he still on site?

And so we've invested -- we've invested in creating our real-time crime center. Our real-time crime center was launched shortly after me

Page 125 up the doors and allow access and partnership to all municipal law enforcement organizations in this county. So everyone has an opportunity to sit at the table and many of our municipal partners have already joined because we have a multitude of different councils. We've also incorporated — the United States Secret Service has an agent assigned, the FBI, and I believe we also have the ATF working with us in this facility. That helps mitigate any communication issues related to the threats that the Bureau may be receiving, Secret Service, or any other federal organization. Now, we're all in one room, sitting together and working.

To speak about the effectiveness of what's been going on inside of this real-time crime center, and what the threat management team has been able to do. From the time that we launched this, our threat management detectives have investigated — investigated 955 cases and made 153 arrests related to those different investigations. You don't hear about them on TV, they're not highlighted. We don't want to put it out there. But over 153-plus individuals have been arrested based on that threat management unit either receiving intel and information from our schools or from some — or

Page 126

some other community stakeholder. And we've acted on this, on behalf of the community's safety.

One of the things I'd like to highlight and this is fairly new, we're coming up to a year today. We started this in October 2020. When we saw the need to introduce the licensed therapists into this program, we -- what we wanted to do was to ensure that when we had contact with the individual in the field that exhibited some form or signs or symptoms of mental illness, and the potential to be a threat to the community, is we didn't want to just have our baseline patrol officers walk away and say, 'Well, I don't have anything I can arrest them. It's not a problem today. That's a failed approach, it doesn't work. It didn't work in this set of circumstances.

Our behavioral licensed therapists have been out on 212 cases out in the field engaging. And their responsibility is to ensure that we find some form of treatment protocol for those individuals who are willing to participate in that partnership where we had 63 levels of what I identify as client success. Out of 212, 63-plus individuals were --were transported or barreled over into some form of mental health program. And we continue to track,

Page 127
we continue to make sure that we're engaging. We
literally go out to their homes -- we literally go
out to their residence and continue to work with
them and understand what's going on and how the
dynamics are changing.

With that, I want to pivot really quickly and talk about the issues we had with this real-time crime center. In fact, it's not an issue with our facility, it's an issue with our partners that we have. Back in August of 2019, I sent out a letter to every single principal including the superintendent and all parties connected, from his security personnel, I think it was Mr. Katz (phonetic) at the time, outlining the importance to get these schools online to be compatible with our camera systems and our ability to track the camera system.

What do I mean? One of the things we wanted to do was uniformly label cameras and those systems so that we are consistently calling out on the radio or communicating to personnel with language that we all understood so that it can -- it's -- speed up the process of our response. The letter went out in August of 2019, and we're still having roughly 500-plus, almost 600-plus different schools who

Page 128

have not yet had this done. It's unacceptable. It's unacceptable for the things that we've been able to accomplish as an organization, Mr. Chairman, you made mention of it, it's astonishing -- it's -- it's -- it's remarkable with these men and women behind me, have been able to accomplish in an agency with over 5,800 employees responsible for safeguarding 1.9 million people, and we're

I didn't put in a request for funding, I didn't put in a request for manpower. I said our people will go and support this effort. Let's get it done. And we are still fighting this issue.

still begging our partners to do their end.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So -- so Sheriff on that for everybody just for, you know, pointing it out too because the superintendent will be here this afternoon and we need to ask her about this.

So back in 2018, if you-all recall, is -- was that the Broward County Sheriff's Office had no police department here in Broward County that had live real-time access to any of the schools' cameras. That led to the debacle at Stoneman Douglas where there was a 20-minute delay because nobody knew how to operate the camera systems and no law enforcement agency had real-time access.

Page 129

It was the position of the superintendent and the then school board attorney that, legally, they could not provide access and they refused access, which is just legally a wrong decision. Now, the agencies have had access live real-time, and there's a number of ways under FERPA that that is permissible. After we emphatically stressed to them the importance, Broward Sheriff's Office was - and I'd say begrudgingly given access.

So what Sheriff Tony is talking about, and so you -- everybody especially non-law enforcement people in the commission to understand this is -- is that in the real-time crime center, at X school, when they get that call of the active shooter -- because the cameras aren't mapped, which means you've got all these thousands of cameras, and so when you're looking at a camera at a certain school and they're seeing somebody with a gun, they know what hallway they in -- they're in. They know what classroom they're in, they know what building so they can guide the responding law enforcement officers.

So today, two years later, the Broward County Sheriff's Office has over 500 cameras. That, if today the call comes in at X school and there's an

```
Amended
                                                                                                                Page 131
                                                  Page 130
         active shooter and they're looking at that camera
                                                                        is one of the unmapped cameras, those deputies and
                                                               1
 2
         and they see the guy with a gun, they have no idea
                                                                2
                                                                        the responding officers from Coral Springs or
 3
         where in that school that camera is. They can't
                                                                3
                                                                        wherever else who are going there, they can't tell
 4
         direct the responding officers because those
                                                                4
                                                                        them where the shooter is because they don't know
 5
         cameras haven't been mapped despite the letter that
                                                                5
                                                                        what that camera is viewing today. So, there you
 6
         Sheriff Tony sent to then-Superintendent Runcie,
                                                                6
 7
                                                                7
         and he sent out to the individual principals. Do I
                                                                           MR. TONY: Let me also add a point of interest
         have that correct here?
                                                                8
                                                                       here. Okay. It's not only a matter of sending
 9
             MR. TONY: That -- that -- that is correct.
                                                               9
                                                                        letters that we have access to these cameras. Time
10
         And they -- all this was sent out on August 16th of
                                                              10
                                                                        is of the essence and the ability to know exactly
11
                                                                        where the shooter is is going to cut down minutes
12
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So, and -- and -- and I
                                                               12
                                                                        in our response, not seconds, not -- it's -- it's
13
         have a list of those schools and the quantity of
                                                               13
                                                                        really going to just -- excuse me, it's going to
14
         the cameras at the schools. And I'm not going to
                                                              14
                                                                        cut down viable seconds if nothing else. But the
15
         publicly disclose them because it's a -- it's a
                                                              15
                                                                        bigger problem is, is this commission convenes, and
16
         security vulnerability. But one of the ones I'm
                                                              16
                                                                        then the activities for our adjusted cameras
17
         going to tell you -- this just blows my mind --
                                                              17
                                                                        started yesterday at MSD.
18
         where there are still today unmapped cameras. So,
                                                               18
                                                                           MR. SCHACHTER: Yesterday?
19
         if there's a call today at Stoneman Douglas High
                                                               19
                                                                           MR. TONY: Yesterday, okay.
20
         School, there are unmapped cameras at Stoneman
                                                              20
                                                                           I'm not here to play politics, folks. My job
 21
         Douglas High School.
                                                               21
                                                                        is to safeguard this community. If someone's
22
             So, if, God forbid, the situation replicated
                                                               22
                                                                        feelings is going to get hurt, I couldn't care
23
         itself and there was an active shooter in Stoneman
                                                              23
                                                                        less. We've been going at this for too long and
24
         Douglas and the Broward County Sheriff's office is
                                                               24
                                                                        I'm tired of writing letters. I'm doing my job --
25
                                                               25
         responding, and the camera they see the shooter on
                                                                        my men and women are doing the job that I've tasked
                                                                                                                Page 133
                                                  Page 132
 1
         them to do but we are only going to be as strong as
                                                               1
                                                                        sure we had the most advanced software tracking
 2
         our weakest link in this county. And until
                                                                        mechanism on the -- that would be compatible with
                                                                2
 3
         everybody gets on board, our -- and then there's --
                                                                3
                                                                        what the school had so that we can have exact GPS
 4
         there's an opportunity here, we have an intern
                                                                        pointing that would coincide with the SaferWatch or
                                                                4
 5
         superintendent who just took over, and perhaps this
                                                                5
                                                                        the Alyssa's Law that was passed.
 6
         is something that drives and gets going and -- and
                                                                6
                                                                            Scenario: Legislation was passed. We now know
 7
                                                                7
         there's a clear understanding, but for the -- for
                                                                        that we can get these different panic buttons
                                                                        assistance in our schools. The school board
 8
         the folks who are watching this and you are
                                                               8
 9
         residents of our -- of our community, you should be
                                                               9
                                                                        contracts up with SaferWatch as one of the
10
         appalled that we're having this conversation and
                                                               10
                                                                        different providers. The ability to actually hit a
11
         that we, as the -- the largest public safety
                                                              11
                                                                        panic button was uploaded to 29,475 Broward County
12
         provider in this county, is not getting the level
                                                               12
                                                                        school employees. It's already happened. Only
13
         of cooperation and expedience that we need out of
                                                               13
                                                                        4,445 have chosen to put in the necessary updates
14
                                                                        on their phone. It's an app. I'm not asking you
         ground zero. It happened here.
                                                              14
15
                                                              15
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So, you talked about having
                                                                        to build an Apple phone. It's an app, 4,445,
16
         that issue, you -- you know, you talked about
                                                               16
                                                                        that's 15 percent. That means 25,030 employees
17
         unmapped cameras, but don't -- you also have an
                                                              17
                                                                       have not done this basic step.
18
         issue with getting GPS coordinates for the existing
                                                              18
                                                                            What does that do for us by uploading this
19
                                                               19
                                                                        simple app on your phone? If you're standing
20
             MR. TONY: And that's my follow-up --
                                                               20
                                                                        outside Building 1200 on a campus ground that's God
 21
                                                               21
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay.
                                                                        knows how many acres, and you press your panic
22
             MR. TONY: -- Mr. Chairman, we -- we're also
                                                               22
                                                                        button that there's a potential threat, our system
23
         talking about the investment. We spent roughly
                                                               23
                                                                        that we spent $2.5 million, will identify not only
24
                                                               24
```

\$2.5 million in that real-time crime center with

our partners with Motorola and many others to make

25

where you are located, but it will activate the

camera above you, so that we know exactly where you

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page are. We can see the injury, we can see the shooter, and this isn't being done. And there's been some frustration up here.

