

# **Education vs Experience: Do Mandatory Education Requirements Help or Hinder Finding the Best Leaders in Law Enforcement Agencies?**

**Shannon McBride**

## ***Abstract***

*This study examined the ever-present debate of education vs. work experience in the area of law enforcement professionals. In the last decade it has become common practice for hiring managers to place degree requirements for employment position that in previous years did not exist. Law enforcement agencies followed suit in effort to professionalize the field of law enforcement. Command staff members of thirty-four different law enforcement agencies were surveyed on their opinions regarding the skill sets that are needed to be a successful leader of an agency. Independent research and the feedback of these law enforcement professionals was evaluated to determine if advanced degree requirements for high level positions is the best practice or should a greater emphasis be placed on the experience and training of a candidate, in order to place the most qualified persons in these leadership roles.*

## **Introduction**

The debate of education vs. work experience is a dispute that has been ongoing for decades. You could ask anyone and probably find that they have an opinion on the subject and a passionate one at that. Employers across the world evaluate this topic when structuring job postings and hiring managers in all fields have to scrutinize these factors when interviewing candidates for hire or promotion. The field of law enforcement is not left out of this debate. With the ongoing call for increased professionalism in law enforcement today, this subject is just as important to examine now as it was in the early 1900s when the first call for formally educated police officers was made in this country by Police Chief August Vollmar (Dinkelspiel, 2010).

The profession of law enforcement encompasses many different disciplines and the roles of a criminal justice professional vary widely depending upon the agency, assignment, and/or rank. The education and experience needed to excel in many different positions could be extensively evaluated. For the purpose of this study the focus is on the area of command staff for law enforcement agencies. The senior leadership of any department can influence the entire organization. A good leader can improve the staff morale, increase public trust, and maximize the overall effectiveness of an agency. Conversely a bad leader can result in high staff turnover, increased liability and the waste of resources allotted to them. With this in mind, the selection of an agency's command staff is an important decision with wide-spread effects. Therefore, the qualifications for a supervisor to attain these top positions should be considered carefully.

Does a formal education requirement for senior leadership help or hinder the best candidates from being chosen for the position? Should a supervisor's career be stunted due to a lack of a degree? Should a supervisor holding a master's degree be promoted

to a command staff position with inferior work experience? While an ideal leader would possess both a formal education and a vast amount of work experience, which of the two is of greater importance when evaluating their value as a possible leader for an agency? Through analysis of research on these issues the goal is to attain answers to these questions. Providing a better understanding of how these factors shape the future leaders of law enforcement agencies could provide insight for those seeking these opportunities and those tasked with choosing them.

## **Literature Review**

### **Education VS Experience**

The famous scientist Albert Einstein said, “the only source of knowledge is experience” (Einstein, 1922). If you examine this quote it heightens the quandary in the comparison of the values of education and work experience when the literal definitions of these are parallel. The definition of education is a body of knowledge gained while being educated and the definition of experience is knowledge acquired over a period of time, especially that gained in a particular profession (Bing Dictionary, 2020). With the similarities just by definition there is ample reason to lend credence to a view on either being superior to the other. There are many studies that take a stand on their side of the debate but unfortunately many take a middle of the road approach leaving the examiner to form their own opinion in lieu of a definitive answer (Reddy, 2016).

### **Pro Education**

You would be hard pressed to watch television nowadays without seeing ads for universities. Formal education is on the minds of people of all ages. High school students are inundated with advisors, family members, and peers informing them that they must obtain a bachelor’s degree to be successful. Working adults consistently consider furthering their education to improve their chances for promotion or increase their chances of gaining better employment. This is a valid line of thought seeing a bachelor’s degree is now seen as a requirement to enter the work force when in previous years only a high school diploma was needed (Carnevale, Strohl, & Menton, 2008). Employers across all genres have increased the educational requirements for positions reinforcing the belief that a degree is necessary to gain employment in a competitive job market. These factors have contributed to reshaping what today’s workforce looks like. According to a report by CBS News the number of employed college graduates has increased by 21% since December 2007 while the number of employed persons with only a high school diploma has dropped by almost 8% (Associated Press, 2017).

