

HUMAN TRAFFICKING: TRADITIONAL LAW ENFORCEMENT METHODS DO NOT WORK

Lieutenant Timothy Pelella

Abstract

Traditional law enforcement methods do not work when trying to identify victims of human trafficking. Victims are being missed by law enforcement due to their lack of knowledge on the topic of human trafficking, their lack of compassion for potential victims that appear as prostitutes, massage parlor employees, or gentlemen's club dancers and the historical tendency to exclude others from their investigations. To be successful, law enforcement must re-evaluate their operating methods, educate their personnel through updated training, and foster good working relationships with other agencies to include; non-governmental agencies and the media. Law enforcement must educate their personnel on how traffickers control their victims before conducting sting operations. Officers must be able to look beyond the surface of the initial arrest and probe deeper into the arrested background by asking some simple questions. Agencies must identify non-governmental agencies within their jurisdictional area of responsibility and learn what they can do to assist in the investigations. These types of agencies can provide a sense of security for the victims, which will create trust and help further the investigation. The media is another outlet that law enforcement must include in their investigation after arrests have been made to further the investigation by identifying additional victims.

Introduction

Centuries ago when slavery was legal, force was used or threatened to make men, women, and children work in the fields or become sex slaves against their will. During the nineteenth century, the 13th amendment to the United States Constitution was passed and gave hope to many who dreamed of living free. Here we are in the 21st century and very little has changed. Although the law has changed, the act of enslaving someone against their will has not. Today men, women, and children are still being forced to work or become sex slaves, but it is not called slavery any longer, instead it is called Human Trafficking.

In the simplest terms, Human Trafficking is the "modern day slavery." In technical terms it is defined as "obtaining or maintaining the labor or services of another through the use of force, fraud, or coercion in violation of an individual's human rights" (IACP, 1997). Whether you refer to it as slavery or human trafficking, the fact is that it still exists today and it is happening in all parts of the country and around the world. It is occurring in cities, towns, and rural areas

both large and small. This crime does not discriminate between rich or poor; man, women, or child. It is happening in affluent, middle class, and poverty stricken areas. As a law enforcement official, if you believe it is not happening in your jurisdiction then you are naïve. Human trafficking is happening right under our noses, in neighborhoods that you would least suspect. Human trafficking also has a nexus to many other crimes that law enforcement continues to be plagued with.

Human trafficking is very appealing to the organized criminal. A drug deal is a one time sale. Once the drugs have been sold and the dealer has received payment there will be no further profit unless the dealer obtains more drugs and is able to sell it again. Unlike drug deals, human traffickers sell their product, in this case a sex slave, over and over again and reap the benefits of the reoccurring profit. The trafficker does not need to go find more products; he simply needs to keep his victim alive. The trafficker also benefits due to the fact that it is less likely that law enforcement will recognize this type of criminal activity.

Traditional law enforcement methods are not working. In fact, current procedures being utilized by law enforcement do not tend to identify a victim. Law enforcement can only be successful in combating human trafficking if they are able to identify, rescue, and build victim trust so that the appropriate evidence is collected that would support a successful prosecution. The key to success lies in law enforcement's ability to adapt and overcome traditional investigative methods. This can be accomplished through training, investigative initiatives, and a collaboration between law enforcement and non-governmental organizations.

Only after being involved in two cases; human trafficking and human smuggling, as a Lieutenant of the Pinellas County Sheriff's Office, Criminal Investigations Division did writer begin to realize just how enormous this problem currently is and will be for law enforcement across the nation. Although writer recognizes that the crime of human trafficking encompasses many different aspects, the purpose of this paper is to answer one question. How can law enforcement within the State of Florida increase their effectiveness in identifying and rescuing victims of human trafficking?

Literature Review

Background

Human trafficking is a crime in itself, but it is more often confused with a crime that has similarities, human smuggling. In the article "Distinctions Between Human Smuggling and Human Trafficking", published by the United States Department of State, points out the subtle differences between these two crimes (2006). Citizens and law enforcement alike sometimes have a difficult time differentiating between the crime of human trafficking and human smuggling. Because of their complexities, it is not always apparent when a "human smuggling" case crosses into the realm of a "human trafficking" crime (U.S. Department of State, 2006). When trafficking is mentioned, Americans often

visualize a foreign female who was deceived upon arriving in the U.S. and finds herself being sexually exploited (U.S. Department of State, 2008).