A lot of people had some pa -- some passionate things to say and I -- and I understand, and I get it. But you're most certainly going to hear my frustration as well. We're doing the things that we need to do as an organization, and one of our partners is failing this community. And I, like many in this room, and all my commanders, we have our nieces and nephews and kids and family members working in these schools. It's just not a -- it's not just a job for us. We live here. And so, I would argue to -- or at least challenge this -this body to really get involved and pose those questions as to why are we still delaying inside the school board with these issues?

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Just for the record, sir, the -- the reason why they started fixing this yesterday is -- is that when I -- because one of the things I have not done throughout this whole process in the last three-and-a-half-years is ever played a gotcha with anybody. I don't do that, don't operate that way. And so, when I learned of this issue, I shared it with the school district.

Page 135 So, you know, when we would hear these things is that everybody gets hold of what to expect. If there's anybody that's coming in here that's getting sandbagged. There's nobody just coming in here that doesn't have a full disclosure and they're provided with everything.

So, you know, when this comes up this afternoon you can ask the superintendent about it. But when I heard of this in -- last week I provided that information about this issue to the district. So -- but again then -- then -- then you know it goes back to here we go again, and we've talked about this this afternoon. Is -- is that the only time that these things tend to get resolved is at one of these commissions meeting, so that begs the questions about what needs to be done on long-term. So, go ahead, Sheriff.

-- or were there any other questions on that? SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Mr. Schachter, go ahead. MR. SCHACHTER: Sheriff Tony, so I'm just a little confused on -- I understand that there's only 18 percent of Broward County School teachers that have the Alyssa's Alert panic app on their phone. Now, you were just talking about that if

MR. TONY: So, I'll meander over and move into

Page 136

they push the button, that triggers the camera in the real-time crime center. Is that feature a -is the school board and the previous superintendent giving you problems, or was that just a function of the teachers downloading the app on the phone?

MR. TONY: The answer is D: All of the above. Because we're still having to try to get the camera system GPS systems up to speed the way we want it, and that's not happening fast enough in my opinion.

MR. SCHACHTER: Would that --

MR. TONY: That process -- I'm sorry about that. That process falls on the school board to get their teachers and the principal, and -- and site directors, so to speak, onboard to get us in these rooms to help get this done. We're not asking them to do it. We're not saying that they're going to spend money out of their \$3.5-plus | 17 billion budget. We just need access to do it. So

The second side of it is, is what type of leadership approach is being taken to get these individuals to log on, to download this app. And I get that I'm in a different position as a constitutional officer. If I tell my folks to do it, they're going to do it or they're going to be

Page 137 fired. But we're talking about a public safety concern that impacts over a quarter million students and over 30,000-plus employees under that school district.

We scroll on our phones all day as a society. Can't take the time to download an app that may save your life? And if the individuals don't take on that level of social responsibility, then, as a leader, I'm going to do what I can in my authority to make sure it happens. And that's what my expectations would be of anyone who is responsible for that type of leadership and -- and public safety.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Mr. Dodd, go ahead. MR. DODD: What -- what kind of input did the school board seek from your office in regards to Alyssa's Law when they decided to go with this platform, the SaferWatch platform? Did -- did youall have to get it --

MR. TONY: We -- our team have been involved, from our Threat Management Division working with the school board as well as our SRO -- our command over SROs -- of Tony DeMarco. So, it's not that there hasn't been inclusion, but I don't need to sit at the table to talk. That doesn't get

said --?

Page 138

are

Pages 138..141

Page 139
should be universal amongst anyone who is responsible for safeguarding anyone, let alone kids.

MR. DODD: It's hard -- I mean -- it's somehow logical that teachers aren't going to want to put something on their personal device. Maybe there's resistance to that. The idea that they may be

For whatever reason, this has been obstructed.

And this request didn't happen three months ago,
four months ago. This has been going on for
several months. So, it's gone from one
administration that Superinten -- Superintendent
Runcie was responsible for it and now it's
lateraled over.

anything done. We're the subject matter experts in

generated on expertise, public safety, and what is

facility. If that simple request is we need you to

work with us to access a clicking point on a camera

to ensure that the GPS is activated so that should

one of your employees activate this app, we would

be able to know in exact proximity to where they

the room. We present a solution to a problem

going to enhance the overall security of the

tracked, all these different thoughts come into play, right? Yeah, but there's other platforms out there. Like In our district, we have a platform where it goes with our ID badge that we all have in our school district. And, you know, you press this button and it -- it locates you in the school that's -- in the school. And if you go to another school, it still will track you. So, if -- when you press the button, that is, when you're -- when you need help, you need to lock the school down, you need to alert the 911 Center, those -- that's an option. So, I -- I guess you say only 15 percent of the teachers. Is -- is that what you

So, the transition of responsibility -- the responsibility is going to someone else, but you know what, I transitioned into this position, and I took ownership of every single failure of my predecessor. I didn't blame him. I said it's mine now and I'm going to act to do the things for the betterment of this community. That should be universal. There's nothing special about me. That

MR. TONY: Fifteen percent of the Broward County school board employee base out of 29,000-plus that have already -- this has been uploaded, it's available -- have yet to put the platform or

Page 141

download the app into their systems, which would be advantageous to their own health and security. Not mine. I'm not going to be in the school. I'll be

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. I'm glad that somebody is.

thing from the very beginning.

advantageous to their own health and security. Not mine. I'm not going to be in the school. I'll be responding, but I'm not going to be in it.

So, these types of things are -- is perplexing and -- and it's highly frustrating. And I get

MR. TONY: Our -- our -- our family reunification -- if you don't laugh, you'll cry. All right. Our family reunification policy has been in place for quite some time, and it consists of response protocols, who's going to be deployed and then we've also taken an added step to make sure out of our 17 different districts or so that we're responsible for, that we've strategically located at least two site locations that will be dedicated for that particular area. So, at Dania Beach we have two, at Cooper City we have two, all the way through all our different responsibilities.

So, these types of things are -- is perplexing and -- and it's highly frustrating. And I get unions and I get all these different things but when I've had to fight my unions in -- in our organization for the sake of public safety, I did so, and then I mended those relationships. But you do what's right for the community. Any -- anything else on that element?

In addition to that, we've invested into procuring a deployable trailer system that would house all the fundamental equipment that we would need to be able to document, track, upload, deploy different software packages, house family members in tents, have food services available, and then keep them up-to-date. We also created an online family reunification database that affords our personnel, -- of roughly 30 members. Thirty members who have been trained in this ability to be

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Go ahead.

MR. TONY: Good to go. The next thing I want to talk about is family reunification and the efforts and things that we've -- put in place multiple policies to make sure that we were much more responsive should we have any type of crisis intervention or major tragedy that would take place. One of the things that we've done --

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Sorry to interrupt you,
when -- when -- did you implement your

23 reunification policy any quicker than -- within the 24 last two weeks?

24 last two weeks?
25 MR. TONY: No, sir.