Gaining employment is not the only reward of earning a degree. Research has shown that having a higher level of education can result in higher earnings over their lifespan and ensures a higher level of job security. According to a report by the Bureau of Labor Statistics in 2018, it shows that high school graduates have an average yearly income of 30,000.00, bachelor’s graduates have an average yearly income of 50,000.00, and those with a higher-level degree have an average yearly income of 70,000.00

(Torpey, 2018). Based on this research there are substantial monetary benefits to pursuing a collegiate level of education. This same report evaluated the unemployment rates in comparison to education level and it showed that high school graduates experience an average of a 4.5% unemployment rate, bachelor's graduates experience an average of a 2.5% unemployment rate, and those with a higher-level degree experience of a 2% unemployment rate (Torpey, 2018). This information supports the idea that the higher level of education directly correlates to a stable employment throughout the span of a career. There are varying reasons that effect the decision on whether to pursue a degree or not, but the decision will have a major impact on their professional and personal life (Day & Newburger, 2002).

With an increased percentage of the workforce holding an advanced degree, employers are not at risk of limiting the applicant pool by requiring a college education to acquire a position. Companies believe that by graduating college an applicant has acquired the skills necessary to be an asset to their business. Most employers believe that college graduates show a level of commitment, good communication skills, the ability to problem solve through critical thinking, advanced intelligence, and better interpersonal skills. It would be easy to believe that college graduates have procured these skills, but it could be naïve to believe that these qualities are exclusive to degree holders (Ha, n.d.).

## **Pro Experience**

In the debate of education vs. work experience it could be plausible to believe that an employee that has gained proven skills through time spent in a profession would be more valuable than a person that has completed studying the theories of a profession. With examples of success stories of college dropouts such as Bill Gates and Mark Zuckerberg, society may have to reevaluate the belief of past decades which equated a college education as indicator of the most valuable employee. Mark Edwards, the Executive Director of Opportunity Nation stated, "We've done a disservice in this country by suggesting that there's only one path to success, which is to get a bachelor's degree" (Bidwell, 2014) This line of thinking supports the idea that the skills gained through actual participation in the work force may be as important or possibly more important than gaining an advanced degree.

Employers across many fields agree on the skills necessary to make an employee seen as a valued member of their organizations but admit that recent college graduates are lacking these skills. It cannot be denied that there are several fields where a degree should be mandatory but that should not be true if the scope of work is carefully considered. There are many occupations where specific certifications are mandated by state or federal regulatory guidelines. In these fields it is reasonable to have a minimum requirement to meet those standards: but there is a trend of companies that will not consider a candidate for employment and/or promotion without a degree even if that degree has no correlation to the actual work that will be performed. An advanced degree is seen as an automatic qualification for consideration while the lack of a degree is an immediate disqualifier. There is not consideration given to the knowledge gained by being in the work force for many years and if hiring managers continue to draft job postings with minimum education requirements using lines of thought like everyone else is doing it or that's the way it has been employers will continue to experience a skills gap in their new

employees (Ha, n.d.). With work experience employees develop soft skills such as how to function in a workplace, navigating internal politics, and managing the work/life balance that people who have been in the cocooned environment of a college atmosphere have not mastered yet. Real life skills that are required to be a successful member of a team are not taught in traditional universities. Recently 15 major companies, including Apple and Google, have dropped their mandatory degree requirement. The companies referenced the “over-credentialing” of the work force as a factor preventing them from finding qualified workers for many jobs and a high turnover rate amongst their businesses. If such large corporations such as these can recognize the degree inflation in job requirements and attempt to correct it, there may be hope that other agencies across all fields will follow their lead (Hess & Addison, 2018).

### **Education vs. Experience in Law Enforcement**

The educational needs for persons working in the law enforcement field have been evaluated for a hundred years. Individual studies, research by agencies, and even government studies have been dedicated to the subject. In all these studies there is a reoccurring belief that there is a need for formal education in law enforcement and the level of this education only increases as the time passes. While there is a general agreement in the benefits and the need for an advanced degree for law enforcement professionals the actual overall requirement by agencies to possess this degree does not match.

According to U.S. Department of Justice 82% of police departments had a minimum educational requirement of a high school diploma. (DOJ, 2011). These numbers are contradictory to the studies on the higher educational needs of law enforcement employees. Understandably agencies are reluctant to mandate a degree for entrance into a law enforcement career fearing a smaller applicant pool and possible litigation from discriminatory hiring practices as civil servants. The oppositional hiring practices to the expressed desire for college educated officers could also be a byproduct of the ever-present debate on education vs. experience. Departments may recognize that an employee with a college degree may be nice to have but it will not necessarily make them a good officer.