The U.S. Department of State defines the crime of human smuggling as the facilitation, transportation, attempted transportation or illegal entry of a person(s) across an international border, in violation of one or more countries laws, either clandestinely or through deception, such as the use of fraudulent documents (2006). A person being smuggled into a country will pay a smuggler a set fee and once the destination point is reached the smuggled person is free to leave, thereby never seeing the smuggler again (The world revolution, 2001).

Human trafficking (trafficking in persons), at its most basic level, is defined by the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 as (a) the recruitment, harboring, transporting, supplying, or obtaining a person for labor or services through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of involuntary servitude or slavery; or (b) sex trafficking in which a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud, or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform sex acts is under 18 years of age (Logan, Walker & Hunt, 2009). Some of the differences that separate human trafficking from a person being smuggled could involve how the person enters the country, what happens once they reach their point of destination and the fee owed to the transporter. Trafficked victims do not necessarily enter a country illegally. A trafficker may have organized legitimate travel documents. In these cases there is no reason for the victim to enter the country in secret (The world revolution, 2001). It is also what happens to a trafficked victim once they arrive at their destination, which distinguishes them from people who migrate or are smuggled into a country (The world revolution, 2001).

According to U.S. Government estimates, 600,000 to 800,000 victims are trafficked globally each year and 14,500 to 17,500 are trafficked into the United States (U.S. Department of State, 2006). Human trafficking is an equal opportunity crime that is very profitable. Men, women, and children alike are all prime targets for traffickers. Without regard to nationality of victims and with greed as their motivation, traffickers seek to exploit those who are most vulnerable – the young, the desperate, and the easily manipulated (U.S. Department of State, 2008). Manipulation and force are used on adults and children alike in this modern day slavery. Because human trafficking generates an estimated \$32 billion on a yearly basis it has become the second-most popular criminal activity in the world. (US Newswire 2009) In the 2005 Trafficking In Persons Report, the FBI reports that the profits from human trafficking, which are estimated at \$9.5 billion in annual revenue, fuels other criminal activities (U.S. Department of State, 2005).

If law enforcement wants to identify and rescue victims they must also understand why victims are reluctant to speak to them even after they have escaped from their traffickers or have been arrested for other crimes, such as prostitution. Logan, Walker, and Hunt identify four main themes about what keeps victims entrapped (2009). In their article, *“Understanding Human Trafficking in the United States”*, Logan, Walker, and Hunt report that fear, lack of knowledge about alternatives, isolation, and physical and psychological

confinement is what binds victims to their traffickers (2009). The biggest factor of the four was fear. As it relates to human trafficking, fear comes in many forms to include; physical abuse, being jailed, other legal problems, deportation, threats of violence against family members and law enforcement in general (Logan, Walker, & Hunt, 2009).

Investigative Awareness

Law enforcement must understand that human trafficking did not just begin within the last several years; it has been in existence for decades. It has only recently become the focus of law enforcement as the knowledge and experience related to this crime grows. In the NORC final report, "*Finding Victims of Human Trafficking*", three agencies that are just now starting to grapple with the issue of human trafficking are law enforcement, prosecutors, and many service providing organizations (Newton, Mulcahy, & Martin, 2008). "Not unlike domestic violence or sexual harassment in the early 1980s or stalking and hate crimes in the 1990s, trafficking in persons (particularly domestic trafficking) is a concept as well as a legal term with which law enforcement, prosecutors, and many service providing organizations have had little experience" (Newton, Mulcahy, & Martin, 2008).

Communication and awareness are essential for this type of investigation to be successful. The lack of communication between agencies; law enforcement and service providers alike, tend to limit success. Although agencies do work together on human trafficking cases, some agencies report that tension and the lack of cooperation hamper investigations (Newton, Mulcahy, and Martin, 2008). Newton, Mulcahy, and Martin's report also indicates that the likelihood of success will increase if the importance of better communication and systematize inter-agency cooperation is emphasized (2008). The general lack of awareness by law enforcement, prosecutors, and service providers was one of the primary findings in the study completed by Newton, Mulcahy, and Martin (2008). Although law enforcement is aware that human trafficking is occurring they must also be aware of other organizations outside of their circle that can assist in the fight against human trafficking. Frequently, law enforcement officers could not identify individual service providers to talk to about human trafficking issues (Newton, Mulcahy, & Martin, 2008).