MR. TONY: No, sir. We've been on top of this

```
Page 143
                                                 Page 142
         able to upload as we go because things change in
                                                                       agency contacted by the school district to help
                                                               1
 2
         the field as we know. And it's important for us to
                                                               2
                                                                       them with their reunification policy?
 3
         be able to keep this up to speed so that family
                                                               3
                                                                           MR. TONY: Yes. So, we were --
 4
         members are not running around during a crisis
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: When -- when --
                                                               4
 5
         trying to figure out what's the next thing for them
                                                               5
                                                                           MR. TONY: We were --
 6
         to do? What's the next procedural aspect that's
                                                               6
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: When was that?
 7
         about to take place?
                                                               7
                                                                           MR. TONY: We were contacted back in August,
 8
             All these things I've outlined, just quick
                                                               8
                                                                       perhaps the second week of August, to support the -
 9
         highlights of some of the things that we're talking
                                                               9
                                                                       - the -- the -- excuse me, the development of their
10
         about and the deployable sense in the trailers are
                                                                       own family reunification policy.
                                                              10
11
         some of the basic elements. But it will go a long
                                                              11
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: August of --
12
         way for rolling bins, dry-erase boards, extension
                                                              12
                                                                           MR. TONY: That was August of 2021.
13
                                                              13
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Oh. Now did -- did -- yeah
         cords, power strips, a multitude of car tents so
14
         that we can identify different families with
                                                              14
                                                                       like, after I called them?
15
         different important roles in blue, red, yellow, and
                                                             15
                                                                           MR. TONY: I would imagine so.
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay.
16
         green. Coolers, food, chairs, clipboard, pack
                                                              16
17
         pens. Over 10,000-plus different numbered IV or
                                                              17
                                                                           MR. TONY: So, yeah. But we -- we have
18
         information carts where we can be able to
                                                              18
                                                                       participated in that process. We've provided some
19
                                                              19
         categorize both the family members and keep them
                                                                       feedback. But the end product of whatever they
20
         together, and many other facets have taken place.
                                                              20
                                                                       produced is theirs to own. The last thing and I
21
         But our family reunification policy has been in
                                                              21
                                                                       think that you-all have been waiting on --
22
         place and we're -- again, if there's something that
                                                              22
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Hang on. Sheriff Tony.
23
         comes up that we learn over time that needs to be
                                                              23
                                                                       Mr. Schachter had a question.
24
         expended or modified, we'll be able to do it.
                                                              24
                                                                           MR. SCHACHTER: Sheriff, has the school board
25
                                                              25
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: What was the -- was your
                                                                       worked with you and all the other municipalities
                                                                                                               Page 145
         because how -- how would it work? I mean, you've
 1
                                                               1
                                                                       superintendent, when they passed the policy two
 2
         got a reunification plan, you've got, you know, on-
                                                               2
                                                                       weeks ago, they passed it as a -- reunification
 3
         site facilities but the schools are the ones that,
                                                               3
                                                                       policy but they passed it as a security policy.
 4
         you know, are -- have -- you have to be
                                                               4
                                                                       That is confidential and is not being made public
 5
         coordinating with them, right?
                                                               5
                                                                       and they're not sharing. So I haven't seen it.
 6
             MR. TONY: Yeah. I can't speak to their
                                                               6
                                                                       Nobody's seen it. So I don't even know -- I have
 7
                                                               7
         engagement with other municipal cities, but what I
                                                                       no idea, you know, what's in it. They passed it a
 8
         can tell you was we were contacted this past August
                                                               8
                                                                       couple of weeks ago. I don't know of any entity
 9
         to help participate on the development of their
                                                               9
                                                                       that I know of -- and I could be wrong -- but I
10
         family reunification plan. And so our engagement,
                                                                       don't know of any entity that has passed the -- an
                                                              10
11
         we're responsible for 60-plus different schools in
                                                              11
                                                                       enacted reunification policy that is quoted in
12
         the county in terms of security. I'd like to think
                                                              12
                                                                       confidentiality.
13
         that the type of dialogue that our staff has had
                                                              13
                                                                           The superintendent told me it should get --
14
         with them would be able to cross and transcend into | 14
                                                                       should be here this afternoon, that they were
15
                                                              15
                                                                       advised to do it that way. But it's a
         other municipals, but I think it's important that
16
         you talk to all your individual partners,
                                                              16
                                                                       reunification policy, and I think it's something
                                                              17
                                                                       that should be made public. I think parents should
17
         especially when we're not responsible for all the
18
         schools in the county in terms of SROs. That every
                                                              18
                                                                       know and have access to it so there is an
19
         agency should have some type of say in that
                                                              19
                                                                       expectation as to what's going to happen if an
20
         discussion.
                                                              20
                                                                       incident occurs, where their kids are going to go,
21
                                                              21
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Have you seen the school
                                                                       what the policies are going to be, how they can act
22
         board's reunification policy?
                                                              22
                                                                       and react. So you haven't seen it. Nobody has
23
                                                              23
             MR. TONY: I have not.
                                                                       seen it. So it was done in a non-public forum
```

25

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Well, the reason probably

why not is, and I shared this with the

24

25

the document's confidential. So --

outside of a -- it wasn't in a public meeting and

25

```
Page 146
                                                                                                               Page 147
                                                                       communication. I think there's been a lot of
             MR. TONY: Sure.
 1
                                                               1
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: -- that -- that -- that's
 2
                                                               2
                                                                       discussion about communications in terms of the
 3
         where they are on that.
                                                               3
                                                                       upgrades and successes that we're currently having,
 4
             MR. TONY: Now, I -- just for clarity, I -- I
                                                               4
                                                                       the P25 interoperability. I think, when you get
 5
         will say I have not personally seen it, but if my
                                                               5
                                                                       right down to it, is the positioning aspect in
 6
         command staff -- Major DeMarco, have you seen it?
                                                               6
                                                                       terms of his help. I think that's a safe
 7
                                                               7
             MR. DEMARCO: Yes, I've seen it.
                                                                       assessment. What I will say is, we, in terms of
 8
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay.
                                                               8
                                                                       the Broward Sheriff's Office, have been
 9
             MR. TONY: Okay. So it's found its way into
                                                               9
                                                                       communicating with Coral Springs non-stop. There
10
         the necessary hands from our side.
                                                              10
                                                                       is an original -- a hope that we would be able to
11
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. Fair enough. But
                                                              11
                                                                       allow Coral Springs to ditchpa -- dispatch our
12
         it's not -- but it's not -- it -- it isn't
                                                              12
                                                                       deputies in Parkland region after assessing what
13
                                                              13
                                                                       that would do and how it would impact the overall
         available to the public, I'm sure.
14
             MR. SCHACHTER: And what I've been told is the
                                                              14
                                                                       county.
15
         reason they don't make it available to the public
                                                              15
                                                                           I had to pull away from -- specifically because
16
         is, in these mass casualty situations or an
                                                              16
                                                                       we started tactical alerts and in -- integrating
17
         emergency, they want to be the first ones on scene
                                                              17
                                                                       all these different training programs and how we
18
         to set up a reunification site. They don't want
                                                              18
                                                                       dispatch into these areas across the county, as I
                                                              19
19
         parents automatically deploying to the -- the
                                                                       highlighted, and Coral Springs doesn't -- doesn't
20
         reunification site first. So that -- that's --
                                                              20
                                                                       do that. In addition to that, Coral Springs
21
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right.
                                                              21
                                                                       doesn't have county-wide responsibility. To give
             MR. SCHACHTER: -- what I've been told is why
22
                                                              22
                                                                       up dispatching capabilities in Parkland mean --
23
         they don't make it public.
                                                              23
                                                                       means we are no longer controlling, being able to
24
             SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay.
                                                              24
                                                                       tactically deploy officers or deputies out of
25
                                                              25
             MR. TONY: I'll continue on and get to
                                                                       Parkland should there be an event in Deerfield or
                                                 Page 148
                                                                                                               Page 149
 1
         at Dania Beach or at Tamarac, and I don't have the
                                                               1
                                                                       believe it were you. You -- related to the
 2
         -- the luxury of being responsible for just 25
                                                               2
                                                                       bifurcation and the potential loss of Coconut Creek
 3
         square miles. That's Coral Springs. I -- I did my
                                                               3
                                                                       and Margate from this regionalized system.
 4
         time there. I spent almost 11 years in that
                                                               4
                                                                           SHERIFF GUALTIERI: That's right.
 5
                                                               5
                                                                           And last year -- well, two years ago, the last
         agency. It's a great agency, but I'm responsible
 6
         for this entire county.
                                                               6
                                                                       time I was here, concerns were brought up through
 7
             And so when we start looking at that, Chief
                                                               7
                                                                       Coconut Creek, and concerns were brought up through
 8
         Parry understood that, and his team understood it,
                                                               8
                                                                       Margate. And the first thing that I did,
 9
         and that's how it came into, well, what can we
                                                               9
                                                                       personally, with my staff, was to go to Coconut
10
         evolve into? Now, there's been talk about being
                                                              10
                                                                       Creek, sit down with their chief of police, sit
11
         able to effectively launch and assess this hub
                                                              11
                                                                       down with their mayor, sit down with their
12
         option, and that's the only way to do it. We can't
                                                              12
                                                                       personnel, and take notes and outline every single
13
         afford to introduce anything onto a platform that's
                                                                       efficiency of concern that they had. Then the next
                                                              13
14
         responsible for safeguarding 1.9 million people.
                                                              14
                                                                       step was to go back with our team and fix every
15
                                                              15
         In my opinion, it would be reckless and
                                                                       single efficiency of concern that they had, and
                                                              16
16
         irresponsible to do it any other way without
                                                                       that was reproduced with Margate.
                                                              17
17
         thoroughly examining it and testing it with solid
                                                                           The issue or conversation that there was a
18
         benchmarks for what we account for success and to
                                                              18
                                                                       quality concern about our personnel not performing
19
         ensure that we mitigate any of the things that we
                                                              19
                                                                       is not relevant. Our folks have been through all
20
         identify as shortcomings.
                                                              20
                                                                       the different training necessary. They've been per
21
                                                              21
             That's why you have a T&E period where you
                                                                       -- performing well. And how do I know that? It's
22
         spend -- testing and evaluation period on anything
                                                              22
                                                                       not speculation. It's not conjuncture. It's data-
23
         that we do in law enforcement, so I don't think it
                                                              23
                                                                       driven. In 2016, the regional complaints that came
```

24

25

would be any different with communications. Mr.

Chairman, you brought up a question earlier. I

in, whether it be about performance, perhaps a

dispatcher, someone didn't like what they said or

Page 150 how they handled it. Whatever that complaint was, 445 times complaints came in. In 2021, here today, a total of 31 complaints have come into this regional system that handles billions of calls.