While the need for an officer to be college educated is muddled are the educational requirements of a law enforcement supervisor any clearer? Most promotions in law enforcement agencies are internal therefore the educational requirement for promotion will be determined by the culture of each organization. The question is should there be an educational requirement for advancement to a supervisor role in a department or should there be a higher weight placed on specialized skills and experience with the agency? Studies have found that police officers with bachelor's degrees performed on the same level as officers with ten years' experience; so, a valid argument can be made on the importance of either when being considered for promotion (Goff, 2017). While an aspect to any good supervisor as well as any law enforcement professional is a continued interest in learning, the attainment of knowledge does not only occur by gaining a degree.

## **Law Enforcement Leadership**

Most of what is written about law enforcement leadership uses data borrowed from other disciplines like the military and private corporations. Most of this information transfers easily to the realm of public safety but law enforcement leadership is a specialized skill. A good amount of the information gathered regarding leadership in law enforcement is anecdotal or based on case studies (Schafer, 2008). The importance of leadership in any organization is undeniable. In recent years there has been a noticeable change in the view of managing employees by strict antiquated guidelines and transitioning to fostering inspirational leadership traits at all levels of supervision. Law enforcement has participated in this transition by recognizing the importance of leadership development within their profession.

“Leadership is the ability to influence people” (Fitch, 2014). This statement rings true because a good leader influences their employees to model behavior, influences employees to work towards organizational goals and influences staff to act as leaders themselves. Once it was believed that good leaders are born now a more accepted belief is that good leadership is a learned behavior. Increasing your knowledge can shape you into a better leader but the kind of education that will benefit you the most doesn’t result in a degree. Focusing specifically on leadership training will benefit your development as a leader (Business Training Media, n.d.). An increasing amount of law enforcement agencies now recognize the importance of offering their supervisors at all levels of leadership training to improve their job satisfaction and job performance. Some agencies even mandate this training for their supervisors. With the widely accepted view that leadership training is crucial to the formation of good leaders it is reasonable to think that this type of education should be used as a minimum requirement for choosing law enforcement leaders over a degree obtained through traditional universities (Schneider & Cofrin, n.d.).

While no research found offers a definitive answer on whether it is formal education or specialized skills and work experience that will prepare someone to be successful in a command staff position of a law enforcement agency, it does show the benefits of both. The information reviewed supports the idea that a leader possessing both education and experience would have the most ease in obtaining a senior leadership position in a law enforcement agency. However, it is not conclusive in proving that these are both needed to be competent and to excel in these types of positions. Due to mandatory degree requirements, in the majority of law enforcement agencies, many aspiring to become a leader in an agency have been obligated to fulfill the requirement just to be considered. The question is do these degree requirements prevent agencies from acquiring quality leaders who do not pursue formal education.

## **Methods**

The purpose of this research was to examine if the practice of requiring an advanced degree for placement into senior management positions of law enforcement agencies is enabling the best leaders to attain these positions or should a greater

consideration be given to the experience and individual skills of candidate applying for promotion.

The data was obtained with an electronic survey that was submitted via email to thirty-five law enforcement professionals from thirty-four law enforcement agencies across the state of Florida. This survey was sent to a supervisor from each agency that currently holds the rank of Captain or above and to one administrator of a program responsible for training those in command staff positions. The questions were designed to evaluate the participants perspective on hiring practices for positions in senior management within law enforcement divisions. These questions asked the participants what qualifications in the areas of education levels and work experience that they believe to hold the most importance when evaluating a candidate for placement into the leadership of their agency.

Information about the participants education levels and years of experience were gathered to discover if there was a correlation between their own qualifications and the qualities that they would seek in a possible candidate for a leadership role of a law enforcement agency. There were questions posed regarding the participants age and gender to examine if there was a significant difference in position amongst these identifiers.