Investigative Techniques

Law enforcement must continually change their training and enforcement methods as crime trends change. As stated in "*Identifying the Victims of Human Trafficking*", training is important given the unique dynamic of many human trafficking investigations (Tiapula & Turkel, 2008). Traditional prostitution stings will not be successful in identifying victims of human trafficking. Law enforcement must change the way they perceive the prostitute. According to Tiapula and Turkel, a shift in the perception of the adolescents and young adults in these cases as victims of prostitution/trafficking rather than as defendants in prostitution cases must take place to be successful (2008). During prostitution stings, investigators routinely overlook trafficking victims during post arrest interviews. "Sixty percent of Immigrant women who were trafficked into sex work had been arrested, some as many as ten times, for prostitution-related

offenses without ever being identified as trafficked” (US Newswire, 2009). In June 2009, Seattle police arrest five women in a weekend prostitute detail and release one even after being warned by a family member that one of the arrested women had said, “She indicated she was being held in Seattle against her will” (McNerthney, 2009). Traditional prostitution raids entail law enforcement coming in fast, hard, and in some cases guns out. Suspects are then put down on the ground, arrested, and transported to jail, sometimes without being interviewed. According to the US Newswire, raids are not an effective tool and can be counter-productive to anti-trafficking efforts (2009). In fact, these traditional techniques further traumatize, intimidate and sometimes violate the rights of people who have been trafficked (US Newswire, 2009).

Arresting prostitutes during raid is not the end of the investigation, but the beginning. According to Tiapula and Turkel, interviewing victims of human trafficking is critical component of the trafficking investigation and prosecution (2008). Interviewers need to recognize that the format and dynamics of these interviews may be significantly different than interviews for more traditional child sexual abuse investigations (Tiapula and Turkel, 2008). A critical part of the human trafficking investigations is gaining the victim’s trust. As stated in *“Identifying the Victims of Human Trafficking”*, perhaps the most important in these cases is earning the trust of the victim... (Tiapula & Turkel, 2008).

Collaborative effort

Traditionally, law enforcement agencies tend to keep investigations within their own agency and are reluctant to work with non-governmental agencies, let alone other law enforcement agencies. A successful response to human trafficking requires a collaborative relationship with both federal authorities and community service providers (IACP, 2009). Establishing positive, coordinated working relationships with federal law enforcement agencies, victim service providers, and prosecutors will enable you to put mutually agreed upon procedures and partnerships in place in advance of a case (IACP, 2009). It is critical that community partnerships are fostered with many different organizations. These organizations must include victim service providers, local ethnic community leaders, medical and mental health providers, and legal advocates (IACP, 2009). Investigators must be willing to invest time and effort in fostering these partnerships (Scott & Dedel, 2005).

The media is another agency that law enforcement traditionally is reluctant to include in their investigations. But, according to the 2005 Trafficking in Persons (TIPS) report, the media plays an indispensable role in educating us about the many manifestations of human trafficking (U.S. Department of State, 2005). The media can assist in the following categories; illuminate the problem, provide a help line, and identify traffickers and protect the victims (U.S. Department of State, 2005).

Yes, human trafficking is a crime, but for the community it is also a problem. Law enforcement investigators are considered problem-solvers. As stated in the *“Problem Oriented Guides for Police, Street Prostitution”*, an effective problem-solver must know how to forge genuine partnerships with

others and be prepared to invest considerable effort in making these partnerships work (Scott & Dedel, 2005).

Method

The purpose of this research is identify the three primary factors that law enforcement agencies must improve on in order to increase their effectiveness in identifying and rescuing victims of human trafficking. These three primary factors include training, investigative methods, and multi-agency collaboration. To accomplish this, a hybrid form of data collection was used that included a written survey with law enforcement agencies within the State of Florida and personal interviews with subject matter experts from two fields; law enforcement, and non-governmental agencies.

Using a contact list, the survey was sent to a total of 48 law enforcement agencies within the State of Florida. The forty-eight surveys were distributed in the following manner; 47.9% to Sheriff's Offices, 47.9% to Municipal Police Departments, 2.1% to a state agency and 2.1% to a task force operating within a municipality. The agencies were randomly selected to receive the written survey to ensure a various response was received from throughout the state. Contact was made, via e-mail, with a supervisor from each agency. The supervisor was requested to either complete the survey or forward it to a investigator that deals with enforcement of sex related businesses, such as, prostitution, gentlemen's clubs and massage parlors. The survey consisted of twenty-five questions requiring a yes or no response (see appendix A). Survey questions were designed to identify what percentage of law enforcement agencies differentiate between human trafficking and human smuggling, is there a potential for human trafficking cases within their jurisdictions, whether law enforcement has improved upon their traditional enforcement and investigative methods through specialized training, and their level of awareness about the non-governmental agencies within their communities.