To be more specific, if we looked at what's occurred in Coconut Creek, who have elected to join Coral Springs, I think, for the upcoming 2022 year. Same data points from 20 -- 2016, they had 35 complaints originally. Here today, they have three. Now, for my law enforcement brothers and sisters on this panel, you understand that that's pretty remarkable. Three complaints out of the tens of thousand-plus calls that come through. I have a hard time accepting that it's my personnel that's not performing.

We had shortcomings, and we figured them out. We needed advanced training, we needed to work with -- with ORCAT and get new technology in here that we saw fit to be functional, and we've gotten it done. I'll run the same parallel comparison and look at what occurred in Margate. In one of their highlighted years of complaints, so to speak, in 2017 they had 66 complaints. Here today, in 2021, they have none.

Page 152

But at the end of the day, we work well together and we need all partners to start getting in that -- that involved, and I hope that we have success with this whole model. I hope that it -- it works and that we can get this going because this is something -- when I listen to everyone on this commission, it seems like that's the only thing we have been able to check off the box in addition to some of the school issues. So with that, if there's any specific questions about -- SHERIFF GUALTIERI: If -- if you know, so --

because what you just testified to is -- is that Coconut Creek here, to date, as far as complaints or concerns regarding system issues, is a total of three?

MR. TONY: That's correct, sir.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right. From 2021, so in nine months you had a total of three complaints. Do you know -- if -- if you know, what's driving it now? If there were -- again, the complaints were higher before. The system complaints have been reduced significantly. So do you know what -- what's driving Coconut Creek's departure from the system?

MR. TONY: I would surmise that we have had, in

Page 151
So if an organization or municipal elects to
move out of this regionalize -- regionalized
system, it would not be at the fault of the Broward
Sheriff's Office. It would not be at the fault or
the performance of the men and women under my
command. It's non-negotiable when it comes to
performance in this organization. And I'm hard and
I'm demanding, but that's what this community
deserves. That's what they'd better get. I'm the
Sheriff. Not politics, public safety. So from
that standpoint of communications, yes, we've made
some improvements. Yes, we're on our way, but we we still have a long way to go, and -- and I'm
going to get back to what was already stated here.

The areas of concern is not money. The areas of concern is not technology. The areas of concern that is impacting our ability to mitigate all these problems is leadership. It's the ecosystem of leadership across all these different involved parties. Now, we've done a very good job in working with the county. I've worked hand -- elbow-to-elbow with -- and that relationship did not exist the way it should have. We've had successes. We've had some fights. We had some shouting matches on the phone.

Page 153

this county, so much infighting occurring about this communication system for so long that even after making all of the corrective measures, they had already committed. They were gone, and there was no pulling them back. There wasn't anything I was going to say or anything else I was going to do. None of these charts mattered. They were gone. And they've elected to do this. I mean, you brought up a point when Chief Parry was here. It is only going to exacerbate the current problems we have with communication if we continue to have partnerships that vacate from this regionalized system.

How many more Band-Aids are we going to put on these areas before we just say, hey, we are all invested in this equally. What is going to work best for the whole county versus just a city or two? And by the way, and I -- I mean no disrespect to my colleagues, but when bad things happen, they are most certainly going to call the sheriff's office. We have more resources and capability than any municipal in this city -- in -- in this county. It doesn't matter how big the city is, if our -- brother's is one of the largest, rely on our resources as well. So we -- we need to make sure

Page 15 that we're doing what's collectively good for everyone and not just a few of the cities that exist in this county.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So just on communications. So if you would -- I know you're getting into it, but just touch on it because we raised it earlier and you said you'd talk about it, is the -- the -- the results. Where are you today as far as preparedness within the regional center, from the pitch survey in 2016, the survey in 2019, and the improvements of -- would you just touch on that?

MR. TONY: Yes, sir. So the -- the surveys.

One, staff personnel were not as engaged in participating in that survey. And I think Sheriff Judd, he had brought this up one time before about how is it that hundreds of employees don't -- okay. We fixed that. I mandated everybody take the survey and give us the feedback. Only four people didn't take that out of 300-plus, and they were out on family leave, okay? With that, what we've noticed was, during that transitionary period of embedding the new IAEE system and EPDF, there was a lot of learning curves going on, and people are getting burned out because the hours that they were committed to training and the hours that were

Page 155 associated to work, and so our staffing got through the learning curve with the training, and then we modified things to help them in terms of personnel.

Between training, shift change, we had like a 70-plus percent approval rating on the new things we did to cut the shift down to 12-hour shifts, so now we're three-and-a-half on, three-and-a-half off. All these things to mitigate their concerns. In terms of the training, the -- the training has been on a continuum. We can't afford to get lax in any capacity of public safety, just like we pushed the envelope between all the active shooter training and all those things. Angie Miles and her team, and under Carl Loren (phonetic), they are instituting all type of training elements for our personnel.

And so the lack in morale, the issues with new systems, we're past that. We're past that. And so now, it's -- it's back to how do we enhance our performances? How do we continue to stay on top of the technology and work with ORCAT so that we don't fall behind? Because this is -- this is a constant thing with technology. We -- we can't afford to be complacent with what we have and the successes that we're having. So we need to keep moving forward.

Page 156

And I just want -- one other thing, Mr.

Chairman, that I wanted to touch on in the area of concern that I have is what's occurring after

Alyssa's Law and the amount of vendors that are participating in this process in terms of panic buttons, et cetera. We currently are working with four different vendors. Four different vendors when it comes to SaferWatch, ARS, and -- and others. We need to start getting more focused on how we're going to streamline these, all right?

I'm -- I'm almost predicting the issues that we're going to have with this. We've made the concessions. We've added new personnel. We have a team of folks who are dedicated in our communication systems that -- that is all they do, is monitor these apps. But if you keep adding more apps in, you're juggling more balls. Eventually, one of them's going to drop. And so we need to look at, okay, how is this legislation passed? What do we need to do to be more effective? In my opinion, we don't need another -- one more app to be inserted into what we need to have to safeguard this community when it comes to these schools.

It's going to be a problem if we keep -- and I -- and I'm not sure how other counties and stuff

Page 157 are -- are dealing with it or -- or how it's been -- been. I'd would love to hear from you-all fine, wonderful human beings. Any of my colleagues here, Sheriff would agree, even if -- even he would have one out as well, but we better be careful with that, all right? Technology is good, but it's only as good as its end-users or how many things that we're juggling.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: We -- we had a presentation on that yesterday, so we had a discussion about it, and -- and the problem with the multiple apps in the various counties. You're not alone here in Broward. So we did have a discussion about that yesterday. We had a presentation on it. Is anybody -- yes. Commissioner Nelson, go ahead.

MR. NELSON: Sure. It's a two-part question. The first part is, do you see these -- this bifurcated system of the county being over the hardware portion of communication, your office being over the personnel side of the communication center, an issue?

MR. TONY: I think it's an issue so long as I stop working with the county administrator. I think strategically, the best option would have been to keep it under the sheriff's office.

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. NELSON: And the second part of that 1 2 question is: You know, do you see that as a viable 3 solution to this? And I know there's a lot. 4 MR. TONY: In terms of transporting it back 5 over? 6 MR. NELSON: Yes, sir. 7 MR. TONY: I think it streamlines a lot. One 8 of the things that you've heard from the chiefs of 9 police of any other law enforcement and fire rescue 10 personnel is that they wanted to have more 11 inclusion about the things that are going down on a 12 day-to-day basis with the technology because things 13 could happen -- happen very quickly in the field 14 and then it applies to technology. Well, field 15 folks like to move faster when it comes to, what is 16 going to make my job easier? What's going to make 17 me more effective? 18 But there's a process in place, where now those 19

shortcomings, so to speak, are identified, but then it has to be discussed a second, third, fourth time and considered at the technology level. And then there's a cost of -- aspect that's always considerable, right? So now it's more conversation, more consideration, explaining why the end-user needs it, then let's figure out

Page 160

Page

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

So what does that look like? How does that process work its way into where there's a trust and confidence amongst the county commissioners and the event body? The county administrator sees the transition as beneficial for her office. Then we accept command of all of ORCAT and then bring it into one house.

And then, what is the financial aspect associated to it? Because I'm not going to take something that is broken or have things that I want to fix, so there's going to be some money associated to -- I'll take it under the premise that I get X amount of dollars to do these programs whenever we want. Hopefully, someday we'll get there, but that's something that another body has to decide. It's no longer up to me.

But if it ever comes back to this office, I can | 17 assure you of two things. It would never leave. And the second, we will engage and make a body or a board that's inclusive of all the law enforcement and fire rescue individuals in this county because that will always be a hiccup. Whether it's under me or not, they're always going to want to have insight. They're -- they're -- they're the enduser. So you can't ignore them. So before it

strategically how we can invest in it, right?

And it had already came up about this -- the history behind how this process happens. Our predecessors felt they should have kept communications. They should've done everything in their power to keep the number one tool that we use more than anything else, is the radio. I would not allow any outside entity to tell me what firearm I'm going to carry. Make sense? I'm not going to allow an outside entity to tell me what bullets I get to carry in my gun. Right? And we don't shoot people every day. But we key up on that radio nonstop.