The survey was delivered to each participant electronically to assist in reaching all identified participants and ease in the transfer of the information. The survey was disseminated using the online data collector, SurveyMonkey. The survey was anonymous to alleviate any hesitation by the participant in providing truthful responses. The participants chosen have obtained the positions in their agencies that are referenced in this study which adds strength to the data gathered. The participants reluctance to provide genuine responses for fear of contradiction to current policy or practices at their own agencies is an acknowledged weakness in the data collected.

## **Results**

Survey questions were sent to thirty-five law enforcement professionals representing 34 different agencies across the state of Florida. These agencies have an active officer count ranging from 91 to 325. A representative from the following agencies was sent a survey:

- Alachua County Corrections
- Bay County Sheriffs
- Blackwater Corrections
- Brevard County Sheriffs
- Boca Raton Police
- Cape Coral Police
- Charlotte County Sheriffs
- Citrus County Sheriffs
- Clay County Sheriffs
- Clearwater Police
- Collier County Sheriffs

- Coral Gables Police
- Coral Springs Police
- Daytona Beach Police
- Escambia County Corrections
- Florida Department of Financial Services
- Florida Department of Law Enforcement ( Senior Leadership Program)
- Fort Myers Police
- Gainesville Police
- Hernando County Sheriffs
- Hialeah Police
- Lake County Sheriffs
- Lakeland Police
- Leon County Sheriffs
- Miami Gardens Police
- Miramar Police
- Osceola County Corrections
- Pasco County Sheriffs
- Pembroke Pines Police
- Polk County Corrections
- Port St. Lucie Police
- St. Lucie County Sheriffs
- Volusia County Corrections
- West Palm Beach Police

A total of 35 surveys were sent out and there were 12 surveys completed, which is a return rate of 34%. The first 6 questions of the survey gather biographical information about the person completing the survey.

Of the 12 respondents 50% were between the ages of 45-54 years of age, 42% were between the ages of 55-64 years of age, and 8% were between the ages of 35-44 years of age.

75% of the respondents were male and 25% were female.

The length of service in law enforcement of the respondents was 8% serving 16-20 years, 8% serving 21-25 years and 83% serving 25 years or more.

The participants were asked their rank to ensure that they fit within the parameters of Command Staff as defined by this study and all respondents held the rank of Captain or above at their respective agencies.

Each law enforcement professional was asked to disclose their highest level of education. 16% of the respondents possessed a high school diploma or trade certificate, 42% of the respondents possessed a Bachelor's degree and 42% of the respondents possessed a Master's degree.

When the respondents were asked their reasons for obtaining an advanced degree, 33% stated that they obtained an advanced degree to be eligible for promotion or hire to a higher rank. 25% of the respondents stated that personal growth was their motivation for obtaining an advanced degree and 42% of the participants did not possess an advanced degree.

The next set of questions dealt with the current promotional/hiring practices for command staff positions of the agencies represented, the opinions of the participants regarding these practices, and the particular skills that they feel benefit a person in a command staff position.

When the participants were asked if they believed that there should be a requirement to possess an advanced degree to attain a command staff position 67% answered yes and 33% replied no.

When they were asked if comparable work experience should be expected in lieu of an advanced degree, 83% replied yes and 17% answered no.

The participants were asked to choose the skills that they believe have benefitted them the most in the course of their duties as a command staff member. 67% of the respondents stated that skills gained through work experience have been the most benefit to them, 17% of the respondents stated that skills gained through vocational training have been of the most benefit to them, and 17% of the respondents expressed that skills gained through formal education have benefitted them the most.

Most of the persons in a command staff position of a law enforcement agency are involved in the promotional procedures. Therefore, the participants were asked if they had ever experienced a candidate that they believed would make a successful member of the command staff be disqualified for a lack of formal education. 58% of the participants stated yes, they had seen this occur and 42% of the participants stated, no they had not seen this occur.

The respondents were asked if they had ever seen a candidate for a command staff position that they believed would be an asset to the team be disqualified due to a lack of work experience and the answers were split evenly amongst all the responses with 50% seeing an applicant disqualified for this reason and 50% not having seen an applicant disqualified for this reason.

Next, the respondents were asked questions in regards to their peers in command staff positions and their skill sets. Participants were asked if a new member of command staff is performing poorly, what do they believe is the most likely cause out of the choices provided and 75% believed that lack of work experience was the most likely cause, 17% believed that a lack of moral character was most likely the cause, 8% believed that lack of education was the most likely cause and 0% believed that a lack of vocational training would be the cause of poor performance.