A personal interview was then conducted with a subject matter expert assigned to the Clearwater/Tampa Bay Area Human Trafficking Task Force, Officer James McBride. The interview focused on three topics; why the task force got started, what types of traditional enforcement and investigative methods must law enforcement agencies change to become successful in rescuing victims of human trafficking, and can law enforcement agencies be successful in rescuing victims of human trafficking without forming collaborative partnerships.

The second personal interview conducted was with the Director of Social Services for the Salvation Army, a non-governmental organization. The interview focused on three topics; how this organization became involved with human trafficking victims, did they have to change the way their organization functioned to assist law enforcement and victims of human trafficking, and do they think a collaborative partnership with law enforcement is critical to the success of rescuing victims of human trafficking.

As it relates the analysis of the individual questions within the survey, the state agency's responses were included with the Sheriff's offices responses due to their statewide jurisdiction while the municipal task force's responses were

included in the municipal police department's responses. During the analysis all percentage rates were rounded to the nearest tenth.

Results

Forty-eight survey's were e-mailed to law enforcement agencies around the state and a total of twenty-eight surveys were completed and returned, which equates to a 56.3% response rate. The sheriff's offices returned 65.2% of the twenty-three surveys sent out to those agencies. The municipal police departments returned 47.8% of the twenty-three surveys sent to their agencies. Both the state agency and the municipal task force returned the one survey sent to each of them for a 100% response rate.

Differentiating between human smuggling and human trafficking was the first question asked of each of the agencies. Of the twenty-eight agencies that responded, 64.3% of them answered "yes", indicating that their agency does define human smuggling and human trafficking separately.

All the agencies were asked several questions as it relates to prostitution to include if they make arrests for the violation of prostitution as well as whether they ask those they arrest questions related to human trafficking? Of the twenty-eight agencies that responded, 100% of them answered "yes" to making arrests for prostitution, but only 46.4% of these same agencies answered "yes" to asking the arrested prostitute questions related to human trafficking. When interviewing prostitutes, massage parlor and gentlemen's club employees 28.6% of the agencies indicated that they do interview the arrested more than one time, while 64.3% indicated that they do not conduct more than one interview.

The relationship law enforcement agencies have with other non-law enforcement agencies was then probed in the survey. Specifically, questions were created to ascertain the agency's tendency to work with non-governmental agencies and media outlets during and after their human trafficking investigation. However, when agencies were asked about their interaction with non-governmental agencies, only 14.3% indicated that they had non-governmental agency members accompany them on their prostitution operations. Also, only 32.1% indicated that they have collaborated with non-governmental agencies during their human trafficking investigations. Furthermore, when asked, how many non-governmental organizations have you worked with during your human trafficking investigations? A total of 71.4% of the agencies indicated they had not worked with any non-governmental agencies. As it relates to the media involvement, 25% of the responses received indicated that they get the media involved following their investigation.

Next, questions related to training were then asked. Of the twenty-eight responses 50% answered "yes" when asked if they had attended a formalized training course relating to human trafficking investigations. When asked if their respective agencies provide human trafficking training to their patrol officers, only 42.9% answered "yes" while 53.6% answered "no".

The survey questions were sent to multiple agencies throughout the State of Florida in an effort to get a mixed sample of county and city agencies. Of all the responders, 53.6% were county agencies while 39.3% were city agencies.

Of these agencies 75% of them policed a population between 100,000 to 400,000 while 14.3% policed a population that exceeded 1 million and 10.7% were responsible for a population between 500,000 to 1 million. Looking at the jurisdictional boundaries of these agencies, 64.3% indicated that part of their area of responsibility included a coastal community, while 35.7% did not.

Finally, agencies were asked if they had seen a noticeable increase in the number of human trafficking victims identified during their investigations. Only 17.9% indicated that they had, while 46.4% answered "no" and 35.7% indicated that they have had no investigation as of the date of the survey.

On April 9, 2010 Officer James McBride, a 15 year veteran of the Clearwater Police Department in Clearwater, Florida and an 8 year veteran of the United States Navy was interviewed. Officer McBride was selected as a subject matter expert in the field of human trafficking for his knowledge, training, and experience. Officer McBride is currently assigned to the Clearwater Tampa Bay Area Human Trafficking Task Force. Officer McBride was first introduced to the term human trafficking while serving in the United States Navy. During his career as a law enforcement officer, Officer McBride has attended and successfully completed several training courses such as; 8-hour basic human trafficking course, a 40-hour advanced human trafficking course, 40-hour advanced sex crimes course, the shared hope international conference for domestic juvenile sex trafficking, and the annual human trafficking conference held around the United States. In fact, in 2010 he will be presenting on the topic of human trafficking at the Southeast Regional Intelligence Conference.