So to Mrs. Henry's positioning on it, the part that she did not say, and was not spoke of, is that she has been invested into the system as an individual personally trying to meet all these different expectations for so long that it cannot be a simple process of just saying, let's transition it over. We have to be practical about that. There was politics involved about it as well. Before I was elected I was appointed, and there was uncertainty as to whether or not I would be here today. So why would you turn it over then? But now I am here.

Page 161

becomes conflict, just bring it to the table. SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Sheriff Judd, go ahead.

MR. JUDD: I want to pick up with what Commissioner Nelson said. Sheriff, you -- you gave that analogy about someone else taking your gun or your ammunition. Well, right now, if you use that vernacular in your radio system, you've got a County Commission holding your gun

MR. TONY: Uh-huh.

MR. JUDD: -- and you got to go out and set forth in order to use, or to get parts of your gun.

MR. TONY: That's correct.

MR. JUDD: That you got to go to them and say, Give me the part of the gun so can put it together in a similar so I can -- and I understand why the fire chiefs and the police chiefs feel the way they do. They're not only the end-users, they're not only your customers. They're your partners. And as I sit in, I can only relent to our regional system. Our police chiefs and fire chiefs sat on board, if you will, and when Commissioner Nelson was the chief of -- he ran a piece of that, and he made the decisions and when he brought his piece of that decision back, that's what I did as the sheriff. I didn't say, I'm the sheriff. I'm in

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

just do it.

Amended 2021 September 28, Page 162 Page 163 charge. Chief, I don't like what you did. trusting and working with our civilian brothers and 1 2 But I put my chief hat on. If I got excluded 2 sisters who are ORCAT, taking -- you're taking two 3 or ignored, I would want to cut and run. When I --3 different orders of instruction. 4 when I gave the analogy of the -- of the public 4 MR. JUDD: You have a group of police Chiefs 5 enterprise world this -- this radio system would be 5 and fire chiefs now that are on the committee that 6 out of business if it had to compete with others 6 advise and direct implementation as infrastructure 7 7 because they would do what was necessary taking and operations. 8 8 MR. TONY: We don't have a formal board, but 9 So what I'm asking you is, you know, sure, it 9 we've -- nor have we had the need for it because 10 is quite a good question but it's going to be a 10 we're always in communication with every single 11 vote of the board of county commissioners. But to 11 municipal partner. We have not taken on this great 12 fix this problem so that every police chief and 12 machine that we're going to make all the decisions 13 13 every fire chief march in here and go, this is that impact other police officers, law enforcement, 14 working. We're involved, we're the decision-makers 14 firefighters . So they've never once been 15 and the sheriff is simply a moderator. Do you 15 ostracized from anything that we're going to 16 support taking that system and doing what you need 16 introduce from the human level, on the training, 17 to do so that these police agencies don't feel like 17 the -- how we handle things. I think Chief Parry 18 they've got to coalesce around each other in order 18 mentioned that. We've never had an issue with 19 19 that to protect themselves? 20 MR. TONY: I said it two years ago, which was 20 MR. JUDD: Are you opposed to having a team 21 yes. I'm saying yes again. Then every two years 21 consisting of fire chiefs and police chiefs being 22 from now it will be yes. I think it strategically 22 direct advisors to you so it's not filtered out 23 makes the best sense. Because if not this 23 through the county infrastructure or the Sheriff's 24 incident, we're still going to have this 24 infrastructure before it gets to a --. As you 25 25 fragmentation behind first responders in the field said, the Sheriff's team -- and lawyers get fed, Page 165 Page 164 1 and if you're not on the ground looking people in 1 and most of that would be the chiefs, the fire 2 the eye, asking questions, you don't the 2 chiefs and/or police chiefs would be on the city 3 unvarnished truth. You get the sanitized truth. 3 commission, going into the county staff. We want 4 MR. TONY: I'm not going to promise anything's the sheriff to have it because we all run it here. 4 5 going to work well for us and if the chiefs come up 5 MR. TONY: Yeah. 6 with it, I'm part of the Fire Chiefs and Police 6 MR. JUDD: Are you prepared to go forward and 7 7 create that coalition that helps you deal with Association, I'm the sheriff. It's never been 8 brought up as a point of interest. I think the 8 operations and thoughts directly to you so that 9 greater concern that everyone has now is how do we 9 they'll want to go to their -- together? 10 get communications in it's entirety back to the 10 MR. TONY: Yes, it's not a problem for me. 11 Sheriff's Office? And they build a board around 11 MR. JUDD: And if the city government go to the 12 that or -- and just walk out -- , again, there's no 12 county and say, let the sheriff pass this. So my 13 need for any more meetings, more tap meetings. All chiefs, my fire chief and police chief, can sit 13 14 right? eyeball-to-eyeball, and if their system 14 15 15 We create another board, it's just another collectively for the best interest -- because no 16 meeting. We got an outline of what needs to 16 matter what county you live in, I subscribe to the 17 17 happen. What needs to get done. We took your fact that you drive through all these other

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

list. Your list, this committees list, and use it

as a bible. That's how we started introducing all

this training and technology. We just looked at

what you said you'd follow. We looked at FDLE's

affairs investigation. We have a rapport. I said,

MR. JUDD: Are you -- to me your best allies --

investigations. We looked at our own internal

anything that's going to be beneficial.

communities to get to any place.

earlier today that it is a county-wide

MR. JUDD: So obviously, the commissioner said

MR. TONY: Yeah, I forgot. I'm not opposed to

responsibility and your biggest cheerlings are the

MR. TONY: Correct.

police chiefs and fire chiefs.

Page 167

Page 166

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: I'm going to start -- start trying to wrap it up here so we break for lunch.

Commissioner Carroll, go ahead.

MR. CARROLL: Real quick just to add another analogy. There used to be an old football coach from New England and before that, the Giants that used to say, If I'm going to be responsible for cooking dinner, I ought to be able to buy the groceries. And so I think what I'm hearing and I know I'm in total agreement with Sheriff Judd, and I think you would make this system much more efficient if it was under, you know, one level of accountability, can that be an elected official? You know, so -- it's just a quick question, the school piece. I know you sent -- you sent a letter back in August of 2019. I assume there's been a lot of follow-up since then. Is this a case where you're just not getting any response from them or is there active push-back?

MR. TONY: Let let me provide a little clarity in that. When that letter was disseminated, we did have a response, all right? Schools went out, they saw that the sheriff put them all on the spot, and they started working towards doing these --, right? But this, the -- the pace in which they have

executed or failed to even execute some of the items that we need is inexcusable. It's almost four years, right? The things that we've requested doesn't cost the school board another penny. It cost them time. I've made a commitment to deploy my personnel out there to alleviate any excuse that, well, we can't do this because, to take them because of. All I need you to do is to open the door with your staff and let my people do what they need to do with these cameras.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Mr. Schachter, go ahead.

MR. SCHACHTER: Hey. You would think that

Marjorie Stone with Douglas will be at the top of
that list of -- of cameras to make sure they work.

I just spoke to the chief of police for Coconut

Creek, Butch Arenal, and he said that the reason
that the number of complaints are so low is because
they have already decided to migrate to Coral

Springs, so they have not been, you know, reporting
the number of complaints, so --

MR. TONY: Let's say the number's at 50 percent where they were in 2016. Does that change the fact that leaving the system is going to create more problems than staying in it.

MR. SCHACHTER: I'm not -- I'm not saying

Page 168

because--

MR. TONY: No, no, I'm talking to Butch because he's listening. I'm talking to the chief right now. It's not about pointing fingers and excuses. We gave factual data points and the first response is an excuse. This is the damm problem with this community, one with leadership. Get the job done. Stop coming up with excuses.

MR. SCHACHTER: My other question was: The IT people, you know, the IT people from the county have to meet with the IT people of Coral Springs. What -- what's plan B? If -- if the IT people meet and say, Oh, you know, the county doesn't trust that the security is efficient. What's going to happen then?

MR. TONY: In terms of just the camera systems?

MR. SCHACHTER: No, I'm talking about -- I'm talking about the CAD communication.

MR. TONY: Well, the CAD's a little different from what -- we've been handing communication with more CAD, with -- personnel. We're not getting resistance, right? My concern is we're taking too long to execute. Just because you don't resist doesn't mean you don't delay. So this is that process of having two masters, so to speak, in that

Page 169 there's considerations that Bertha is going to make about ORCAT, and then there's decisions I'm going to make about personnel. I'd prefer to just make both of them and move on. It's always going to be a time issue. It's always going to be a delay. There's always going to be a financial consideration, so long as we're going to have these conversations.

MR. SCHACHTER: I hope that gets fixed. I just want to touch on one other issue that the commission has not addressed over the last three and-a-half years and something that I -- I really just became aware of the last couple of months. After the shooting, you have victims' advocates. I think you have three different victims' advocates that are supposed to help the victims' families. And when I reached out to most of the 17 families to inquire if a Broward Sheriff's Office victims' advocate had reached out to them, the responses that I got were -- some said, I didn't even know that we had a victims' advocate that was assigned to us.

One of them told me that they spoke to the victims' advocate and the victim's advocate told them, just go to Pine Trails Park, walk around,

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 170

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

look at the type of services they offer, and then 2 that was it. Other people said none of the Broward 3 Sheriff's Office victims' advocates helped them. 4 So I know that I had a conversation with you

5 because I was very upset about this. I -- not --6 not only because of what -- what they didn't do for

7 us and help us in our time of need but also knowing 8 the fact we've already had two mass casualty events

9 in Broward County. We certainly could have 10 another, and I want to make sure that the victim's 11 advocates are there for the victims.