Respondents were asked to choose which skills that they believed had benefitted their peers the most in performing the duties of a command staff position and 92% stated that they believed skills gained through work experience were of the most benefit and 17% believed that skills gained through formal education were of the most benefit.

Lastly, the participants were given a hypothetical scenario where there were two candidates applying for promotion/hire to a command staff position and these candidates were equally qualified in all areas except for two. One candidate had more formal education with less work experience and the other candidate had more work experience with less formal education. The participants were asked to choose a candidate for promotion/hire to a command staff position. 83% of the respondents stated they would choose the candidate with more work experience and 17% of the respondents stated that they would choose the candidate with more formal education.



## Discussion

This research paper was designed to examine the practice of law enforcement agencies mandating an advanced degree for a candidate to obtain a command staff position. Government studies have shown that law enforcement agencies should mirror the societies that they serve, so law enforcement agencies followed the practices of many private corporations in requiring advanced degrees for more and more positions. Independent research reviewed showed that there has been a recent shift in the private sector to move away from mandatory formal education requirements to evaluating the individual skill set of each applicant. Is it time for law enforcement agencies to broaden their requirements for leadership positions and add more credence to a candidate's work experience or specialized training? The leadership of any entity, whether it be a private business or a government agency, can shape the direction and effectiveness of that organization. Therefore, it would behoove an agency that is concerned with maintaining a strong command staff to consistently evaluate their hiring and promotional practices.

The results of this survey verified that all participants currently hold a rank of Captain or above in their agency, which is the defined parameter to be a command staff member for the purposes of this research. The target participants for this study are command staff members with extensive careers in law enforcement, which the data confirmed that all respondents having sixteen or more years of service in the field. There were many reasons for surveying this specific group of individuals such as their vast experience in law enforcement, they have attained the leadership role for their agencies that is being examined and they have first-hand knowledge of the promotional practices to command staff positions. Existing research that was reviewed focused on educational requirements for the field of law enforcement as a whole or employment opportunities in private business. There was little research found regarding this specific group of professionals working in the command staff of law enforcement agencies.

This study is examining the area of work experience and of formal education in law enforcement leadership. The results confirmed that three quarters of the respondents did possess an advanced degree and a third of those possessing a degree cited the reason for obtaining that degree was eligibility for promotion/hire to a higher rank in their profession. A question should have been included in the study that asked these participants if mandatory education requirements for promotion did not exist, would they still have pursued an advanced degree. Qualifying for promotion is not the only reason that a command staff member would obtain an advanced degree as one third of the respondents expressed personal growth as their motivation for continuing their formal education. This information correlates with the independent research reviewed where law enforcement agencies and government studies express the necessity of college educated police forces. However, the actual practice of requiring an advanced degree at the officer level is rarely done due to the difficulty in recruitment for the profession. With the long hours and consistent stress of a law enforcement career, officers have to find the time and money to pursue an advanced degree in order to progress through the ranks. The majority of the survey participants stated that their agencies did have a degree requirement to obtain a command staff position and over half of respondents stated that they believed that there should be an advanced degree requirement for these positions. The message from law enforcement agencies seems to be clear, that they want their

supervisors to pursue an advanced degree; but the question is why? Especially when independent research reviewed and data collected from this survey suggest that other skills may benefit a leader more significantly.

While half of the command staff members surveyed expressed their belief that a degree requirement should be in place for promotion to a leadership role of an agency, almost all of them expressed that extensive work experience should be considered in lieu of an advanced degree. This was further reinforced when these professionals stated that the skillset gained through work experience had benefited themselves and their peers the most in the performance of their duties as a command staff member. They noted the most common reason for the failure of a command staff member to be a lack of work experience. Independent research reviewed showed that some major companies with vast workforces are moving away from degree requirements and private sector employers state that employees who do not have work experience but have a degree often struggle to navigate the workplace. When survey participants were given a choice between hiring a candidate for a command staff position with more formal education and less work experience or a candidate with more work experience and less formal education, three quarters of them chose the candidate with more work experience.