During the interview, Officer McBride was asked several questions about the following; historical involvement of law enforcement in human trafficking, current methods being utilized by law enforcement, training, and multi-agency cooperation, however he was not asked any of the questions in the survey.

Twenty-five years ago the word "human trafficking" was not part of law enforcement's vocabulary. It has only recently caught the attention of the Federal government and local law enforcement. In 2000 the United States government realized human trafficking was becoming an issue and enacted federal law known as "The Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act of 2000". This act was two-fold in that it provided certain services for victims of human trafficking while also allowing local law enforcement to receive funding and resources that enabled them to form task forces like the one Officer McBride is a member of, the Clearwater Tampa Bay Area Human Trafficking Task Force. Based on his knowledge, training, and experience Officer McBride believes law enforcement should be concerned about human trafficking now and in the future.

According to Officer McBride, interconnectivity is the reason why law enforcement should be concerned. The crime of human trafficking is interconnected to many other crimes that law enforcement is already dealing with. Some of these crimes include the following; prostitution, smuggling, drugs, document fraud, gangs, kidnapping, false imprisonment, and organized crime. Appeal is another reason why human trafficking continues to grow in the United States as well as the world.

Officer McBride stated that human trafficking is very appealing to criminals because it is a very lucrative business. He went on to explain that it is not like selling drugs where the drug trafficker experiences a onetime profit, but instead the human trafficker realizes a re-occurring profit. Other than maintaining complete control over the victim, the trafficker exerts minimal effort to receive maximum profits. He provided me with an example in which a female victim being trafficked can make \$4,000 to \$6,000 a week for as long as she is held by the trafficker. However, Officer McBride also added that females are not the only victims.

Officer McBride explained that victim types vary as much as the crime of human trafficking itself. Women, men, and children of all ages are trafficked everyday, but it appears that trafficker's seek out the most vulnerable. Those who are runaways, mentally challenged, financially strapped, or are desperate to survive, maybe a trafficker's next victim. Officer McBride agreed that human traffickers do not discriminate when it comes to selecting a victim. Many cannot understand why victims remain with their traffickers instead of escaping when the opportunity arises.

Officer McBride went on to explain how traffickers use fear, intimidation, coercion, deceit, and both physical and mental abuse on their victims. He continued by saying that the victims are stripped of all of their identification, locked in the home, forced to consume drugs, and kept under constant guard. If they do not follow instructions or appear to be losing their sense of fear the trafficker's will rape and/or beat them in front of other victims to ensure compliance. Officer McBride also reminded me that the base of the traffickers operation is as diverse as the victims themselves.

Officer McBride was then asked to expand on where traffickers set-up their base of operation. According to Officer McBride, traffickers utilize hotels, motels, the internet, and rental properties to conceal their operation. Traffickers use hotels rated from 5-stars to no stars and secluded rental properties to homes in affluent neighborhoods. A good depiction of this occurred during one of his investigations when it was determined that a trafficking suspect had set-up his base of operation directly across the street from a law enforcement officer. He also told me that the Pinellas County Sheriff's Office dismantled a trafficking organization that involved at least four victims who were being held against their will with the suspected trafficker in a \$600,000 home in an affluent neighborhood, in a small beach community that was serviced by a small law enforcement agency. The law enforcement agency as well as the neighbors did not know this operation was occurring within their city. Cooperation is the key to success in identifying victims of human trafficking.

In conclusion, Officer McBride stated that law enforcement must change their traditional methods of operation if they want to be successful in combating human trafficking. Personnel, interviewing techniques, and multi-agency cooperation must be modified to increase the ability of law enforcement agencies to identify victims of human trafficking. As a reminder, officer safety is paramount during any law enforcement operation however consider taking a victim advocate, a non-governmental agency member, or officers in plain clothes with

no identifying insignia on them, with you during prostitution stings or raids on massage parlor or gentlemen's clubs type businesses. These people can assist with interviews. Officers must be able to look past the initial charge of prostitution when conducting interviews. Do not expect much during the first interview. Multiple interviews must be conducted before potential victims will start to trust the interviewer and open up and reveal what they have been through. It is essential that agencies foster working relationships with non-governmental agencies as these relationships are needed before you find a victim. Once arrests have been made and the organization has been dismantled, agencies must get the media involved. The media can assist with locating other victims as well as educating the public to be vigilant about their neighborhood surroundings.