> Also, we're going to be having a trial here. And -- and hopefully, your victims' advocates will be there for us again during that trial, which is going to be the most difficult thing I'll probably ever have to do in my life. I just wanted to get -- I spoke to you on the phone and you said you were going to let me know, you know, what are we doing about this to make sure that no other victims are -- are treated like this in the future?

MR. TONY: Sure. There's a couple of things there are we talked over the phone. I was going to open it up. The first thing I wanted to do is look at the validity on how this thing works, the processing of the victim advocates. During the day of the event, then of course, our victim advocates deploy. There's dissemination of content, references in relation to what you may need. We don't expect you to remember all that during the day, the most tragic moment of your life. You're not going to remember any of that.

Page 171

So it's important for our victims' advocates to continue to follow up and offer these services. You told me that you didn't get the contact so we made sure we put a policy in place that we track and account for every time we have a community engagement with some of the communities where we're offering victims' advocate services. That also coincides with what our homicide detectives do. Because every time our homicide detectives are out and engaging, they document and track and account that they've offered their service to a family member or so on, right?

So those two things we have in place. In terms of continued services, I'm not certain what happened, but I will also say that the State Attorney's office just recently drafted up a letter and made it clear -- prior that they will carry the load in the sense of making sure that they're at the point end of this one because now you're going

Page 172 into a court proceeding, and quite frankly, our personnel is not going to be at all these different court proceedings that take place but the State attorney most certainly will. And he understood that. He sent a letter over to the office, explained that those services will be available, that you'll never get denied access to any of them at the Sheriff's Office. Not while I'm here.

MR. SCHACHTER: Yeah. Thank You, sir. If I appreciate it.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. Sheriff Tony, thank you. We appreciate your being here. We have two more presentations before we break for lunch. They are fairly short, but we need to get to them.

The next one is Sylvia Ifft and Brooks Rumenik from DOE. The results of the school hardening workgroup and the EO -- DOE threat assessment workgroup. So turn over to Sylvia and Brooks will do the -- update, and then we'll break for lunch.

MS. IFFT: Thanks again Sheriff and members of the Commission. Before I get into the presentation, our office would like to acknowledge the contributions of Commissioners Petty and Schachter. From this group, Commissioner Petty, I know you're back there speaking with the Sheriff.

Page 173 We want to thank him for his contributions to the Threat Assessment Database Workgroup and his continuing support through the State Board of Education, ensuring that the care and safety of our kids is a priority.

And, Commissioner Schachter, thank you very much for connecting our workgroup to the teams in Colorado. Very valuable information that we got from those folks, and also the connectivity with the Partner Alliance for Safer Schools, and of course, your hard work on the Federal Commission on school safety. We appreciate it. Thank you.

So there's two workgroup reports that we are going to report out to you on today. First, I'm going to go over the School Hardening and Harm Mitigation Workgroup, which was formed out of both Executive Order in 1945 and Senate Bill 7030 and convened between July 2019 and August of 2020. Then, our Deputy Director at the Office of Safe Schools, Brooks Rumenik, will report out on the Threat Assessment Database Workgroup which worked through 2019 and reported out in January of 2020. So first of all, backgrounds on the School Hardening and Harm Mitigation Workgroup. Starting with executive order 1945, the governor directed

Page 174 the department of education specifically about the Safe Schools to develop best practices for School Hardening and Harm Mitigation. They included a tiered approach from basic to advanced measures, based on the initial report of this commission, and report back by July 1st of 2019.

Our office formed a workgroup at that time made up of subject matter experts and emergency management, crime prevention through environmental design, transportation, fire rescue, and others. After submitting our reports to the governor our office also posted this report in the Florida Safe Schools Assessment Tools, so that every school district and school-based security risk assessment team had access to this report.

The Senate Bill 7030 qualified this workgroup in the Office of Safe Schools and further directed our workgroup to look at the costs and estimated time frames for the implementation and report back to the Executive Director of the Office of Safe Schools by August 1st of 2020. Additionally, the workgroup was directed by the Legislature to take a closer look at School Hardening and Harm Mitigation policies, target hardening practices implemented in other states, school safety guidelines developed by

Page 175 organizations such as the Partner Alliance for Safer Schools that I just mentioned. That tiered approach to school hardening based, again, on the recommendations from this group, and Florida Building Code for educational facilities, specifically to determine if any modifications were needed.

So I can report that our report was submitted to the Office of Safe Schools Executive Director on time, August 1st, 2020, who in turn was required to submit to the Commissioner of Education both the workgroup's report and recommendations for the implementation of the workgroup's recommendations for monitoring and compliance enforcement. A similar report of the recommendations was then given to the Governor, the President of the Senate, and the Speaker of the house of representatives by September 1st, and that report was delivered on time. So to get back -- to get down to the findings of the workgroup. So here are the main topics from the workgroup's report and findings which found the following -- which found the following basic practice should be the minimum for every Florida school -- school and district.

25 First of all, maintain a single point of entry

Page 1

at every school with clear visitor screening procedures. Next, keep every classroom door closed and locked with the ability to conceal occupancy when class is in session or otherwise occupied. Guarantee student gathering areas such as auditoriums, cafeteria, sport yard, media centers, and gymnasiums are secure and are actively monitored during occupancy. Dedicate staff at each school who are responsible for the school safety, including but not limited to a minimum of one safe school officer at every campus.

Orchestrate procedures that clearly define roles and responsibilities for safety and security during routine day-to-day activities and when threats occur. Oversee planning, training, and exercising threat response plans with responders that would respond to an incident at that school. Continued planning, training, and exercising options-based responses for all staff and students during an emergency, including aid to victims and reunification. Ensure that planning, participation, and practice drills, staff training, and an evaluation process or an after-action report is taken for those with access and functional needs to identify obstacles before they arise.

Ensure emergency notifications and alarms are received by all campus staff, students, and responding law enforcement organizations regardless of hearing or visual impairment. Notifications and alarms should be audible, visible, and redundant. And then finally, certify the development of a safety and security culture through an age and population-appropriate school safety campaign, and understand that preparedness is a shared responsibility and it calls for the involvement of everyone. And I just wanted to comment that when our regional staff go out to these schools and visit with administrators, we can tell which schools takes school safety and security seriously. It is embedded in the culture and we can -- we can

Page 177

In terms of implementing these best practices, the workgroup outlined this tiered approach that you see here. This was developed by looking at the recommendations from this Commission as well as the national standards on Program Maturity and Development. Starting with level 1, which is your — your basic implementation. This includes needs identifications, development of policies and procedures necessary for a security program, and

truly see it happening in real-time.

Page 178 there are simple low-cost measures that can start immediately. Level 2 are moderate measures. These may take some additional planning to implement, but usually can be completed within the first year, and we usually like to recognize that fiscal year for implementation based on the resources that you have.

And then, of course, an advanced or level 3 program reflects a well-established, multi-year, multi-face process. Policies and procedures are exercised, be reviewed with regularity, and revised accordingly. And then finally, I want to talk about what we're doing with this information to date from this workgroup.

So the Office of Safe Schools, I can tell you, has incorporated both school safety requirements, the ones that you see here on your screen, as well as best practices into our monitoring visits with our schools. So our staff sit down with administrators, they have a conversation on the requirements, they go around, they talk to staff and students, they actually check classroom doors to make sure that those doors are locked and secured, if there are students in there and classes going on.

Page 179

And I can also report that our field staff have reported to us that increasingly they are seeing the school district fold these best practices that come out of this commission and our workgroup into their local policies. And so as our staff are going out visiting these schools, they are making sure that the administrators at the school level, at both traditional public schools and charter schools are aware not only of their requirements under State law but also the local policies that are in place.

We've also adopted these best practices in our school security risk assessment and district best-practices templates with guidance provided on all of these measures so that every school and school district is not only aware of these measures but is required to look through all of these on an annual basis.

And finally, it's in the -- the intention of our office that we regularly revise and revisit these best practices so they just don't sit on the shelf and become stagnant. As we -- as additional federal guidance becomes available and this new technology emerges, it is our intention to continuously go back, revisit, and revise these

Page 180

best practices. We mentioned Alyssa's Alert yesterday, this is one example of such. And that concludes my report before I pass it all over to Director Rumenik. Are there any questions?

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So you-all were provided a copy of the report -- we have the materials. You have the report itself. Does anybody have any questions for Sylvia? Mr. Schachter?

MR. SCHACHTER: Yeah. Thank you so much. Whether -- can you refresh my memory on the -- on the intercom system? Are -- is that included in the FSSAT to -- to say if there is an intercom system on the outside of buildings. Marjory Stoneman Douglas did not have that, and I mean, I -- I doubt that the regionals are there checking the intercom systems to make sure it works. But if that is an inclusion in the FSSAT, is there any way we can include that? It was a vulnerability, and it's not --

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: We should come back after lunch to talk about the FSSATs. So maybe that would be a good point in -- in time there to address that but you can fill us in. But my understanding is that the things that are included in the FSSAT are not recommendations. Only these

Page 181 are things that are required in law generally speaking; is that true?