### **Recommendations**

All employers should review their minimum job requirements in the areas of education and experience. This is even more important for law enforcement agencies due to the unique nature of the profession. Hiring or promotional practices should strongly evaluate the kind of skills that they want a candidate to possess. The arbitrary belief that the possession of a degree automatically makes a person a superior choice for hire or promotion should be discontinued. Each applicant for hire or promotion should be evaluated on their own unique skill set. A greater weight should be given to the work experience of an individual. Many law enforcement agencies have educational requirements for promotion to higher ranks but there should be more extensive work experience requirements for supervisory positions. In place of traditional education requirements there should be a stronger emphasis on leadership training to qualify for higher level positions, such as the command staff of a law enforcement agency.

If law enforcement agencies want to continue the practice of requiring an advanced degree to obtain high level positions, there should be better practices in place to assist their employees in obtaining these degrees. Law enforcement professionals are not the highest paid employees. If agencies offered more extensive tuition assistance programs and more salary incentives for continuing education, it could offset the financial strain that is experienced by their officers when attempting to obtain a degree. The law enforcement profession comes with long strenuous work hours and a consistent struggle to balance work and home life demands on their time. Agencies could assist their officers by offering reduced work assignments or allowing staff to attend classes on duty so that it would be more feasible for them to complete their college education.

In conclusion, the practice of requiring an advanced degree for a command staff position may be hindering law enforcement agencies from promoting the best candidates for these leadership roles. Extensive work experience in the field and the dedication of

many years of service, can shape an individual into a strong influential leader of an agency that should be able to compete for command staff positions as equally as their peers with advanced formal education.

Captain Shannon McBride began her career with the Volusia County Division of Correction in 1999. She has worked as an officer in all areas of the institution and in high liability areas such as Intake and Control. In 2007, Shannon was promoted to Sergeant and supervised Intake and Booking, Maximum Security, Mental Health Housing, Inmate worker and the female populations. She was promoted to Lieutenant supervising both day and night shifts. Shannon also had many different responsibilities in each position to include being the liaison for the court systems, extraditions and other arresting agencies. She has had the opportunity to work on several committees reviewing policies and employee relations. Shannon was promoted to Captain in 2019 and was charged with supervising both dayshifts within the institution. She currently is the Operations Captain for the Volusia County Correctional Facility. Shannon is a graduate of the Florida Leadership Academy Class 34.

## References

Associated Press, CBS News. (2017, January 13). Workers with no college degree fall further behind than ever. *CBSnews.com*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.cbsnews.com/news/workers-with-no-college-degree-fall-further-behind-than-ever/>

Bidwell, A. (2014, May 2). Vocational high schools: Career path or kiss of death? *U.S. News & World Report*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.usnews.com/news/articles/2014/05/02/the-return-of-vocational-high-schools-more-options-or-the-kiss-of-death>

Bing Dictionary. (2020). Definition of Education. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.bing.com/search?q=definition+of+education&form=QBLH&sp=-1&ghc=1&pq=definition+of+educatio&sc=8-22&qsn=&sk=&cvid=B86FD50EFC404CB39D108AEBEC6A9545>

Bing Dictionary. (2020). Definition of Experience. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.bing.com/search?q=definition%20of%20expierece&qsn=&form=QBRE&sp=-1&pq=definition%20of%20expierece&sc=8-24&sk=&cvid=B97181D72AE44D0FA727185793F52354>