On April 14, 2010 a subject matter expert with the well known non-governmental agency, the Salvation Army was interviewed. Mr. Kip Corriveau is the Director of Social Services for the Salvation Army in Clearwater, Florida. Mr. Corriveau has gained 7-years of experience in the field of social work that includes the following; 4-years with the Salvation Army, 2-years as a case manager, and one year at the Ron Grace House. Mr. Corriveau holds a Master Degree in Social Work from Case Western Missouri University and a Masters Degree in Divinity from St. Mary's Seminary University. During the interview Mr. Corriveau was asked several questions relating to his experience with human trafficking victims and the relationship law enforcement should have with NGO's. None of the questions utilized in the survey were asked during this interview.

According to Mr. Corriveau, he first became involved in human trafficking when he attended some statewide training on how to deal with victims. Based on his recollection, Mr. Corriveau estimates he has dealt with approximately sixty-six human trafficking victims; 6 sex trafficking, 5 domestic, 28 international, and 27 labor trafficking victims. Based on the number of victims he has come in contact with, I asked Mr. Corriveau to expand on what human trafficking victims have said as it relates to law enforcement. He said, overall he has heard positive comments about local law enforcement, but has heard negative comments about federal authorities, especially those enforcing the immigration laws. The number one frustration for human trafficking victims as well as NGO's is the complex immigration laws. Mr. Corriveau believes that current immigration laws need to be changed. He also believes the key to success lies in good relationships with other agencies.

If law enforcement wants to be successful in combating human trafficking violations they must be willing to form close partnerships with NGO's. Mr. Corriveau admitted that his organization did not really have a relationship with the local law enforcement agencies in the past, but a relationship developed after the Clearwater Tampa Bay Area Human Trafficking Task Force formed. Eventually, the task force approached the Salvation Army and a good, working relationship formed. This relationship is built on trust. According to Mr. Corriveau, "to get trust you have to give trust". Mr. Corriveau also mentioned that NGO's can be a big help to law enforcement by freeing up investigators. Although NGO's cannot seek out victims they can take custody of the victim once

the investigator finds them, which will free up the investigator to follow-up his or her investigation. So, with this relationship formed the Clearwater chapter of the Salvation Army started working hand in hand with the task force. In 2007 the Salvation Army received its first two human trafficking victims. Crucial services are what the Salvation Army does for human trafficking victims.

An NGO type organization plays a big role in providing services to the victim. They can immediately provide many basic necessities, such as; food, clothing, toiletries, housing, and sometimes more importantly, a sense of security. Trafficking victims brought to the Salvation Army will be placed in a small apartment style room that includes a small kitchenette. Access to the building is by security key card, which each victim receives that provides them a sense of security as well as they can come and go as they please. Victims can remain for up to 1 year if needed, which adds to the sense of security. In time, trust is built and the victim starts to open up more and more each day, which ultimately will assist the law enforcement investigation.

Concluding the interview Mr. Corriveau could not stress how important it is for law enforcement to foster relationships with NGO type organizations. He states that the two organizations cannot function without one another. He suggests agencies meet and plan ahead. Change the method of operation and bring personnel from your NGO or victim advocate group along when contacting potential victims. Be prepared, if you are dealing with female victims then have a female NGO, victim advocate, or even a female officer in plain clothes. You want to start building trust with the victim almost immediately and uniformed officers will have difficulty doing that. Remember, "To get trust you have to give trust".

Discussion

After analyzing the data from the surveys writer found it interesting that 100% of the agencies that responded confirmed that they do make arrests for the crime of prostitution, but only 17.9% observed an increase in human trafficking cases while at the same time 46.4% said they did not notice an increase and 35.7% of the agencies did not have any investigations to date. These agencies should ask themselves, are these numbers truly accurate or are they missing something? Agencies should review the methods currently being utilized during prostitution stings massage parlor raids, and gentlemen's club investigations.

As it relates to these types of investigations, traditionally law enforcement agencies have been trained to conduct undercover investigations, keeping those who are not directly involved on a need to know basis. Although law enforcement in general has improved in the area of inter-agency cooperation since 9-11-2001, could this be one of the reasons why most agencies surveyed did not experience an increase or have any human trafficking investigations to date? As the two interviews indicated, it is crucial that law enforcement break down the walls of secrecy and start working closer with non-governmental agencies. As proven by the survey, of the twenty-eight agencies that responded, 71.4% indicated that they have never work with any non-governmental agencies during any investigations involving human trafficking. This was also consistent with the fact that 85.7% of the agencies did not have personnel from a non-governmental agency accompany them when contacting suspected prostitutes.