MS. IFFT: Well, we fold in the best practices and this -- throughout the assessment and we do address that. We had a healthy conversation internally the last time we revised the assessment. We had talked -- you know, we originally talked about the Ear Bud Policy and we've kind of evolved that particular issue to just making sure that we have -- we ask good questions about, you know; can everybody receive the alert regardless of whether, you know, you -- you have a seeing or a hearing impairment.

MR. SCHACHTER: Or where they are on campus.
MS. IFFT: Or where they are on the campus.

MR. SCHACHTER: Yeah.

MS. IFFT: Yeah and -- and you and I, we went out to a -- a district up in north Florida that that was one of their big projects earlier on with the school hardening money was to improve their intercom systems.

MR. SCHACHTER: Thank you.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: All right. Thanks, Sylvia. We'll see you again after lunch. Thank you.

MS. IFFT: All right.

recommendations.

Page 182 SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Brooks. So now we're going to get an update on the Threat Management Workgroup. MS. RUMENIK: Thank you. This update -- oops, sorry. There we go. This update speaks specifically to the requirement in Statute 1001.212, requiring the Florida Department of Education to establish a statewide Threat Assessment Database Workgroup, and tasking this workgroup with providing recommendations by December 31st of 2019. The recommendations were to include: threat assessment data required to be entered into the database, school district and public school personnel who should be allowed to input student records and view such records, database design and functionality to include data security, restrictions and authorities on information sharing, the cost to develop and maintain a statewide online database, and an implementation plan and timeline for the workgroup

> Representation within this workgroup range from a variety of subject matter experts, including Florida school districts, large, medium, and small in size, urban and rural, located in the north,

Page 183 central, and southern part of the state, et cetera, and for extreme diversity, as well as State-level representation from information technology, and general council. As well, we wanted to share -- we wanted to ensure member perspective and expertise from law enforcement, mental health, exceptional student education, school administration, and counseling. Finally, we benefited greatly by having Commissioner Petty on our workgroup representing the Marjory Stoneman Douglas Commission as well.

As the workgroup worked to provide these specific recommendations, several things were taken into consideration. Some of these items included various threat assessment systems currently being utilized by school districts to document and monitor threat assessments being conducted. The pros and cons of developing an in-house system versus a system developed by a known vendor. And finally, a system that can support statewide use in a state the size of Florida with nearly 4,000 schools. Specifically, we wanted to focus on sustainability, something we could make available at no cost to districts, and ensure uniformity throughout the state.

Page 184

In October of 2019, we released an -- a request for information, otherwise known as an RFI, to gather information on what solutions might be an option to consider for us to meet our goal in ensuring the system would be cost-effective, would collate -- collect state data from school districts and charter schools in an efficient manner, and support the reporting and managing of threat assessments. The RFI received 15 responses. Based on the responses received, approximate costs were estimated at \$4 million with an estimated maintenance cost of \$2 million per year. The timeline would take approximately one year to develop -- I still think that's a little ambitious, but one year to develop and train prior to implementation.

So we sent forth our recommendations as were required of this workgroup and have not received feedback. I cannot speak specifically as to what the status is of that. However, it is not stifled in any way our progress in the area of threat assessment, and I wanted to speak briefly to some of the successes that we have experienced throughout the last few years. So while the statewide press of the database workgroup --

Page 185 workgroup provided those recommendations we will continue to work through our process to improve it. And some of the ways we were doing this are through the identification of the CSTAG, a Comprehensive School Threat Assessment Guidelines, as our standard instrument for documenting and monitoring concerning behaviors and threats. As well, we continue to expand our team of trainers who train school-based teams on the threat assessment process and use of CSTAG.

We have state-level trainers as well as district trainers in nearly every district, and also help facilitate training opportunities across districts, among charter schools, and within local law enforcement engaged in -- through school -- school-based threat assessment. We've also engaged with -- been engaged with Dr. Dewey Cornell, the developer of the CSTAG model and guidelines, and his research team to identify areas to strengthen and improve our processes across the state. Through our recent rule of adoption, we have been able to further clarify and reiterate expectations for threat assessment teams, such as requiring teams to meet monthly, for ongoing monitoring and evaluation of assessments. Within our training and

Page 186 technical assistant opportunities, we look for ways to highlight and facilitate greater information sharing, which is such a vital component of the threat assessment process.

And finally, we have been able to identify some school districts that are doing an exemplary job in this work and share these examples with others across the state so that they can benefit from these learning opportunities as well. That is the conclusion of my portion of this presentation and I'm available for questions.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. Again, you-all have a copy of the report, you have read the material. Any questions for Brooks on the Threat Assessment Workgroup, its results -- where -- where it's heading. We talked about a little yesterday, I think the biggest thing out of it is the need for a state-wide database and to join everybody together as probably the -- the most significant thing that can happen. Does anybody have any questions?

Okay, thanks, Brooks. Appreciate it.

MS. RUMENIK: You're welcome.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: The next presentation is from Annie White and Lynn Moscoso with Broward County Schools on the Fortify Florida app, and an Page 187 update regarding the use of the app around Florida and here in Broward County.

Annie, all yours.

MS. WHITE: So basically, I wanted to -- the Sheriff had asked that we kind of recap where we came from, where we are now, so -- but I know we're pressed for time, so I'm going to quickly go through this. As you know, a couple of weeks before the end of session it was put into the legislation to basically enact some legislation for Fortify Florida. Basically, I'm going to go through some of obligations of that, this thing is touching. Okay.

So basically, the -- the obligations of FDLE as a department here were to procure the app. There were a minimum standard for it and the minimum if -- would identify the responsible parties and relay information that was submitted through the app. The District -- our School Board would promote the use of the mobile-specific activity reporting tool by advertisement on the school district website, in newsletters, on school campuses, and the school publications, by installing it on all mobile devices issued to students and bookmarking the website on all computer devices issues -- issued to

Page 189

Page 188

students.

And then, lastly -- all right, there would be marketing of the app as well as education and then the tips received in the tool are anonymous, exempt from --. So very quickly I'll go through -- this is what it looks like when you download the app. We want to go through how a tip was submitted. It's not only an app on your phone but also the website portal, which -- I'll talk a little bit about that in a minute, but submitting a tip is very easy to do. It's very user-friendly. It's a work-in-progress, and one of the reasons that I have Lynn here.

There's not only the Broward School District, but we've received a lot of input from school districts across the State. So we've been working on making it more user-friendly. We have to look at the totality of the users. Everyone from high school down to an elementary-age student. So we have to make it easy for all of them. So submitting a tip process is very easy. You select your school, submit your information, you can upload a picture if you choose. It lets them know your information is anonymous unless you want to upload your information. All of the obligations of

the statute that you saw earlier.

We launched in 2018. There's our 249 law enforcement agencies, almost 7,000 public and private schools, 73 districts, and the tip numbers were accurate as of September of 2019. The Fortify Florida web portal has become more important in such that 82 percent of the tips are actually coming through the web. That was kind of interesting to us. We noticed that trend last year. We've kind of started digging into that and we'd like to do a more formal survey. Of course, at FDLE we have access to a lot of parents with a lot of kids and we went around and kind of asked them, you know, what -- what are the thoughts? Can you ask the kids why are they not downloading this?

And it's kind of interesting some of the -- the answers that we got, you know. Kids don't want to be made a snitch. They don't want their friend -- everybody shares their phone, and they were concerned about if the app's on there someone's going to deem them a snitch. So the web portal, you scan a QR code, we're going to talk about that groundwork that Broward has done with getting some of those publications out there. But the web portal has become our -- our number one source of -

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 190

- of information coming in both last year and this 2 year. 3 So these are the tips by year. 2021 is through 4 August 31st. Just to kind of give you an idea, 5 even during COVID we didn't -- we didn't go down so 6 far. This data that you saw earlier, I will say 7 that in your book it says 20 districts utilize Say 8 Something. That's a typo, it is actually 22, my 9 apologies. That was not caught before print. Ten 10 districts utilized Fortify Florida only of which 11 one stated they do have access to other things, but they don't advertise it. So these are the numbers. 12 13 You saw this earlier in the Department of 14 Education's presentation but we still have ten 15 districts that have only that. 16 Some of these other safety tools, you'll notice 17 that they have -- 28 have it, but 13 has something

else. So there's a combination but everybody has access to Fortify Florida. This was the tip categorization that we went through last year. It has changed. Mr. Schachter put me in touch with some people in Colorado, as well as Sandy Hook Promise and the developers of Safe -- Save the Town in Colorado. I looked at their categorization and we made some tweaks to that. So we more accurately kind of matched apples to apples.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: So -- so you're saying here in this place because this -- this was up there. You show on there this is one of the things that people have made observations about regarding the Fortify Florida, and that it has a high percentage, 47 percent are -- of the tips are not related to school safety facilities and they relate to administrative issues. So there's a high percentage, some would say, non-probative or not highest value. If any other apps have a higher percentage because they were structured a little bit differently--

Page 191

MS. WHITE: Yes. So 2021 --SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Okay. MS. WHITE: Sorry.

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Yeah. And explain but -but -- but you're going to include in here in this -- just explain the difference because it's the -what the difference is between the Fortify Florida app, which accepts everything, and the other apps that have a screening out procedure. So that's important to -- to differentiate.

MS. WHITE: That's correct. And in some of the last commission meetings that was brought up.