- Business Training Media. (n.d.). Leadership: What makes a good leader. *Business Training Media.com*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.businesstrainingmedia.com/article-leaders.php>
- Carnevale, A. Strohl, J. & Melton, M. (2008). *What's it worth? The economic value of college majors*. Retrieved from The Economic Value of College Majors, Georgetown University. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED524305.pdf>
- Day, J. C. & Newburger, E.C. (2002, July). *The big payoff: Education attainment and synthetic estimates of work life earnings*. Bureau of the Census (DOC), Washington, DC. Economics and Statistics Administration.
- Dinkelspiel, F. (2010, January 27). Remembering August Vollmer, the Berkeley police chief who created modern policing. *Berkeleyside.com*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.berkeleyside.com/2010/01/27/remembering-august-vollmer-the-berkeley-police-chief-who-created-modern-policing>
- Einstein, A. (n.d.). Albert Einstein quotes and facts. *EasyBib.com*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.easybib.com/guides/quotes-facts-stats/albert-einstein/>
- Fitch, B. D. (2014, August). Ten leadership myths debunked. *The Police Chief*. Retrieved from: <https://www.policechiefmagazine.org/ten-leadership-myths-debunked-2/>
- Goff, K. (2017, April 14). Are college educated police safer? *The Daily Beast.com*. Retrieved from: <https://www.thedailybeast.com/are-college-educated-police-safer>
- Ha, J. (n.d.). Education vs. experience: The debate. *Reliable Planet.com*. Retrieved from: <https://www.reliableplant.com/Read/11307/education-vs-experience>
- Hess, F.M. & Addison, G. (2018, August 29). Apple, Google, et al. Strike a blow against the college cartel. *National Review.com*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.nationalreview.com/2018/08/employers-stop-requiring-college-degrees-that-arent-needed/>
- Reddy, C. (n.d.) Work experience vs education: Which is better? *Wisestep.com*. Retrieved from <https://content.wisestep.com/work-experience-vs-education-debate-better/>
- Schafer, J.A. (2008, July). Effective police leadership: Experiences and perspectives of law enforcement leaders. *FBI Law Enforcement Bulletin*, 77(7), 13-19.
- Schneider, M.P. & Cofrin A.E. (n.d.). Where will tomorrow's law enforcement leaders come from? *Police Chief Magazine*. Retrieved from:  
<https://www.policechiefmagazine.org/where-will-tomorrows-law-enforcement-leaders-come-from/?ref=e5c69a412a3afd05181d77b233cf8663>

Torpey, E. (2018). Employment outlook for bachelor's level occupations. Career Outlook: U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. Current Population Reports.

U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ). (2011). Local Police Departments, 2007. *Office of Justice Programs, Bureau of Justice Statistics (BJS)*. NCJ 231174. Retrieved from: <https://www.bjs.gov/content/pub/pdf/lpd07.pdf>

## Appendix A

### Command Staff Survey

What is your age ?

- 25 – 34
- 35 – 44
- 45 – 54
- 55 – 64
- 65+

What is your gender ?

- Male
- Female

What rank to you hold currently? \_\_\_\_\_

How many years have you worked in law enforcement?

- 5 – 10 years
- 11 – 15 years
- 16 – 20 years
- 21 – 25 years
- 26 – 30 years
- 31+ years

What is your highest level of formal education?

- High school diploma or equivalent
- Associates degree
- Bachelor's degree
- Master's degree
- Doctorate

If you have an advanced degree, what was your motivation for attaining this degree?

- Eligibility for promotion/hire to an advanced position
- Secondary employment opportunities
- Personal growth
- I do not have an advanced degree
- Other (please specify)

Does your agency have a mandatory degree requirement for promotion/hire to a Command Staff position?

- No
- Yes
- If yes, what is that requirement \_\_\_\_\_

Does your agency have a minimum work experience requirement for promotion/hire to a Command Staff position?

- No
- Yes
- If yes, what is that requirement \_\_\_\_\_

Do you believe that there should be a minimum degree requirement when evaluating a candidate for promotion/hire to a Command Staff position?

- Yes
- No

Do you believe that comparable work experience in lieu of an advanced degree should be allowed when evaluating a candidate for promotion/hire to a Command Staff position?

- Yes
- No

Select one skill that you believe has benefited you the most while performing the duties of your current position?

- Skills gained through formal education
- Skills gained through vocational training e.g. leadership, interpersonal communication
- Skills gained through work experience

Have you ever had a candidate, who you believed would be an asset in a Command Staff position, be disqualified for a lack of formal education?

- No
- Yes

Have you ever had a candidate, who you believed would be an asset in a Command Staff position, be disqualified for a lack of work experience?

- No
- Yes

When a new member in a Command Staff position is performing poorly, what do you believe has been the cause?

- Lack of formal education
- Lack of work experience
- Lack of vocational training
- Lack of morale character
- Other \_\_\_\_\_

What skills do you believe have benefited your peers in their Command Staff positions the most?

- Skills gained through formal education
- Skills gained through vocational training
- Skills gained through work experience

If two candidates for promotion/hire to a Command Staff position were equally qualified along all fronts except one had more education with less experience and the other had more work experience and less education, which would you choose ?

- The candidate with more formal education and less work experience
- The candidate with more work experience and less formal education