Law enforcement agencies must come to the realization that others are not only willing to help, but can bring some expertise to their investigation that they themselves cannot. Interviewing methods are another area that law enforcement must consider changing.

Traditionally, law enforcement officers have been trained to do the following; arrest, read the suspect their Miranda warnings, interview them and then lock them up. The survey confirmed this when 64.3% of the responding agencies only conducted one interview with suspects arrested in a massage parlor, gentlemen's club or for prostitution. The arresting officers must be able to consider the fact that this suspect could very well be a victim of human trafficking. Officers must be able to look past the original charge of prostitution and ask some simple question relating to human trafficking. Officers must also be aware of the psychology used by traffickers to keep victims under their control. Force, fraud, and coercion are used on a daily basis and victims are repeatedly told that the police will not believe anything they tell them and they will just be arrested and put in jail. Officers must realize that it will take a number of interviews before the potential victim will begin to trust law enforcement and tell what they have been through. According to Officer McBride, it will usually take a minimum of six interviews with the victim before relevant information is received. Again, this is where the non-governmental agency personnel can assist. They are not law enforcement, but they can provide a sense of security to the victim, which will foster that level of trust needed for that victim to begin to open up. Training and who receives it is another area that law enforcement should re-evaluate within their respective agencies.

When deciding on which officers to provide training to, agencies must look at who comes in contact with potential victims first, the detective or patrol officers. As the survey revealed, only 42.9% of the agencies provide some type of human trafficking training to their patrol officers. Patrol officers are on the front lines; they come in contact with potential victims more times during their daily shift than a detective will. Another key point that Officer McBride suggested was to provide human trafficking training to the agencies command staff, all the way up the chain of command to the Chief or Sheriff. Command staff must understand the intricacies of a human trafficking investigation. These investigations are lengthy; require numerous personnel hours, and cooperative resources from other agencies. A working relationship with the media is the final method that law enforcement needs to re-evaluate and consider improving.

Traditionally, the tendency of law enforcement agencies was to shy away from bringing the media into such an investigation as the survey reflected. Only 25% of the agencies indicated that they collaborate with media outlets following a human trafficking investigation. It is all a matter of timing when it comes to involving the media. Understandably, the investigator needs to maintain investigative security, but when the arrests are made and the organization is dismantled then at that point the media can help. The media has the ability to educate the public and to assist in bringing other victims forward that will create more leads and further your investigation. Consider improving your agencies

relationship with the media and give them the opportunity to assist you and others in your investigation.

Recommendations

In reviewing the results of the survey and the interviews with the two subject matter experts, some recommendations can be made.

- Educate command staff, detectives, and patrol officers alike with free or inexpensive training on human trafficking by going to the following website;
 - <http://www.jpmaweb.com/etrain/index.asp?o=158>
- Identify non-governmental agencies within your respective agencies that can provide resources to your victims.
- Foster good working relationships with these identified non-governmental agencies.
- Provide officers with literature that contains simple questions that can be asked that will help identify victims of human trafficking.
- Consider bringing non-governmental personnel or victim advocates on prostitute stings or massage parlor raids.
- Interview potential victims multiple times.
- Educate officers that every prostitute may be committing prostitution, but not all are prostitutes.

Timothy Pelella was born and raised in upstate New York and moved to Pinellas County, Florida in 1986. He has been employed with the Pinellas County Sheriff's Office for 24 years and currently holds the rank of Lieutenant. He is assigned to the Child Protection Investigation Division. Tim has a Bachelor's Degree in Business Administration from Tampa College and is pursuing a Bachelor's Degree of Applied Science in Paralegal Studies from St. Pete College.

REFERENCES

- International Association of Chiefs of Police, . (2006). *The Crime of human trafficking: a law enforcement guide to identification and investigation*. Alexandria, VA: International Association of Chiefs of Police.
- Logan, T.K., Walker, R., & Hunt, G. (2009). Understanding human trafficking in the United States. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 10(1), Retrieved on January 27, 2010 from <http://tva.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/10/1/3>
- McNerthney, C. (2009, June 11). *Details on police busts along aurora*. Retrieved on February 8, 2010 from <http://blog.seattlepi.com/seattle911/archives/171023.asp>
- Newton, P.J., Mulcahy, T.M., & Martin, S.E. (2008, September). *Norc final report; finding victims of human trafficking*. Retrieved January 27, 2010 from <http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/224393.pdf>
- “Report Finds That Raids Are Not an Effective Tool Against Human Trafficking.” *US Newswire* 9 Jan. 2009. *Psychology Collection*. Web. 27 Jan. 2010 http://find.galegroup.com/gtx/start.do?userGroupName=21260_lclcp&prodId=PPPC>
- Scott, M., & Dedel, K. (2006). *Problem-oriented guides for police; problem-specific guides series; street prostitution* [2nd ed., pp. iii]. (Adobe Digital Editions version), Retrieved on February 8, 2010 from <http://www.cops.usdoj.gov/pdf/pop/e10062633.pdf>
- The world revolution, . (2001, November). *Human trafficking-questions answered*. Retrieved on January 30, 2010 from <http://worldrevolution.org/Projects/Webguide/GuideArticle.asp?ID=1413>
- Tiapula, S., & Turkel, A. (2008). Identifying the victims of human trafficking. *The Prosecutor, Journal of the National District Attorneys Association*, 2. Retrieved on January 30, 2010 from http://www.ndaa.org/pdf/prosecut092008_feat_identvic.pdf
- United States Department of State, . (2006, April 1). *Distinctions between human smuggling and human trafficking*. Retrieved on February 8, 2010 from <http://www.state.gov/m/ds/hstcenter/90434.htm> 8,
- United States Department of State, . (2008, December). *Human smuggling and trafficking center: domestic human trafficking; an internal issue*. Retrieved on February 8, 2010 from <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/113612.pdf>

United States Department of State, . (2005, June). *Trafficking in persons report*. Retrieved on February 9, 2010 from <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/47255.pdf>

APPENDIX A

PINELLAS COUNTY SHERIFF'S OFFICE
COMBATING HUMAN TRAFFICKING – SURVEY

Please take a moment to complete each of the following questions by using the tab button to navigate between responses and push the spacebar to select your answer. Only the results of the survey will be included in the research paper, your agency's name and individual responses will not.

Please return completed survey to Lt. Tim Pelella at tpelella@pcsonet.com **no later than April 1, 2010.**

1. Does your agency differentiate between human trafficking and smuggling?

Yes No

2. Does your agency make arrests for prostitution?

Yes No

3. Does your agency utilize a tactical team when conducting raids on suspected brothels or massage parlors?

Yes No Do not conduct raids

4. Do non-governmental organization (NGO) personnel accompany you or your agency when contacting known or suspected prostitutes?

Yes No

5. When interviewing employees of massage parlors or gentlemen's clubs do you ask them, if they are doing this freely and can leave at any time?

Yes No

6. When interviewing a person who has been arrested for prostitution do you ask them if they or their friends or family have been threatened?

Yes No

7. Does your agency have an investigator or unit dedicated to investigating sex related violations occurring at such businesses as massage parlors and gentlemen's clubs?

Yes No

8. Do you interview a person(s) who has been arrested for prostitution in a massage parlor or gentlemen's club more than one time?

Yes No How many times:

9. When interviewing those who have been arrested for prostitution or other sex related offenses do you ask them questions relating to human trafficking?

Yes No

10. Have you attended a formalized training course related to human trafficking?

Yes No

11. Does your agency provide human trafficking training to patrol officers/Deputies?

Yes No

12. Does your agency participate on any task forces related to the investigation of human trafficking?

Yes No

13. During a human trafficking investigation do you collaborate with other law enforcement agencies?

Yes No No investigations to date

14. During a human trafficking investigation do you collaborate with non-governmental agencies?

Yes No No investigations to date

15. How many non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have you worked with during investigations of human trafficking?

16. Does your agency collaborate with media outlets following the human trafficking investigation?

Yes No No investigations to date

17. How many law enforcement officers does your agency employ?

50-100 101-300 301-600 601-1000 1001 +

18. What is the population of the jurisdiction you serve?

less 100,000 100,000-400,000 500,000-1 million

over 1 million

19. What type of agency are you employed by?

County City

20. Rank of person completing this survey?

21. How many years of service do you have?

22. Does your agency's jurisdictional boundary include a coastal community?

Yes No

23. Has your agency experienced a noticeable increase in the number of human trafficking victims that have been identified through your investigations?

Yes

No

No investigations to date

24. If you have any additional comments or experiences, as it relates to identifying victims of human trafficking please feel free to add them here.
25. If you would like a copy of the completed survey, please provide your e-mail address below.