Page 192

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Right.

MS. WHITE: And again, you know, I can use the same analogy someone else did, but comparing apples to apples, these other apps, I -- I met with some folks that Mr. Schachter pointed me to, as well as some other organizations. They have a live 24/7 call center. One of them has 30 crisis counselors on staff that can take the calls. So when little Johnny calls in and says, you know, I don't like the color purple. They hit delete, it never makes it to their numbers. I don't have that luxury in Fortify Florida. Little Johnny wants to call it

in, I count it into one of my categories. But one of the things that we did do was kind of drill down on these categories so we could look at it and -- and see if -- if we're becoming more effective because I don't think you're ever going to be at a place where you're the best thing out there. There's change in society. There's change in technology and so we're constantly looking at that. Whereas before we were -- we had a greater percentage of tips for approximately 58 percent last year were not school safety. We have definitely drilled that down: 37 percent of our tips are in our top five categories up there. So

Page 193 stabbing, shooting, killing, self-harm, bullying -weapons on campus was a new category because before, that was not getting collected accurately and that was in some of those other numbers.

So, we got report of a weapon on campus, but you know, it wasn't that it was, someone's going to shoot, stab or kill. So now we can more accurately collect, and I think we're definitely drilling down with the app. We've had some great input. Just like 60 percent of our -- our tips are considered not under school safety. Let me explain what those tips are. One of those tips may be my school bus -- my bus driver smells like alcohol. Is that not school safety? It is school safety. Although it doesn't fall into our top five categories, it is not spam by any means and that's what we were kind of getting from -- from the last commission meetings was, these are spam.

So, we were accurately collected on those. You know, we get everything in the not-school-safety category from the bathrooms are dirty to my teacher smells like weed, the -- the cafeteria food is terrible. Lynn will talk a little bit about what they do with those types of tips in Broward. Everything is important. So, we don't consider

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Page 194 that to be spam or misuse of the system. I would certainly want to know if -- as a parent if I -there was a teacher having inappropriate contact with a student. That may not be school safety, but it's inappropriate contact.

To me, it's not physical safety, but it's safety, mental -- mental health safety. So, we've drilled down on that and I think our numbers are much more comparable. I looked at one of the other maj -- major school safety tools. They have had 60,000 tips since 2018. Only 18 percent of theirs were what are considered our top five categories. We're at 37 percent. So, the numbers back up that we are actually improving and we're getting useful data in through the school safety --

SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Commissioner Douglas.

MR. DOUGLAS: Yeah. And I was pleased after talking to one of our high school principals to learn that the Fortify Florida app could call in on some of these devious leaks with TikTok breaks that was going on. But I guess in that regard that would be also considered a not-school-safety facilities issue; is that correct?

MS. WHITE: Well, we -- yes. We have -- it -it would be not school safety, but it's a facility

Page 195 or an admin issue. You know they are stealing from campus. That -- it's school safety issue?

MR. DOUGLAS: But for me when I hear kids know now because they want to report that. They're getting tired of having to close the bathroom to all these things. I thought that's a great way that they are using a tool that we've given them, are on the right apps, you know, and they're notifying authorities they have information about vandalism. So I was pleased to hear about that.

MS. WHITE: And we've discussed some of those tips this week that, you know, we've had some vandalism occurring. Kids are using it to call in and report crimes on campus and now we have a category for crimes off-campus because before that was our non-school -- that was going into our nonschool safety. And so it was almost being perceived as un-useful information. So I think throwing it down as you're realizing, like I said, just because we get a tip on something about a -- a bus driver driving too fast, you know, that's still something that a parent wants to know about. I don't want my kid on that bus. So, you know, it's definitely useful information.

We kind of went over what some of the

Page 196

enhancements are, but for saving time, that's in your book. You know, we went -- Spanish translations, export features, one of the biggest things this year, because of a Department of Education rule, the school safety specialist have to be able to verify everybody in their list in their school within five days and report back if there's, you know, any changes. They have to make that change within five days. So, we created with the developer ways for them to export and be able to check their data to make sure that if a principal moves from one school to another, the right people are getting notified when a tip comes in. That took some -- a little bit of coding and we've got that taken care of and we're constantly requesting input from the school districts.

Little -- we'll talk a little bit about some of the things they've done. But Palm Beach, I have to -- to highlight them, you know, we received great feedback from them, great feedback from several districts in North Florida. Again, that's where a lot of the districts are and they have nothing but Fortify Florida. So -- sorry.

Future -- future things that we're working on, an auto-populate feature in the school tip when

Page 197 you're entering your school name. So, if you start to enter Crawford Middle Elementary, and you put C-R-A-W it automatically populates. We're used to seeing that in a lot of things we use today, and I think it will help speed that up. It also helps with some of the stuff -- with some of the districts using their tip hotline or their school safety box, it will help them. They're actually -will have some interesting things that we're doing with theirs, it'll help them auto-populate information into Fortify Florida.

Findings narrative, that's one of the biggest thing that we've implemented this school year. Before -- again, looking at data from these other reporting mechanisms, we cannot determine what the findings were. So now it is mandatory that they put in what the findings were when they close down a tip. It's going to help us track data. It's going to help us look to see if the tip is credible and just kind of get a better idea of -- of what's coming into the system and what -- what's helpful to the district. That's where I'm ending off and I'm going to let Lynn take the floor for just a minute.

Does anyone have any questions for me so far as

| SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Anybody have any questions for Annie before we hear from Lynn? Commissioner Schachter. MR. SCHACHTER: Do we know how many districts Response in the state of this is teaching kids what to report, what not to Response in the state of | Page 19 TER'S CERTIFICATE , Court Reporter and Notary his transcript is a true and notes. |
|--|--|
| SHERIFF GUALTIERI: Anybody have any questions for Annie before we hear from Lynn? Commissioner Schachter. MR. SCHACHTER: Do we know how many districts mre and I mean you know, I think a part of this is teaching kids what to report, what not to report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) The STATE OF FLORIDA COUNTY OF BROWARD: I, Johnny Calder Public, certify that complete record of my in or am I a relative of employee, attorney, of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of attorney or counsel with the account of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of the school complete record of my in or am I a relative of the school complete record of my in or | , Court Reporter and Notary his transcript is a true and |
| for Annie before we hear from Lynn? Commissioner Schachter. MR. SCHACHTER: Do we know how many districts are and I mean you know, I think a part of this is teaching kids what to report, what not to report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) The STATE OF FLORIDA COUNTY OF BROWARD: I, Johnny Calder Public, certify that complete record of my employee, attorney, of nor am I a relative of attorney or counsel w financially in the act financially in the act attorney or counsel w financial in the act or attorney or couns | his transcript is a true and |
| Schachter. MR. SCHACHTER: Do we know how many districts are and I mean you know, I think a part of this is teaching kids what to report, what not to report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to counsel with the account of the school o | his transcript is a true and |
| MR. SCHACHTER: Do we know how many districts are and I mean you know, I think a part of this is teaching kids what to report, what not to report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to we know how many districts I, Johnny Calder Public, certify that complete record of my employee, attorney, or nor am I a relative or attorney or counsel w financially in the acc part of the concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) Exploration of the concluded at 4:02 p.m.) All populations are described as a second and the importance of it? 20 21 22 23 24 | his transcript is a true and |
| are and I mean you know, I think a part of this is teaching kids what to report, what not to report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) financially in the action of the school o | his transcript is a true and |
| this is teaching kids what to report, what not to report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to the school of the sc | his transcript is a true and |
| report. It's education and, you know, the the flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) | |
| flyer, I'm not sure every all the kids see that and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to employee, attorney, or attorney or counsel w financially in the ac the part of the school control of th | notes. |
| and if they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to limit they don't really have someone explaining to them how important this is. Do you have any kind nor am I a relative of attorney or counsel we financially in the action of the school of the schoo | |
| them how important this is. Do you have any kind of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to limit the school of the sch | that I am not a relative, |
| of semblance of an idea of how many of the school districts are having, you know, meetings or pep rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain what this does and the importance of it? (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) (Thereupon to the provided at 4:02 p.m.) 12 attorney or counsel we financially in the acceptance of it? 15 16 17 17 18 18 18 19 19 19 19 19 | counsel of any of the parties, |
| districts are having, you know, meetings or pep 13 financially in the ac 14 rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain 15 what this does and the importance of it? 16 (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 | employee of any of the parties |
| 14 rallies or auditorium sessions to really explain 15 what this does and the importance of it? 16 (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) 17 18 18 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 | th the action, nor am I |
| 15 what this does and the importance of it? 16 (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) 17 18 18 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 20 20 E21 22 23 24 24 | ion. |
| 16 (Thereupon, Volume I concluded at 4:02 p.m.) 17 | ay of November 2021. |
| 17 | Och Ochdana |
| 18 | Johnny Caldera |
| 18 18 N 19 M 20 E 21 21 22 22 23 24 | hnny Caldera, |
| 19 19 M 20 20 E 21 21 22 22 23 24 24 | tary Public-State of Florida |
| 20 20 E 21 21 22 23 23 24 24 | commission # HH 182910 |
| 21 21 22 22 23 23 24 24 | pires October 6, 2025 |
| 22 23 24 24 | • |
| 23 24 24 | |
| 24 | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |